The Online Journal of New Horizons in Education

Message from the Editor-in-Chief

Hello from TOJNED

TOJNED welcomes you. TOJNED looks for academic articles on the issues of education science and may address assessment, attitudes, beliefs, curriculum, equity, research, translating research into practice, learning theory, alternative conceptions, socio-cultural issues, special populations, and integration of subjects. The articles should discuss the perspectives of students, teachers, school administrators and communities. TOJNED contributes to the development of both theory and practice in the field of education science. TOJNED accepts academically robust papers, topical articles and case studies that contribute to the area of research in education science.

The aim of TOJNED is to help students, teachers, school administrators and communities better understand the new developments about teacher education. Submitted articles should be original, unpublished, and not in consideration for publication elsewhere at the time of submission to TOJNED. TOJNED provides perspectives on topics relevant to the study, implementation, and management of learning with technology.

I am always honored to be the editor in chief of TOJNED. Many persons gave their valuable contributions for this issue.

TOJNED will organize the INTE-2022 (www.int-e.net) in July, 2022 at ARUCAD University.

Call for Papers

TOJNED invites article contributions. Submitted articles should be about all aspects of teacher education and may address assessment, attitudes, beliefs, curriculum, equity, research, translating research into practice, learning theory, alternative conceptions, socio-cultural issues, special populations, and integration of subjects. The articles should also discuss the perspectives of students, teachers, school administrators and communities.

The articles should be original, unpublished, and not in consideration for publication elsewhere at the time of submission to TOJNED.

For any suggestions and comments on the international online journal TOJNED, please do not hesitate to contact with us.

April 01, 2022

Editor,
Prof. Dr. Aytekin İŞMAN
Sakarya University

Editorial Board

Table Of Contents

A LONGITUDINAL STUDY ON THE OPINIONS OF SUPERVISOR AND TEACHERS ON EDUCATIONAL SUPERVISION IN TRNC

Lütfiye FEDAİ
North Cyprus National Education Supervision Chief Inspector, Evaluation and Steering Committee
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4941-8590
lutfiye_fedai@hotmail.com

ABSTRACT
Supervision determines, evaluates and develops how the activities carried out in the learning and teaching process within the education system take place, progress and whether these activities serve the expected purposes. The aim of this research is to determine the opinions of the auditors on the subject of auditing in the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus. The research was conducted on the basis of the case study technique model, which is one of the qualitative research methods. In line with this purpose, as a continuation of the study carried out by the researcher in 2012, data were collected with semi-structured interview technique in 2021 and the obtained data were analyzed by content analysis method. The study group of the research consists of 19 supervisors and 15 teachers determined by the purposeful sampling technique. As a result of the research, it was determined that the opinions of the supervisors and teachers showed parallelism in line with the obtained data. However, it was determined that the teachers who participated in the research in 2021 had a more positive view of the supervisor and supervision than the teachers who participated in the research in 2012.
Keywords: Supervision, supervisor, teacher, TRNC

Introduction

In the education system, the way in which the activities that emerge in the teaching and learning process are carried out and realized, and whether these activities serve the expected purposes or not are evaluated by inspection. Thanks to the audit activities, possible problems can be prevented and eliminated in the process (Kurum and Çınkır, 2017). Observing the activities of the institution personnel, detecting the deficiencies, ensuring that the necessary studies are carried out to eliminate the deficiencies and introducing the innovations are one of the functions of the audit (Taymaz, 2013).

In the 21st century, all countries are reviewing their education systems in accordance with the spirit of this century and aiming to train more students in the long run. In this case, the school is accepted as the only place where the necessary manpower can be trained. The education provided by these schools is seen as a worldwide problem and a source of solutions. Every country in the world organizes its own education system, taking into account its unique characteristics. For this reason, developed countries have developed many different educational supervision models to control the education system. In addition, when we look at developed countries, the most striking feature is that local government control is more effective (Aydoğmuş and Çiçek Sağlam, 2016).

The importance of this research stems from the fact that it will contribute to the implementation of these change processes more effectively and efficiently through questions from the supervisor's point of view. With this study, educational supervisors' perspectives on the supervision process will be clearly revealed. Therefore, it is expected that the study will contribute to the solution of problems related to educational supervision.

Educational Supervision and Purpose

Education is a process of vitality, continuous improvement and progress. It can be said that this process cannot be carried out uncontrollably. According to Altunya (2014), auditing tries to determine to what extent the organization meets the success criteria. As Aydın (2011) said, the success criterion of educational organizations is their goals. They were established to achieve these goals. Schools, which are the main body of an educational organization, should check their inputs, processes and outputs according to certain procedures and review the results in order to determine to what extent they achieve their goals.

Educational supervision is the process of involving teachers in the educational environment to improve teaching and increase student success. In this case, educational supervision can be defined as a control and improvement process (Gündüz, 2012). According to Aslan (2015), controlling the process alone is not enough. Audit activities should also be included in the process. Educational supervision without teaching activities is still incomplete.

It is stated that the main purpose of educational supervision in achieving these general goals is to determine the degree of realization of the goals of the organization, to take the necessary measures to get better results and to improve the process (Aydın, 2016). Bahçivan, Bayraktutan, Bilbay, Çakırer, and Toprakçı (2010) state that organizations should be audited to achieve goals. Every organization that cannot be controlled deviates from its

own goals, and when it is considered at a higher level, it also deviates its own superior organization from its goals. Therefore, it can be stated that the objectives of realistic educational supervision are a cyclical process that affects the continuity of both education and educational supervision.

Supervisor Duties and Competences

While evaluating the course of the inspector, teacher and learning environment, the level of proficiency, the management of the organization when the organization is reviewed, and being the subject of a crime in the investigation are important (Erkılıç & Dilbaz, 2015). Competence expected from supervisors is as follows: humanistic quality; In order to establish a healthy relationship between the auditors and the auditees, the auditors must have human qualities such as respect, tolerance, fairness, encouraging the audited and mutual trust. Technical ability: In order for auditors to perform effective audits, auditors must be experts in how they use audits and which tools, methods and techniques. Management ability; Management ability is very important in terms of audit quality. These capabilities include authoring, documentation, project management and resource management. Planning the audit process, setting goals, realizing these goals, monitoring and evaluation are issues related to project management.

Methodology

This research, which examines the opinions of teachers and supervisors on the subject of supervision in the TRNC, is a longitudinal content analysis research. The findings obtained in the analysis of the data collected in 2012 were organized as a separate research article (Fedai, 2012).

The research is a qualitative research case study. Case studies are based on "how" and "why" questions and allow a more in-depth examination of events or events beyond the control of researchers (Yıldırım and Şimşek 2013). A case study is defined as a methodological approach that involves using multiple data collections to conduct an in-depth analysis of the system to gather system information on how and how the constrained system works (Chmiliar, 2010).

Research data were collected with semi-structured interview questions. Interview forms were created based on the literature review and expert opinion. In this study, the participants were determined by taking typical case sampling, which is one of the purposive sampling methods. Glesne (2012) stated that typical situation sampling can be used in studies aiming to identify situations that occur under normal conditions. In this context, 19 supervisors and 15 teachers, who were determined according to the principle of voluntariness, were included in the study. Since the identity of the participants was kept confidential in the study, the names of the participants were not real names, but code names such as S1, S2, S3 for the supervisors, and T1, T2, and T3 for the teachers were used.

Findings

In the research, the distribution of the findings obtained in line with the answers of the participants was examined under two headings: the opinions of the supervisor and the teacher. The data obtained in 2021 are given in comparison with the data in 2012. The opinions of the supervisors are shown in Table 1, and the opinions of the teachers are shown in Table 2. Then, participant opinions about the questions were given.

Table 1. Opinions of supervisors about supervision

Questions	2021						2012					
	Yes		No		Partially		Yes		No		Partially	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
A1. Do you know enough about the content of the audit system and do you think it is transparent?	5	26	7	37	7	37	3	20	5	33	7	47
A2. Do you adequately inform the teachers you are responsible for supervising about what kind of supervision criteria/criteria you will apply?	14	74	1	5	4	21	13	86	1	7	1	7
B1. Do you believe that you have the necessary equipment for auditing?	9	47	1	5	9	47	15	100				
B2. Do you have enough time to evaluate teachers?	3	16	5	26	10	53	4	27	9	60	2	13
B3. Do you contribute to the professional development of the teachers you are responsible for?	11	58	2	11	6	31	12	80	2	13	1	7
B4. After observing the teacher's lesson, can you share your evaluations about the lesson?	17	89			1	5	15	100				

C1. Do you think that teachers have sufficient equipment in terms of field and professional knowledge?	8	42	1	5	10	53						
C2. When you consider the generality of the teachers you observed during the inspection, do you think the teachers in the TRNC exhibit the required field knowledge, professional knowledge and personal characteristics?	5	26	1	5	13	69	1	7	1	13	2	20
D1. Do you think that the inspection criteria you apply exactly measure the performance of teachers?	1	5	10	53	8	42	2	13	7	47	6	40
D2. Would you like to abandon the system currently being implemented in supervision and move to the targeted multiple performance system (supervisor, school principal, group, student, parent)?	10	53	2	11	7	37	14	93			1	7
D3. Do you find the teachers' interest in supervision positive?	8	42	3	16	8	42	11	74	2	14	2	14

In the light of the data obtained from the supervisors in 2021; Participants "Do you know enough about the content of the audit system and do you think it is transparent?" They answered yes (n5), no (n7), partially (n7) to the question. The opinions of the participants are as follows;

"I believe I know enough, but I also believe it's too transparent." S3

"The content of the audit system is composed of contemporary democratic criteria, but it is not transparent. Because teachers partially know the criteria." S9

"I know the content of the audit system theoretically, but I do not find it adequate and transparent as I see differences in practice and there is confidentiality in investigations." S13

"Do you adequately inform the teachers you are responsible for supervising about what kind of supervision criteria/criteria you will apply?" The participants answered yes (n14), no (n1), partially (n4) to the question. Participant statements are as follows;

"I report transparently to the teachers I supervise. I do not find some of the criteria determined by the MDDYK board to be scientifically realistic and open to guidance. I do not find it ethical for supervisors to supervise teachers outside their domain. In addition, I find it inconvenient in terms of modern auditing that they score the information included in the criteria. I inform my teachers about each audit criterion in detail. In addition, I think that the criteria determined by the board are not only difficult to fulfill with the existing facilities, but also insufficient." S6

"The audit criteria were given to us in a clear and transparent manner. I started applying the criteria. I would like to make more suggestions to prospective teachers about the subjects that I consider inadequate and to learn new suggestions." S10

"I show the teacher the current inspection criteria and explain what I expect. But I think the criteria should be renewed." S15

The opinions of the research participants regarding their belief that they have the necessary equipment for auditing are yes (n9), no (n1), partially (n9). The statements made by the participants are as follows;

"Considering the current conditions, yes, I agree, but if we think on a universal scale, we also need continuous development. Believing in the importance and necessity of the work you do and being willing to do this job with love before everything, even before the equipment, are the elements that must be possessed before having the equipment. Besides, I think that both our domestic and international trainings and my experience of more than 10 years are more than enough for this." S1

"I can say that I am partial to auditing. Because the board does not have a mission and vision for the future. Although the MDDYK has an unenforceable law, it does not have regulations regarding the law. While the MDDYK law specifies the duties that inspectors must perform, since there is no regulation on how these duties will be fulfilled, I have no concerns or concerns about having the equipment related to the inspection, but there is no ground to use the equipment. In short, the fact that the inspectors are equipped does not make much sense. In addition, training on auditing is insufficient and does not meet the needs of inspectors." S5

"I don't feel that good enough." S14

The question asked within the scope of the research is "Do you have enough time to evaluate the teachers?" While one of the participants left the question unanswered, the distribution of the answers given by the other participants is as follows. Yes (n3), no (n5), partially (n10). The opinions expressed by the participants;

"It is not a sufficient control to be able to tell after a few observations whether a teacher is efficient or not" S8

"I haven't fully evaluated a teacher yet, but I don't think time is ever enough because I believe a process is necessary to share assessment results and provide guidance." S13

"Partly because there is a shortage of vehicles. And the preliminary research and investigation tasks are too many" S19

"Do you contribute to the professional development of the teachers you are responsible for?" The participants answered yes (n11), no (n2), partially (n6) to the question. Opinions of the participants;

"Definitely, as I can observe this in the process, I hear it a lot from the teachers themselves. Moreover, it is very pleasing to see a contribution that I have made to a teacher in another teacher of another school, that it is not limited to one person, but that good and valuable things are multiplied by sharing." S2

"This is our main purpose, but few and infrequent visits make it difficult for us to make the necessary impact" S7

"Partly because school visits are limited" S12

The participants answered yes (n17) and partially (n1) to the question whether they shared their evaluations about how the teacher gave a lesson after watching the lesson with the teachers. One of the participants did not answer the question. The statements made by the participants are as follows;

"Telling the teacher about his good points as well as his shortcomings is very useful for motivating our teacher" S3

"Yes, so that their performance can be more efficient" S16

"Guidance and transparency are at the forefront for us. An inspector who is not open and fair cannot succeed." S18

"Do you think that the teachers are adequately equipped in terms of field and professional knowledge?" The participants answered yes (n8), no (n1), partially (n10) to the question. The statements of the participants are as follows;

"Each teacher is different. In addition, each teacher's potential for self-development and progress is different. Teachers need to be trained one-on-one on professional issues. It is not possible to give precise information on this matter." S5

"They focus on grammar, and they are weak in developing students' reading, comprehension, analysis and synthesis skills. There are deficiencies in professional knowledge rather than field knowledge." S7

"The field and profession knowledge of all my prospective teachers I observed was very good" S10

When the research participants think about the general teachers they observed during the inspection, the distribution of the opinions of the teachers in the TRNC on displaying the required field knowledge, professional knowledge and personal characteristics is yes (n5), no (n1), partially (n13). The opinions of the participants;

"Since the teachers do not include student-centered teaching and cooperative group work in the educational processes, they only do teacher-centered teaching, so they do not realize active learning of students, prevent them from learning to learn and cannot make them love school." S9

"It has been observed that our visits to schools, evaluations and feedbacks have been noticed and they have made efforts in this direction." S12

"Teachers are confused when they start their profession and they cannot get sincere help from supervisors, teachers or administrators. They need guidance in all areas. Teachers expect guidance from supervisors on every subject." S17

"Do you think that the inspection criteria you apply measure the performance of teachers exactly?" Most of the participants answered no to the question. The distribution of the answers is yes (n1), no (n10), partially (n8). Statements made;

"It would be much better if the criteria were developed in parallel, especially in order to evaluate the applications of branch teachers in different fields. Even if what you expect from a pre-school teacher and what we expect from a physical education teacher or classroom teacher are basically the same, there are many differences, and I think that their reflection on the criteria will make a difference in positive understanding." S1

"Inspection criteria are in the criteria to measure teachers. However, the opportunities to reveal the potential of teachers are insufficient. The lack of technical facilities in the school and insufficient guidance for the development of teachers prevent them from fulfilling the criteria. Despite this, teachers can show improvement. If a teacher is to be evaluated for a contribution he has made in the school, the school administration needs to help this issue." S6

"Due to insufficient statute and law" S19

"Would you like to abandon the current system in auditing and move to the targeted multiple performance system (supervisor, manager, group, student, parent)?" The participants answered yes (n10), no (n2), partially (n7) to the question. Participant statements are as follows;

"I don't think it would be fair to supervise on the student and parent side." S8

"I think this is the system that should be." S15

"I partially agree. In a multi-performance system, there is much to be done first. I don't think you can do it unbiased with your multiple performance. Our Ministry cannot find solutions to even simple issues." S17

The participants were yes (n8), no (n3), partially (n8) as to whether they had a positive interest in teachers' supervision. It is seen that the majority of the participants evaluated the teachers' interests positively. The opinions expressed are as follows;

"I think it's generally very positive. However, teachers who trust us to the end about supervision have concerns and prejudices that it is politics when it comes to preliminary research and inconclusive investigations." S2

"I don't have enough experience in this field yet. I can't make my real opinion on this because I haven't done much auditing." S14

"90% of them are positive" S18

Table 2. Opinions of teachers about supervision

Questions	2021						2012					
	Yes		No		Partially		Yes		No		Partially	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
A1. Do you believe that the auditors evaluate their performance transparently enough?	10	67	3	20	2	13	15	60	8	32	1	4
A2. Do the inspectors give you sufficient information about the criteria they will apply and what they expect from you?	8	54	2	13	5	33	15	60	10	40		
A3. How do you find the control system being implemented? Do you think it is transparent and scientific?	5	33	3	20	7	47	10	40	12	48	3	12
B1. Do you find the time spent by the supervisors to evaluate you enough?	10	67	5	33			12	48	13	52		

B2. Are there any contributions to the professional development of the supervisors (for example, making various teaching programs and providing necessary assistance for your planned work)?	9	60	4	27	1	6	15	60	9	36	1	4
B3. Do you believe that the supervisors have the necessary equipment to supervise you?	13	87			2	13	15	60	8	32	2	8
B4. Do the supervisors give you feedback about your lesson after observing your lesson?	15	100					21	84	1	4	1	4
C1. If you are not prepared when the supervisor comes to you to inspect, do you prepare immediately?	8	54	6	40	1	6	11	44	14	56		
C2. Do you get uncomfortable while the supervisor is observing your lecture?	1	6	12	80	2	13	23	92	2	8		
D1. Would you like to abandon the current system in supervision and move to the targeted multiple performance system (supervisor, school principal, group, student, and parent)?	6	40	7	47	2	13	11	44	12	48	1	4
D2. Do you find the teachers' interest in supervision positive?	6	40	2	13	7	47						
D3. Do you find the supervisor-teacher relations in the supervision system positive?	12	80			3	20	16	64	8	32	1	4

In line with the 2021 data, the opinions of the teachers participating in the research on the transparent evaluation of the supervisors' performance are yes (n10), no (n3), partially (n2). The statements made by the participants are as follows;

"I believe that supervisors evaluate them without being influenced by their emotional or closeness to the supervised person" T3

"No, due to lack of personnel" T11

"Do the supervisors give you enough information about the criteria they will apply to you and what they expect from you?" The participants answered yes (n8), no (n2), partially (n5). The opinions of the participants are as follows;

"In my first year as a responsible teacher, my supervisor has made it clear what he expects from me as a responsible teacher." T6

"Adequate information is provided, but not enough about feedback. Because you don't go often." T15

"How do you find the audit system being implemented? Do you think it is transparent and scientific?" The participants answered yes (n5), no (n3), partially (n7) to the question. Participant statements are as follows;

"Based on the advanced education systems around the world, unfortunately, it is obvious that our education system is behind. For this reason, our inspection system needs to be modernized, as it should be in many departments." T2

"The inspections are tried to be done scientifically, but there may be problems between the student groups and the teacher from time to time, and this can sometimes happen when the inspection is in the classroom." T12

"Do you find the time spent by the supervisors to evaluate you enough?" Most of the participants answered no to the question. The distribution of the answers is yes (n10) and no (n5). Statements made;

"I don't believe there is adequate assessment in just one lesson." T1

"No, because they do not have enough time because they are few in number" T13

Within the scope of the research, the teachers were asked "Do they contribute to the professional development of the supervisors (for example, making various teaching programs and providing necessary assistance for your planned work)?" While one of the participants left the question unanswered, the distribution of the answers given by the other participants is as follows. Yes (n9), no (n4), partially (n1). The opinions expressed by the participants;

"The presence of education-related programs and seminars offered to us by both our ministry and our supervisor is beneficial for us." T8

"Yes, necessary guidance is being made" T11

The distribution of the opinions of the research participant teachers regarding the beliefs of the supervisors that they have the necessary equipment when supervising themselves is yes (n13), and partially (n2). The opinions of the participants;

"I think the fact that the inspector has spent years in his profession is an indication that he has the necessary equipment." T5

"I believe that all of them are experts in their fields" T9

"Do the supervisors give you feedback on your lesson after observing your lesson?" All of the participants answered yes (n15) to the question. Participant statements are as follows;

"They encourage and improve me with good or bad reviews." T6

"There are always positive or negative returns." T3

The teachers participating in the research answered yes (n8), no (n6), partially (n1) to the question of whether they do not prepare immediately when the supervisor comes to inspect them. The statements made by the participants are as follows;

"I usually prefer to come to class ready. Unless an extraordinary situation develops. So I don't need any special preparation. Unless an unscheduled situation develops." T9

"Because I always come to my classes prepared, I never faced such a problem." T10

"Supervisor, are you uncomfortable watching your lecture?" Most of the teachers answered no to the question. The distribution of the answers is yes (n1), no (n12), partially (n2). Statements made;

"I don't bother with evaluation after I feel confident." T1

"No, because I am a teacher who has a good command of my branch and class" T14

The teachers who participated in the research said, "Do you want to abandon the current system in supervision and move to the targeted multiple performance system (supervisor, principal, group, student, parent)?" The participants answered yes (n6), no (n7), partially (n2) to the question. Participant statements are as follows;

"I think it would be more scientific for people with supervisory training to be supervisors. I believe that the perspectives of people who do not receive this training will change from person to person, and will not be guiding and reflect the truth." T5

"No. It is very difficult to do this right now." T12

"Do you find the teachers' interest in supervision positive?" directed to the participants. The distribution of the answers given to the question is yes (n6), no (n2), partially (n7). Participant opinions are as follows;

"Due to the problems in the system, teachers generally look at supervision positively, but do not look at the current supervision system positively." T2

"I don't think the old teachers cared much." T7

All of the participants gave a positive answer as to whether the teachers found the supervisor-teacher relations in the supervision system positive or not. Participants were yes (n12) and partially (n3). The opinions expressed are as follows;

"It depends on the supervisor and the teacher." T3

"I find it positive in my own way. Because both the new information I learn from my supervisor and it motivates me to improve myself." T8

Conclusion and Discussion

In this study, it is aimed to compare the opinions of supervisors and teachers about the supervision process with an interval of nine years. In the findings obtained within the scope of the research, the studies conducted by the inspectors in 2012 and 2021 on knowing the content of the inspection system and its transparency showed parallelism, and it was determined that the content of the inspection system was not fully known and they thought that it was not transparent. When a comparison is made on the basis of years, it has been determined that the majority of the teachers think that the inspection system is transparent, unlike the supervisors.

In line with the opinions of the participant supervisors and teachers, it was concluded that the supervisors adequately evaluated the teachers they would supervise about the supervision criteria and process. As a result of the data collected with an interval of nine years, it was concluded that the opinions of teachers and supervisors in this direction were the same.

Even though the inspectors participating in the research consider themselves sufficient in terms of having the necessary equipment, they emphasized that the development should continue in this area where continuous improvement is needed. All of the teachers participating in the research in 2021 expressed a parallel opinion with the supervisors in both years and expressed that the supervisors had sufficient equipment. On the other hand, although the majority of the teachers who participated in the study conducted in 2012 stated that they had sufficient equipment, it was determined that they were not sufficient or partially sufficient in this direction. In the light of these data, it was concluded that especially teachers' views on the competencies of supervisors developed positively.

In the questions asked about the inspection process, the inspectors stated that the inspection period was not sufficient and they had to conduct inspections in limited opportunities and time. Even if the time was limited, it was concluded that the majority of the participants' supervisors contributed to the development of the teachers they were responsible for. In the study conducted by Ozmen and Ozdemir (2009), it is necessary to eliminate the time and place limitations among the problems that primary education inspectors encounter in the supervision of institutions and teachers and the results they put forward regarding the solution of these problems. The supervisor's opinions show parallelism with the literature. On the other hand, while almost all of the teachers participating in the research in 2021 stated that the inspections allotted enough time for inspection, the teachers who participated in the study in 2012 stated that they had insufficient time.

The majority of the inspectors regarding the proficiency of teachers working in the TRNC in their field and profession information partially answered. In line with the answers of the supervisor participants, it was concluded that the teachers did not have sufficient field and professional knowledge. In addition, it has been determined that the applied supervision system does not fully measure the performance of teachers.

In both years of the research, the majority of the participating auditors expressed a positive opinion at the point of making changes in the audit system and switching to a multiple performance system. While some of the teachers expressed positive views on this subject, some of them expressed negative opinions. Another result obtained is that teachers have a positive perspective on supervision in line with the opinions of supervisors and teachers. In addition, it has been determined that the supervisor-teacher relations are positive in the teachers supervision system. While Akbaslı and Tunc (2019) concluded that teachers are comfortable and have a positive perspective during the audit, similar to the results of their research, Sapancı, Aslanargun, and Kılıc (2014) reveal that teachers are uncomfortable with these behaviors regarding the types of power that educational supervisors show during the supervision process.

References

Akbaşlı, S. ve Tunç, Z. (2019). İlkokul öğretmenlerinin müdürlerin ders denetimine ilişkin görüşlerinin değerlendirilmesi. *Erzincan Üniversitesi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 21(3), 75-92.

Altunya, N. (2014). *Türkiye'de dünden bugüne eğitim müfettişliği*. Ankara: Eğitimiş Kültür Yayınları.

Aslan, H. (2015). Eğitimde denetim ile ilgili kavramlar, denetimin tarihsel gelişimi. *Ondokuz Mayıs Üniversitesi Uzaktan Eğitim Merkezi*, 1, 1-14.

Aydın, M. (2011). *Çağdaş eğitim denetimi*. Ankara: Hatipoğlu Yayınevi.

Aydın, İ. (2016). *Öğretimde denetim*. Ankara: Pegem Akademi Yayıncılık.

Aydoğmuş, M. ve Çiçek Sağlam, A. (2016). Gelişmiş ve gelişmekte olan ülkelerin eğitim sistemlerinin denetim yapıları karşılaştırıldığında Türkiye eğitim sisteminin denetimi ne durumdadır. *Uşak Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi,* 9(1), 17-37.

Bahçivan, E. Bayraktutan, İ. Bilbay, A. Çakırer, İ. ve Toprakçı, E. (2011). Kuram ve uygulamada eğitim müfettişleri meslek etiği. *Educational Policy Analysis and Strategic Research*, 5(1), 14-23.

Chmiliar, l. (2010). Multiple-case designs. In A. J. Mills, G. Eurepas & E. Wiebe (Eds.), *Encyclopedia of case study research*, 582-583. USA: SAGE Publications.

Erkılıç, T.A. ve Dilbaz, E. (2015). Denetçi rol ve yeterlikleri bağlamında 1999, 2011 ve 2014 müfettişlik yönetmeliklerinin müfettiş yardımcısı atama ve yetiştirme anlayışlarının karşılaştırılması. *Eğitimde Nitel Araştırmalar Dergisi*, 3(2), 7-24.

Fedai, L. (2012). KKTC öğretim kurumlarinda görev yapan öğretmenlerin ve bakanlık denetmenlerinin KKTCde uygulanmakta olan denetim sistemine bakış açıları. IV. Uluslararası Türkiye Eğitim Araştırmaları Kongresi. 4-7 May, 2012 Yildiz Technical University İstanbul, Turkey.

Glesne, C. (2012). *Nitel Araştırmaya Giriş*. (A. Ersoy ve P. Yalçınoğlu, Çev.). Ankara: Anı Yayıncılık.

Gündüz, Y. (2012). Eğitim örgütlerinde denetimin gerekliliği: kuramsal bir çalışma. *Dumlupınar Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Dergisi*, 34, 1-6.

Kurum, G., & Çınkır, Ş. (2017). Cehennemde evlilik: Türkiye'de eğitim denetiminin birleştirilmesi üzerine maarif müfettişlerinin görüşleri. *Eğitim ve Bilim*, 42(192), 54-87.

Özmen, F. ve Özdemir T, Y, (2009) *İlköğretim Müfettişlerinin Kurum ve Öğretmen Denetiminde Karşılaştıkları Sorunlar ve Bu Sorunların Çözümüne İlişkin Öneriler*,1. Uluslararası Katılımlı Ulusal Eğitim Denetimi Sempozyumu, Ed. Ankara, İşkur Matbaacılık.

Sapancı, A., Aslanargun, E., ve Kılıç, A. (2014). Eğitim müfettişlerinin öğretmen denetiminde kullandıkları güç türleri. *Anadolu eğitim liderliği ve öğretim dergisi*, 2(2), 52-68.

Taymaz, H. (2013).*Teftiş*. Ankara: Pegem A.

Yıldırım A, Şimşek H. (2013). *Sosyal Bilimlerde Nitel Araştırma Yöntemleri*. (9. Baskı). Ankara: Seçkin Yayıncılık.

BENEFITS AND CHALLENGES OF INTEGRATING TECHNOLOGY INTO ENGLISH AS A SECOND LANGUAGE (ESL) COURSES

Germain Degardin
Southern Outreach Academic Research (SOAR) Policy and Evaluation Center, New Mexico State University
gdeg123@nmsu.edu

Gaspard Mucundanyi, Ph.D.
New Mexico Alliance for Minority Participation (New Mexico AMP), New Mexico State University
gaspard@nmsu.edu

ABSTRACT
Teaching English as a Second Language (ESL) presents challenges. The ESL students learn and adapt to a new language while struggling to make a transition from their native languages. The ESL teachers communicate in a new language that students are not yet familiar with, but want to master. However, integrating technology in the classroom is becoming a necessity. Technology can be a supporting tool that provides a new experience for ESL students to learn and master English. Through systematic review, this study points out the benefits and challenges of integrating technology into ESL courses from teachers' perspectives. The findings of this study may help the novice ESL teachers to integrate technology into the classrooms. In addition, the findings may encourage ESL teachers, school administrators, and researchers to find solutions to the challenges in this article and encourage more ESL teachers to integrate technology in the classroom.
Keywords: ESL Courses, ESL teachers, Integrating technology, English and Technology

INTRODUCTION

The expansion of digital technology in our daily lives over the past decades has naturally influenced our vision for education. Although digital technology tools have shown great potential and benefits in the classroom, its implementation has been slow, relatively ineffective, and not reflected through students' academic performance (Ahmadi, 2018). A common explanation for the slow change from traditional instruction to digital technology-driven instruction pertains to school-level limitations. Among these limitations, the lack of funding and resources, including access to available technology, are often the most represented (Ruggiero & Mong, 2015). However, teachers stated a strong need for training opportunities along with constant guidance and technical support that meets their subject and grade level needs. Furthermore, a large group of teachers seems eager to learn about the best implementation practices of digital tools in the classroom.

ESL teachers have started to incorporate technology into teaching, however their experiences are mixed: On one hand, there are opportunities that technology brings to the English classrooms. On the other hand, ESL teachers face challenges that discourage their interest in integrating technology in English courses. There are lessons to learn from ESL teachers who had used technology in their classrooms. Therefore, this article uses a systematic review to examine the challenges and benefits of integrating technology into ESL courses. This article focuses on the two research questions: a) What are the benefits of ESL teachers in integrating technology into the classrooms and b) What are the challenges of ESL teachers in integrating technology into the classrooms?

LITERATURE REVIEW
Technology in the classroom
Teachers' pedagogical philosophy, beliefs, and mindset about digital technology profoundly influence its implementation in the classroom regardless of its demonstrated potential and benefits. Up until recently, teachers represented the primary source of knowledge in the classroom and teachers may perceive digital technology as a threat to their authority (Collins & Halverson, 2009). However, the appearance of digital technology has progressively shifted our perception of knowledge and challenged teachers' legitimacy as an authoritative figure in the classroom. Teachers' pedagogical beliefs and teaching styles can influence the use of digital technology as pedagogical tools (Ruggiero & Mong, 2015; Pun, 2013). Teachers' perception and attitudes towards computers and digital technology itself is an essential factor of successfully implementing technology in the classroom (Ruggiero & Mong, 2015; Liu et al., 2014).

Adopting technology means changing on two distinct levels. First, adopting technology means changing the tools that teachers have been teaching with for a long time; second, it also means that teachers must rethink their positions in relation with the students as well as their function and legitimacy in the classroom. Despite the slow adaptation of digital technology in the classroom, its potential to revolutionize and reshape the current education system remains (Durbin, 2002). The benefits of integrating digital technology into the classrooms are multiple. Collins and Halverson (2009) explain how integrating technology in education can further help to address the

current change that we observe in our society. For instance, mediums of communication have significantly involved over the past two decades with the appearance of emails and social media (Featro & DiGregorio, 2016). Another benefit of teaching with digital technology is its potential to narrow and customize the content to the learners' needs.

Appropriate and well-thought instructions that combine technology and lecture have also seen positive results in terms of academic performance. Durbin (2002) reported that students who received technology-based instructions (such as slide shows) along with the use of webpage, which included online notes and instructions, performed significantly better than students who only received lectured-instructions. Nevertheless, the learning benefits of implementing digital technology in the classroom come first from teachers' decision on whether a given digital tool can meet the need of students on specific questions, concepts, or issues (Liu et al., 2014). Digital technology gives the ability to connect with people around the world at a faster pace and to a greater extent. Such ability can be transferred over to the classroom by creating a digital environment in which students can broaden their understanding of other cultures' practices and languages (Daniel et al., 2012; Pun, 2013).

Integrating technology in teaching English
The progress of technology has impacted ways of teaching English for in-service and pre-service teachers. Technology allows teachers to create a learning environment for students to learn English by doing (Pun, 2013). Technology also provides invaluable English educational resources that students can explore inside and outside of classrooms. Teachers are using technology to improve the English curriculum, communication among students, and sharing information (Sardegna & Dugartsyrenova, 2014; Morales & Rumenapp, 2017). As technology is becoming one of the twenty-first-century skills requirements, teachers need to incorporate technology in developing, designing, and teaching the English language.

Today's students live in the digital era and use technology regularly at home, schools, stores, transportation, and neighborhoods. Furthermore, technology has connected the world and enabled different ways of communicating through online translation, live videos, videos, audio, and text posting. English is becoming a global language in education and has created an opportunity for native and non-native English speakers to interact, exchange, and create knowledge. As Pun (2013) stated, "the use of multimedia technology in language teaching has created a favorable context for reforming and exploring English language teaching models in the new age" (p. 30). Therefore, integrating technology in teaching English is needed more than ever before. Ahmadi (2018) highlighted that technology "helps learners to develop thinking skills, makes learning and teaching become more student-centered, promotes learners' autonomy and helps them feel more confident, and increases learners' motivation to effectively learn a foreign language" (p. 122). Therefore, integrating technology in teaching English makes learning fun and engaging.

Even though the technology is a valuable tool to teach English language, teachers face two dominant challenges of incorporating technology in classrooms. First, English teachers lack proper training on how to use technology in teaching (Martinez-Alvarez et al., 2018). English teachers feel that it is important to teach with technology, but they do not know how. Second, teachers have limited financial resources that prevent them from having technological resources required in teaching English course topics. In addition to these challenges, teaching English to non-native English speakers is more complicated as non-native English speakers need extra support to acquire skills and knowledge of English native speakers.

Educators and teachers need to share their experiences of teaching English with technology to encourage and motivate non-native English speakers to learn and communicate effectively at the level of native English speakers. Using technology to teach ESL students goes beyond teaching the digital tools and the English language (Ahmadi, 2018; Collins & Halverson, 2009). It involves teaching the culture and values of native English Speakers, creating spaces for non-native English speakers to share their experiences, and being valuable members of the new community. Thus, technology in the English language creates a comfortable zone for English language learners to study and practice the language and overcome barriers of English communication and writing.

METHODOLOGY
This study used a systematic review to search peer-reviewed articles on using technology in teaching the English language. Two researchers in education, the authors of this article, collaborated on this systematic review. One author has a background in language learning and another author does research on technology in education. The authors focused their search on electronic databases, namely Google Scholar, ERIC, ResearchGate, Springer, Elsevier, Sage Pub, Wiley Library, and EBSCOhost.

The inclusion criteria included pre-service, in-service, ESL, bilingual teachers, and any type of technology, such as hardware and software. They limited the search on the peer-reviewed articles with the studies done in the United States. In addition, the authors considered only the articles with full text. They excluded the articles on online, blended, and distance education. The initial search provided 153 articles. Then, the authors limited the search on the peer-reviewed articles published between 2010 and 2020. The new search produced 43 articles. The authors read the articles individually to make sure that they met the inclusion criteria. They also met in multiple sessions to discuss their choice of selection. Finally, they agreed on the final list of eleven articles:

> Chang and Martínez-Roldán (2018)
> Daniel and Cowan (2012)
> Daniel et al. (2016)
> Featro and DiGregorio (2016)
> González-Carriedo and Harrell (2018)
> Graziano (2011)
> Liu et al. (2014)
> Martinez-Alvarez et al. (2018)
> Meskill et al. (2002)
> Morales and Rumenapp (2017)
> Sardegna and Dugartsyrenova (2014)

RESULTS
Benefits of integrating technology into ESL courses
For the benefits of using technology to teach English, the following themes emerged in analyzing eleven articles: collaboration among teachers and students, English content development, English learning growth, and differentiated instruction. First, teaching English with technology allowed English teachers to reflect on their teaching practice and to collaborate among themselves and the students. Meskill et al. (2002) discussed and compared the technology experiences of novice and experienced K-8 language and literacy (ESOL) and highlighted that building community among novice and experienced teachers was key to sharing experiences and learning from one another. In another study, Sardegna and Dugartsyrenova (2014) examined the experience of twenty-five pre-service foreign language teachers in preparing and teaching mini-lessons and giving feedback to students. The pre-service teachers pointed out that technology had created an opportunity for the students to have more interactions and created a community of learning. Other studies emphasized that technology helped the students to support each other and provided different ways of representing ideas to students (Morales & Rumenapp, 2017; Graziano, 2011).

Second, teaching English with technology improved content development. Students and teachers used technology to look for the supporting materials that engaged students to understand English content. Liu et al. (2014) stated that technology allowed K-12 students to access multimedia resources, dictionary translations, and English audio pronunciation. In another study, Daniel and Cowan (2012) concluded that bilingual teachers in K-12 who participated in the study supported the idea of using technology to improve the development of English content. Technology created a platform for teachers to connect, discuss, and share ideas on different strategies of developing and improving the content. Also, technology provided the learning resources in the native languages of English language learners (González-Carriedo & Harrell, 2018).

Third, teaching English with technology created an opportunity for deep learning. In their study, González-Carriedo and Harrell (2018) examined nine teachers in dual-language programs. They found that technology became a supporting tool for the students to engage more in learning linguistics. In another study, sixteen pre-service students who participated in the study pointed out that technology had positively changed the learning experiences of students and motivated them to learn English (Graziano, 2011). Other studies highlighted that technology was a powerful tool for students to improve and master English (Featro & DiGregorio, 2016; Daniel et al., 2016).

Finally, technology was a supporting tool for differentiated instruction, including students with different English levels and students with special needs. According to Liu et al. (2014), technology allowed English teachers to give various activities based on their level of English. Technology also made it easier for English language learners to focus on one activity while other students had different activities in the same classroom. In another study, Martinez-Alvarez et al. (2018) emphasized that technology was an essential tool for bilingual teachers who taught students with special needs to provide the required learning accommodations. Furthermore, technology could provide multi-modal instruction (Daniel et al., 2016) and multiculturalism (Chang & Martínez-Roldán, 2018).

The main challenges of ESL teachers in implementing technology
The systematic review focused on teachers' main challenges they faced when attempting to implement digital technology in their classrooms. The main challenges that emerged from the reviewed articles include a lack of access to technology and resources, classroom management, administration micromanagement, a lack of support and training, and time constraints.

The most crucial challenge that teachers faced was the lack of access to available technology. For many teachers, the ratio students-to-computers was often high (Daniel & Cowan, 2012). This high ratio means that teachers needed to be creative about how to approach technology implementation due to technology unavailability. Along with the lack of access to technology, ESL teachers were also dissatisfied with the lack of resources available to teach bilingual students. Specifically, teachers often complained that resources available in English, such as apps and videos, were not offered in a first language of the students (González-Carriedo & Harrell, 2018). A second challenge highlighted by teachers was classroom and activities management due to technology-based instruction. Featro and DiGregorio (2016) explained that pre-service teachers were actively interested in using blogging as a pedagogical tool, but were worried about properly controlling, managing, and organizing the activities. Meskill et al. (2002) compared new and experienced ESL teachers and focused on classroom management differences and suggested that novice teachers tended to exert much control over students to enact their lesson plans. The experienced teachers showed a willingness to go off their plan and used unexpectedly the learning opportunities arising through the lessons.

Teachers also explained that part of their frustration when using technology as an instructional tool was the micromanagement and procedures imposed by schools' administration. Teachers who wished to incorporate technology in their pedagogy felt frustrated by schools censoring software and administrations over controlling access to technology (Daniel & Cowan, 2012; Featro & DiGreogrio, 2016). Furthermore, teachers believed that additional support from schools and school districts under the form of professional learning and training would significantly enhance their use of digital technology in the classroom (Meskill et al., 2002; Daniel & Cowan, 2012; González-Carriedo & Harrell, 2018). Meskill et al. (2002) suggested that the lack of training was further noticeable among novice teachers when compared to expert teachers, mostly due to their overall lack of classroom management experience.

The last main challenge for ESL teachers to implement technology in the classroom was time constraints. Time constraints for teachers mostly came from professional tasks, responsibilities, standardized testing, and classes schedule that took up the majority of their personal and professional time (Daniel & Cowan, 2012; Featro & DiGregorio, 2016; González-Carriedo & Harrell, 2018). Daniel and Cowan (2012) emphasized the necessity for teachers to collaborate in order to develop technological expertise. In this context, time was not only essential for planning but also to share, collaborate, and plan in groups. Furthermore, time was also a concern for pre-service bilingual teachers. Featro and DiGregorio (2016) used the example of blogging as a digital instructional tool. Time constraint was first mentioned as one of the main reasons for not using blogging as an instructional tool. Besides, the authors also explained that pre-service teachers should first consider time management when planning to use blogging and to reach out to more experienced teachers to better manage their time. Sardegan and Dugartsyrenova (2014) described how online discussions and forums were sometimes a source of frustration due to delays between responses and tardiness from other students to respond.

DISCUSSIONS
In responding to the first research question, technology helps ESL teachers to create a community with the students as well as their colleagues. The finding of this study is consistent with other studies that emphasized that collaboration between students and other teachers engages both the students and teachers (Ahmadi, 2018; Sardegna & Dugartsyrenova, 2014). In addition to sharing experiences, ESL teachers who use technology have access to different resources that enrich their course content development and facilitate student learning (Collins & Halverson, 2009). The resources include learning spelling from native speakers and online dictionaries and translation in other languages familiar to non-native English speakers. Technology exposes students to enormous resources that extend to what students learn in English textbooks. Furthermore, technology provides an opportunity for non-native English speakers to learn deeply and have a better understanding of what they learn (Pun, 2013). Finally, technology is an essential tool for differentiated instruction (Liu et al., 2014). Through technology, ESL teachers could support students at different levels of English and students with special needs.

In responding to the second research question, ESL teachers lack the required access to technology. The ratio of students-to-computers is very high (Daniel & Cowan, 2012), and teachers do not have the support they need to incorporate technology in teaching English. Also, ESL teachers do not have an opportunity to get trainings in integrating technology in the classrooms. Besides, classroom management is a challenge in English classrooms

when students are working on different activities based on their English levels. However, the lack of experience in teaching technology may be a contributing factor to classroom management. In addition, teachers face the administration pressure that controls what software to access. Due to different policies in schools, teachers do not have equal access to the software, and teachers are frustrated by not having access to the tools that benefit students. Finally, teachers struggle to find the time to incorporate technology in their lessons. Standardized testing and outcomes take too much time in the classrooms, and teachers do not see ways to adjust the time to integrate technology in the classroom.

CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In sum, there are benefits of integrating technology in non-native English speaker courses. These benefits include collaboration among teachers and students, English content development, English learning growth, and differentiated instruction. However, there are also challenges such as lack of access to technology and resources, lack of support and training, classroom management, time constraints, and administration micromanagement. It is the responsibility for us as educators to analyze, discuss, and find solutions based on what works in the classrooms. The benefits and challenges discussed in this article focused on teachers of English to speakers of other languages. However, these benefits and strategies may be useful to teachers who want to integrate technology in other courses as well.

Through our analysis, we were not able to find any research on the use of digital technology to better reach out to minority families for whom English is not the first language. Given the academic and social handicap that not understanding English represents for both the students and the families in the United Stated, we recommend researchers to address this gap in the literature. Future research on this topic may address not only the use of technology in the classroom but also the impact of technology on student learning at homes and communities.

School policies on the use of technology impact ways teachers integrate technology in the classrooms. This study shows that teachers are eager to incorporate technology in teaching English to non-native English speakers, but the school policies hinder their initiatives. Further research may examine the connection between school policies and teachers' belief on incorporating technology into teaching.

Limitations

The systematic review contained some limitations that prevented the findings from generalization. First, the systematic review was limited to eight electronic databases; therefore, more research might have been available but not accessible to the authors. Second, there are many terminologies around teaching English to non-native English speakers. Therefore, it is probable that the keywords inclusion criteria set by the authors missed potential articles that would have met the inclusion criteria.

REFERENCES

Ahmadi, M. R. (2018). The use of technology in English language learning: A literature review. *International Journal of Research in English Education*, *3*(2), 115-125.

Chang, S., & Martínez-Roldán, C. M. (2018). Multicultural lessons learned from a Chinese bilingual after-school program: Using technology to support ethnolinguistic children's cultural production. *Multicultural Education*, *25*(2), 36-41.

Collins, A., & Halverson, R. (2009). *Rethinking education in the age of technology: The digital revolution and schooling in America*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Daniel, M. C., & Cowan, J. E. (2012). Exploring teachers' use of technology in classrooms of bilingual students. *GIST Education and Learning Research Journal*, *6*, 97-110.

Daniel, M. C., Schumacher, G., Stelter, N., & Riley, C. (2016). Student perception of online learning in ESL bilingual teacher preparation. *Universal Journal of Educational Research*, *4*(3), 561-569.

Durbin, J. M. (2002). The benefits of combining computer technology and traditional teaching methods in large enrollment geoscience classes. *Journal of Geoscience Education*, *50*(1), 56-63.

Featro, S. M., & DiGregorio, D. (2016). Bloggin as an instructional tool in the ESL classroom. *TESL-EJ*, 1-9.

González-Carriedo, R., & Harrell, P. E. (2018). Teachers' attitudes toward technology in a two-way dual-language program. *Computers in the Schools*, *35*(2), 111–133.

Graziano, K. J. (2011). Working with English language learners: Preservice teachers and photovoice. *International Journal of Multicultural Education*, *13*(1), 1–19.

Liu, M., Navarrete, C. C., & Wivagg, J. (2014). Potentials of mobile technology for K-12 education: An investigation of iPod touch use for English language learners in the United States. *Educational Technology & Society*, *17*(2), 115-126.

Martinez-Alvarez, P., Pantin, L., & Kajamaa, A. (2018). Creating shared access: Bilingual teachers and children using technology to multimodally negotiate understandings in science and language. *Multiple Voices for Ethnically Diverse Exceptional Learners*, *18*(1), 22-41.

Meskill, C., Mossop, J., DiAngelo, S., & Pasquale, R. K. (2002). Expert and novice teachers talking technology: Precepts, concepts, and misconcepts. *Language Learning & Technology*, *6*(3), 46-57.

Morales, P. Z., & Rumenapp, J. C. (2017). Talking about language in pre-school: The use of video-stimulated recall with emergent bilingual children. *Journal of Multilingual Education Research*, *7*(4), 19-42.

Pun, M. (2013). The use of multimedia technology in English language teaching: A global perspective. *Crossing the Border: International Journal of Interdisciplinary Studies*, *1*(1), 29-38.

Ruggiero, D., & Mong, C. J. (2015). The teacher technology integration experience: Practice and reflection in the classroom. *Journal of Information Technology Education: Research*, *14*, 161-178.

Sardegna, V. G., & Dugartsyrenova, V. A. (2014). Pre-service foreign language teachers' perspectives on learning with technology. *Foreign Language Annals*, *47*(1), 147-167.

DEVELOPING PHOTOVOICE THROUGH AN EDUCATIONAL LENS FOR THE EYE GENERATION

Abigail Aboulkacem (ABD)
Sam Houston State University, 1905 University Avenue, Houston, TX, USA 77340

Dr. Lory Haas
Sam Houston State University, 1905 University Avenue, Houston, TX, USA 77340

Dr. Slimane Aboulkacem
Sam Houston State University, 1905 University Avenue, Houston, TX, USA 77340
Arw071@shsu.edu

ABSTRACT
Viewing the world through images and visual experiences has become an increasingly important facet of society in our digital age. In this qualitative study we examined the perceptions of 48 preservice teachers by discussing their own photographs. A participatory action research method, photovoice, was selected to provide the participants with opportunities to explore and analyze photographs. The goal was to develop visual literacy, critical pedagogy, and an understanding of the educational system's role in maintaining or challenging diverse values, policies, and perspectives. As a final project, the participants presented their photovoice projects and responded to reflective questions. One of the major findings was an increase in the depth of discussion and interpretation of photos. The analysis of the students' reflections and photos yielded themes of overcoming life's hardships, the importance of supportive people in their lives, a passion for teaching, and the significance of diversity and individual differences.
Keywords: Photovoice, Visual literacy, Preservice teachers, Photographic literacy, Qualitative

Introduction

Critical pedagogies and critical literature challenge the perceptions of individuals to discover new pathways for personal and social development as thoughtful global citizens (Wang, Morrel-Samuels, Hutchison, Bell, & Pestronk, 2004; Yoon, Yol, Haag, & Simpson, 2018). An important form of critical literacy is visual literacy, which allows us to rethink the world through images, developing our perspectives on teaching and learning through historical, philosophical, cultural, and social contexts (Metros, 2008; Rabadán, 2015; Rawlinson, Wood, Osterman, & Sullivan, 2007). Through discussions of visual literacy, we develop understanding of the need to promote justice by questioning power relations, understanding inequities, discourses, systemic issues, and individualities in a global society (Aboulkacem & Haas, 2018; Errázuriz, 2019; Messaris, 1994; Newfield, 2011; Potter, 2018).

In today's world, so much information is communicated visually (Aboulkacem & Haas, 2018; Aboulkacem, Haas, & Winard, 2018; Berkowitz, 2014; Kember & Zylinska, 2012; Fleming, 2014; Hobbs, 2016); therefore, it has become increasingly important for individuals to learn what it means to be visually literate (Kress, 2003; Lacković, 2020; Rothman, Daley, & Alder, 2020). For individuals to "read" or analyze an image, they must be able to understand the purpose and recognize the methods applied to convey a message (Hobbs, 2016; Kress, 2003). Consistent with media literacy, visual literacy is about analyzing and creating messages through images which can be used to persuade or influence opinion (Hobbs, 2016; Rabadán, 2015; Potter, 2018). Thus, it is essential for educators to support students in becoming visually literate. Whether the images appear on social media, in a picture book or text, on the news, or digitally altered photos on the cover of a magazine or other publications, images are a major factor that impacts our world (Ilich & Hardey, 2020; Kember & Zylinska, 2012). According to Metros (2008), individuals are stimulated by a culture mediated through visuals ". . . with easy access to the visually rich Web, photo dependent social networks, video saturated media, and graphically sophisticated entertainment and gaming" (p. 102).

Educators should ask questions such as, what do we teach? How do we teach? To whom do we teach? And who are we, as teachers, framing the educational system socially, politically, and institutionally? Furthermore, as educators, we must understand the power of visual literacy and use that to examine societal issues; as well as educational practices which perpetuate historic inequities associated with ethnicity, gender, culture, religion, and economic status.

Theoretical Overview
Photovoice

Living in a visual world, photographic images are powerful tools in promoting societal change and storytelling the world around us. The concept of photovoice was initiated in a rural village in China to understand and document

the perspectives of women in the community (Wang & Burris, 1997). Photovoice is a participatory action research method that uses self-photographed images to especially empower those marginalized in society (Ghosh, Sen, & Bose, 2019; Lögdberg, Nilsson, & Kostenius, 2019; Mayfield-Johnson & Butler, 2017; Papa, 2019). In their seminal work, Wang and Burris (1997) discussed the importance of allowing the participants to record the problems and strengths of their community; reflect on those findings with others through discussions; and aim at reaching policymakers to implement lasting changes (see also Jarldorn, 2019). Photovoice has the ability to impact communities, transform policy, and provide critical analysis of one's personal life and their environment (Wang, Morrel-Samuels, Hutchison, Bell, & Pestronk, 2004).

Photovoice aligns with Freire's (1970) position on socially and educationally empowering practices. The opportunity for the participants to create and use their cameras to advocate for important issues gives them voice and enables them to actively shape their communities (Coemans, Raymakers, Vandenabeele, & Hannes, 2019; Sarti, Schalkers, Bunders, & Dedding 2018). Mayfield-Johnson and Butler (2017) illustrated how photovoice can be used as an empowering tool by allowing the participants to construct their own voice, build their community, and become activist citizens. Freire (1973) elaborated on the three levels/states of consciousness and explained how empowerment is related to the gradual steps to achieve the highest level of consciousness. The individual moves from the passive state, which is called the magical level of consciousness, to the naïve state of consciousness. The naïve state begins by recognizing personal problems and social issues, but no connections are made to external sources or environment. Critical consciousness is the final state where the individual realizes the relationship between their individual condition and the social and political forces affecting them (Freire, 1973). Photovoice discussions and community engagement can help facilitate the awareness of problems within one's community (Mozaffarian, 2019; Padilla, Matiz-Reyes, Colón-Burgos, Varas-Díaz, & Vertovec, 2019); thus, promoting empowerment through critical consciousness of their personal experience and the community at large.

Literature Review
Photovoice for Social Change and Empowerment
Participatory action research can be used to engage youth and young adults in promoting policy change and social justice issues within their communities. Goodhart et al. (2006) designed a photovoice project to empower Rutgers University students to share their voices about problems on their campus. Seventy-five students took part in the study while also enrolled in health training courses. The students were given disposable cameras and themes to keep in mind while taking photographs around the campus. Some of the themes were set to question about healthy lifestyles at Rutgers University, social inequalities on campus, accessibility of drugs at the university, and ideas of love and kindness within the students' community. The outcomes of the study suggested a plan for including healthier items in the vending machines, increasing health education in the living halls for students, and keeping in touch with students' ideas for solving other issues on campus. More importantly, the participants felt a sense of empowerment and confidence by photographing and discussing those issues with fellow students and university policymakers.

Health concerns were discussed in a myriad of studies using photovoice (Esau et al., 2017; Padilla, Matiz-Reyes, Colón-Burgos, Varas-Díaz, & Vertovec, 2019). Photovoice enabled adolescent youth, in a rural part of Uganda, to use disposable cameras in order to capture different health concerns in their community, which they later discussed with their peers (Esau et al., 2017). The purpose of the study was to use photovoice in order to uncover the health status of rural inhabitants in Soroti, Uganda. The students were equipped with disposable cameras and notebooks to document their journey. They were given some guiding questions related to health issues within their community for one whole week. The themes uncovered through the photographs and field notes highlighted issues of hygiene, nutrition, and cleanliness. The researchers noted the effectiveness of photovoice as a participatory action research and its power to stimulate reflective and critical thinking.

Photovoice and camera journaling can also be conducted by children. In their study, Sarti, Schalkers, Bunders, and Dedding (2018) used a photovoice project to allow impoverished children in the Netherlands to meet and establish dialogue with policymakers to create a plan for their neighborhood change. The researchers explained to the children that their stories are interesting and that it is their right to have their concerns heard by policymakers. The children were given cameras and were given instructions on how to capture pictures with respect to ethics and people's privacy. In the process of data collection, Sarti and colleagues used interviewing to study the children's insights from the taken pictures. Once the children compiled a collection of photos, they selected a few to undergo discussions with their fellow researchers and answered questions such as: What is this? What is happening here? Why did you take this photo?

The interviews were not only a valuable source of data for the researchers, but also a powerful training opportunity for students to harness their storytelling skills in preparation for multiple exhibitions with policymakers at the local library and a few schools around the community. The work of children and their presentations to local

policymakers spread to the Amsterdam city council where a strategy meeting took place to discuss the future policy of children living in poverty using their photos and discussions.

In a similar study about impoverished communities, Shah's (2014) conducted a photovoice research to discern the social dynamics and empowerment of adolescent girls in the western region of India. In this research, photovoice allowed Indian girls to express themselves and improve their critical thinking skills and analysis of traditional gender-based roles. This study serves as an important catalyst to spark social change and alter the power dynamics of traditional gender roles, while empowering adolescent girls to think critically about their society, schooling experiences, and future careers.

Photovoice has also been a powerful tool to raise issues related to immigrants and immigration policies (Mozaffarian, 2019; Sahay, Thatcher, Núñez, & Lightfoot 2016). Sahay et al., (2016) used photovoice to showcase the effects of Deferred Action for Childhood Arrivals (DACA) on the lives of Latino youth. The study used photovoice as a participatory research method to allow the youth to express their concerns and perceptions of DACA in relation to their future goals and dreams. This research is significant in highlighting the problems immigrant families and youth face in reaching higher educational opportunities. The findings of this study were based upon the photographs and transcribed discussions during each session. One notable finding was the effect of DACA ineffectively helping young immigrants to pursue higher education opportunities in North Carolina. The impact of this study encouraged the participants to raise awareness about DACA and immigration policies to the public, educators, administrators, as well as government officials.

In relation to healthcare and immigration, Deeb-Sossa and Flores (2017) conducted a photovoice research to analyze migrant farm-working families and children's experience of hardships, depression, and anxiety stemming from the fears of deportation and dangerous working conditions. This study is seminal because it raises awareness about the struggles of migrant farmworkers as well as it encourages immigration reform and policies. The method of photovoice helped provide an outlet for the participants to express their feelings, fears, and share their perceptions with their community, family, and friends.

These research studies illustrate how photovoice is one method used to empower individuals to make improvements for themselves and for others in society. The involvement of participants to create and share their unique perspectives helps encourage those who feel voiceless to speak out. Photovoice can be used in a variety of ways to highlight social injustices, as well as provide information on educational institutions. When educators use photovoice in the classroom, it can spark discussions on ways to change or advocate educational policies affecting both students and teachers.

Photovoice to Improve Pedagogy and School Climate

Photovoice has also been used as an outlet to share the strengths, issues, and ways to improve educational needs for both students and teachers. Roxas, Gabriel, and Becker (2017) conducted a photovoice research to inform school counselors about the problems immigrant middle school students faced with discrimination. The students were provided with cameras to document their home and school lives. After collecting and discussing their photographs, the students showcased their images in a month-long exhibition with a special reception. The perspectives and realities of these middle school students brought more attention to their needs in the school system regarding racism and prejudice

Building on Roxas et al., (2017) work, Pollock (2019) investigated students' experiences at school and suggested ways to promote relationship building between teachers and peers. The participants were identified as students with reading difficulties and were given the opportunity to highlight their perspective of school. The researchers found that the students place a high value on the teacher-student relationship and consider it a key element of their success. This research can further guide teachers in how to reach struggling readers by creating positive student-teacher rapport in the classroom, the school, and the community beyond the school walls.

Additionally, Treadwell and Taylor (2017) used photovoice to empower middle school students to analyze their physical activity at school and at home. The students in a physical education class developed their voice by advocating for more physical activity access around school. The students also reflected upon their own physical practices at home and led initiatives of self-improvement.

Photovoice can be used to understand teachers' perspectives of pedagogy as well. Phatudi (2017) developed a photovoice project with preschool teachers to investigate successful pedagogical approaches of teachers. The researcher found that caring was the most significant attribute to a positive learning environment. When teachers care about their students, it creates a nurturing educational atmosphere, which benefits all students.

In a micro educational setting, photovoice can provide an innovative way to create lessons and engage students in a foreign language-learning curriculum. Villacañas de Castro (2017) enabled participants in Valencia, Spain, to express themselves in English by taking photographs about important socio-cultural issues, such as political and economic divisions between social classes. The future English as a Foreign Language (EFL) teachers in Spain wanted to incorporate photovoice projects in their classrooms in order to modify the outdated memorization and grammar drills. Photovoice has the potential and power for both students and teachers to advocate for themselves, their community, and their own learning.

Summary and Analysis
Photovoice provides a platform for communities to speak out on their problems. It is an empowering way to strengthen community involvement, develop global awareness, highlight various societal issues, instill participants with personal strengths, as well as support pedagogical research through photovoice. The research indicates the benefits of using photovoice to understand the perspectives and concerns from the participants to promote social justice awareness as well as share their photovoice on topics of personal interest they find meaningful. Photovoice can empower women and girls, vulnerable populations experiencing poverty, educators who want to connect with and understand their students, and those who want to influence policymakers to make societal changes. The research articles using photovoice, as a participatory action research, allows those who feel voiceless or insignificant to express themselves visually and become an advocate for themselves and/or their community (Wang & Burris, 1997).

Much of the photovoice literature focuses on health issues, community empowerment, and social justice issues. When used in the educational setting, studies found that students' feelings and perceptions were valued through the use of photovoice. The value of visual literacy is also channeled through photovoice research by giving the photograph the power of visual analysis and reflection. As a methodology, photovoice can be applied in all settings, whether it is for reasons of community and social change or for educational purposes. Although much of the photovoice research is done in vulnerable communities, there is a lack of studies conducted with college students, specifically preservice teachers. It is important to research photovoice with preservice teachers because they are the youth's future educators and will be working directly to impact students. Preservice teachers deserve to showcase their perspectives of community problems and issues using photovoice to better educate the next generation. We need further research on preservice teachers and how photovoice influences their perceptions of community and social change.

The literature shows the power of photovoice in bringing communities together, understanding various perspectives, and creating a need for social advocacy. It can also highlight injustice and create a sense of awareness to fight for change. In the world of education, photovoice inspires the use of critical thinking and applying it to all images seen on and off the screen. Analyzing visual images also instills a need for empowerment and sparks the necessary community changes to value the importance of those unable to voice their perspective and beliefs. This ability to analyze the visual can lead to empowerment, while raising critical consciousness (Friere, 1973). Photovoice research with preservice teachers should be further explored to analyze the benefits for both future teachers and their students.

Method
Participatory action research (PAR) was applied in this study as an approach to inquiry, which involves researchers and participants working together to understand social issues and promote social change. PAR draws on the paradigms of constructivism (Vygotsky, 1980) and critical theory (McLaren & Giarelli, 1995) and may include a variety of qualitative and quantitative methods; however, a qualitative approach only was applied in this study. It is an iterative cycle of research, questioning, action and reflection (Wang & Burris, 1997). From a constructivism paradigm, PAR researchers and participants construct their own meaning through experiences and reflection. This is applicable to the photovoice experiences as the researcher and participants worked together to explore and develop deeper understanding of visual images by looking through different lenses. The participants delved deeply into exploration of the images to determine the various messages conveyed. In reference to critical theory, it applies to the photovoice process as a social philosophy in which participants undertake self-reflective inquiry to develop a greater awareness of societal problems, social injustices, or environmental issues in order to empower and stimulate people to take action. Reflective analysis allows for critique of social issues, personal beliefs, cultural differences, and reveals injustices and power structures.

Photovoice is a qualitative visual PAR method as participants actively research issues, question, analyze and reflect through the lens of a camera, as well as their personal lens when viewing the world. Photovoice builds on Freire 1970's message of the need for empowerment education by supporting knowledge and understanding through

reflection and in-depth discussions on meaningful issues. In essence, it allows for 'voice' of individual perceptions and interpretations.

Research Questions
The following research questions were addressed in this study:
1. What are preservice teachers' perceptions of how messages are conveyed through visual media before participation in photovoice visual analysis?
2. How does participation in photovoice visual analysis develop awareness of social justice issues among preservice teachers?
3. How does participation in photovoice change the perceptions of preservice teachers with regard to the importance of visual literacy instruction and experiences in the classroom?

Participants
Convenience sampling was applied, since the participants in this study were preservice teachers enrolled in a literacy methods block at a university in southeast Texas. The preservice teachers were seeking certification in early childhood education through Grade 6, with eight seeking certification in bilingual education, and four seeking certification in middle grades (4-8) language arts and social studies. A total of 48 preservice teachers participated in this research study, 22 in the fall semester and 26 in the spring semester. Presented in Table 1 are the demographics for each group per semester.

Table 1 *Demographic Data for Fall and Spring Literacy Methods Preservice Teachers*

Preservice Teachers	Fall	Spring
Gender		
Female	22	24
Male	0	2
Age range		
20-24	20	16
25-29	2	5
30-34		3
35-39		2
Ethnicity		
White	15	10
Black	3	5
Hispanic	4	11

As illustrated in the table, the demographic make-up of the two semesters was quite different. Also noteworthy, only one student in the fall semester was married and had children; however, in the spring semester 11 of the preservice teachers were married and eight had children.

Setting
The literacy methods block included three courses in which the preservice teachers completed field experience in local schools, then attended class in the afternoons. Additionally, the literacy methods block in the fall took place in a small rural district about 15 miles south of the university, whereas the spring literacy block was held in a suburban area about 40 miles south of the university. The same professor, who is also one of the researchers, taught both literacy methods blocks.

Role of Researchers
Three researchers developed and implemented this study. One researcher served as the professor of the three courses for both semesters and implemented the initial phase of the study as part of the instructional plan, as well as guided the preservice teachers through various photovoice experiences. The other two researchers served as doctoral research assistants in the literacy program at the same university. One of the doctoral researchers has extensive knowledge and experience with photovoice and the second has much expertise in the area of social and new media literacy.

Each researcher maintained a different role. The professor of the course introduced preservice teachers to photovoice, guided classroom experiences, and encouraged reflection and deeper discussions of social justice issues. As the semester progressed the preservice teachers became more active participants and the professor assumed a less active role in the discussions. As the phases of the study were implemented, the preservice teachers took control of their own learning experiences through researching, questioning, and reflective practices.

The professor took anecdotal notes and recorded comments and meaningful dialogue as preservice teachers shared their thoughts and photos. The other two researchers were not involved in the classroom experiences; however, they actively engaged in handling and analyzing the final written reflections and projects of the preservice teachers. They looked for themes in presentations and changes in perceptions noted by the preservice teachers as to how they grew and learned through their photovoice experiences. Of note, preservice teacher names and identifying factors were excluded on reflections and photo projects on the final submissions for reflective analysis. The artifacts collected for the two semesters were completely anonymous.

Procedures

Through a Socratic approach of critical thinking discussions, participants expressed their thoughts and feelings about a variety of images and photographs throughout the semester-long photovoice experience. The study was implemented in phases throughout two different 15-week semesters. There were five phases implemented sequentially each three weeks in the semester. The phases were designed to slowly develop preservice teachers' understanding of the importance of visual media and critically analyzing the messages they convey. In addition, we wanted preservice teachers to experience visual literacy in various ways prior to completing their own photovoice project. Lastly, our goal was for preservice teachers to become aware of the influence visual media has in our society and the significance of including visual literacy skills and strategies in the classroom. An overview of the five phases is provided in Table 2 and detailed in the following discussion.

Table 2 *Phases of Visual Literacy Experiences*

Phase	Time	Practice-based Experience	Data Sources Applied
1	week 3	Introduction to visual literacy	*Preservice teachers selected personal photos *Selected photos by researchers
2	week 6	Learning to analyze photos	*Researcher selected photos and images
3	week 9	Individual and group discussions of photo analysis of specific themes	*Researcher presented photo collections of several themes
4	week 12	Learning how to select photos to convey deeper meaning	* Preservice teachers shared photos they selected and participated in group discussions of photo analysis
5	week 15	Preparing and sharing photovoice presentations Reflection of experiences written and discussed in class Responses to open-ended questions	* Preservice teachers created Photovoice projects * Preservice teachers selected method of presentation and theme

Phases of Implementation of Visual Literacy Experiences

Phase 1. During the third week in the semester, preservice teachers were asked to take out their phones and scroll their photos, then select one that is special to them. When photos were selected they were instructed to trade phones with the person next to them. The preservice teachers were only asked to trade phones; no instructions were given to discuss or share details. A class discussion was held regarding the selection of their photos, the meaning it had for them personally, and why they felt the need to tell others the background and meaning of the photo they selected.

Next, the professor showed the class several black and white photos of segregation from decades ago (https://allthatsinteresting.com/segregation-in-america-photos). The class looked at each photo for several minutes then the first photo was displayed once again. Preservice teachers were encouraged to linger on the photo and consider all that was revealed through the image without talking to one another. One at a time the photos were shown again. This was followed by selecting one photo to display a third time. They were then asked to turn to the person next to them and discuss what they saw in the photo on the screen and share their thoughts about the image.

Phase 2. During the second phase of visual literacy experiences, which was implemented during the sixth week of each semester, the professor displayed photos of various social justice issues on poster paper around the walls of the classroom. Preservice teachers were strategically placed in small groups with classmates they generally did not sit with to allow for different perspectives and discussions. Then they took a gallery walk and as they discussed the photos, they made notes of their thoughts on the paper. They wrote themes, feelings, personal connections, messages they felt the photographer was conveying, and their thoughts as to the issue displayed. In addition, they

were to note questions they may ask their students if they were to share the same images with them. The images were selected from various public domain websites. Some of the images shared include:

Phase 3. During the ninth week of the semester the professor selected images to share with preservice teachers once again. The photos were collections of images of hands, eyes, and other features of different individuals selected from public domain websites. Some images shared include:

Preservice teachers discussed the meaning and connections they made to the images. They were asked to compare the color, style, and angle of the images, then to work in small groups to decide on a theme for collections of photos to convey an intended message.

Phase 4. During the twelfth week of each semester the preservice teachers were asked to select photos to share with the class that they felt were meaningful and conveyed a strong message. They were informed that they would not share their thoughts on the images but listen to the thoughts and ideas of others. The images were numbered, then preservice teachers displayed their images on the tables throughout the classroom and took a gallery walk while making note of their personal thoughts about each photo. After making individual notes, they discussed their thoughts about each photo in small groups. Then as a group, they combined their notes and thoughts to develop a

group summary and theme for each of the photos which they shared in a class discussion. After groups had presented their themes and thoughts, they were asked to share their purpose and intent in choosing their one photo to share with the class.

Phase 5. In week 15, the final phase of the visual literacy experiences study, preservice teachers were asked to take their own photos and create displays to share with the class. They take personal photos or choose from public domain images. In addition, they could select one photo or a group of images, there were no parameters as to how they could present their projects. In addition, they were asked to submit a written reflection of their photovoice experiences throughout the semester , as well as reflect on their personal photovoice project. In addition, participants responded to two open-ended questions about their perceptions of implementation of photovoice in their future classrooms.

Data Analysis

After collecting the preservice teachers' written responses, photographs, and presentations, thematic analysis was applied to analyze and uncover themes from the data collection. According to Boeije (2002), comparison of data provides opportunities for qualitative researchers to be able to "do what is necessary to develop theory more or less inductively, namely categorizing, coding, delineating categories and connecting them" (p. 303). Miles and Huberman (2014) defined coding as "This part of analysis involves how you differentiate and combine the data you have retrieved and the reflections you make about this information" (p. 56).

The six phases of thematic analysis outlined by Braun and Clarke (2006), helped guide the process for codifying and selecting themes. The first phase included reading and rereading the reflections to become familiar with their responses, as well as analyzing the pictures from the photovoice project. The second phase involved coding the data with examples from the written responses, while the third phase categorized those codes into formulating potential themes. The fourth phase involved checking and reviewing the themes to match the categories of codes and creating a thematic map of the data. The fifth phase clearly defined and selected the themes using information from the categories of codes and the thematic map. The sixth and final phase was the selection of specific examples of quotes and pictures to illustrate the defined themes from the data collection. Table 3 presents the phases of thematic analysis applied.

Table 3 *The Six Phases of Thematic Analysis (Braun & Clarke, 2006)*

Phase 1	Reading and rereading the writing prompts to become familiar with their responses
Phase 2	Coding the data with examples from the written responses
Phase 3	Categorizing codes into formulating potential themes
Phase 4	Checking and reviewing the themes to match the categories of codes and creating a thematic map of the data.
Phase 5	Defining and selecting the themes using information from the categories of codes and the thematic map.
Phase 6	Selection of specific examples of quotes and pictures to illustrate the defined themes from the data collection.

Procedures for Analyzing the Reflections and Projects

The doctoral students analyzed the written reflections and projects, then shared their findings with the professor. Because the professor had been involved in the classroom experiences, only the two doctoral students analyzed the reflections and projects. Through open coding, the doctoral researchers individually read the reflections, highlighted keywords, and categorized all projects under various topics. As Creswell (2007) stated, open coding serves the primary function of helping qualitative investigators develop categories. After the process of open coding, the two doctoral researchers compared their codings and categorized the initial coded data into smaller meaningful subsections which is called the process of axial coding (Leech & Onwuegbuzie, 2007). The final process of selective coding, consisted of the two researchers developing themes.

After the themes were determined the three researchers met and discussed the findings. The professor was able to verify the themes from observations, anecdotal notes from class sessions, their final presentations, and discussions with preservice teachers in class; therefore, triangulating the data analyses. The four themes which emerged were: passion for teaching and education, overcoming tragedy and personal endurance, love and family, and diversity and embracing differences. Of significance, analysis of the two groups of students in regard to themes revealed more of the preservice teachers in the fall literacy methods block selected photos with themes of a passion for teaching, as well as inequities, diversity and embracing differences. Whereas the group in the spring, with a wider age range, shared more photos with themes of overcoming tragedy and personal endurance, as well as love and family.

Findings
The findings of this study are two-fold and are presented below through discussion of themes which emerged through analysis of reflections and final projects, as well as discussion of observations of preservice teachers' participation in photovoice experiences in each phase. The selected statements noted below include key words in the reflections to support the four overarching themes.

Noteworthy, when developing final projects for presentation, most participants selected photographs and themes of either societal issues or personal connections. Although the focus of the photographs shared and discussed throughout the semester were of community, global, and societal issues, when participants were tasked with creating and applying their photovoice in a project many took a more personal approach.

The topics of some included overarching themes of educational disparities and mental health awareness and were passionately discussed when presented, whereas others chose personal challenges and overcoming tragedies in their lives. There were no connections to local or community issues, the themes were broad in focus or narrowly focused on personal and family issues. In addition, students in the fall literacy methods courses presented the broader themes of societal issues, with more students in the spring focusing on personal struggles and family connections.

Of importance, in final written reflections all preservice teachers stated they felt the power and importance of implementing photovoice and visual literacy in their future classrooms. They shared they were empowered and enjoyed the deeper conversations and hearing the perspectives of others in the class. All agreed the process would be beneficial to their future students in becoming aware of issues and learning to become an active and contributing member of society.

Passion for Teaching and Education
A majority of the preservice teachers, from both classes, discussed the importance of education, their passion for teaching the youth, and reflecting on their personal journeys into the education field. Reflections revealed a passion for becoming teachers and helping students learn and grow through many educational opportunities and experiences. This connects well to Freire's (1970) beliefs in socially and emotionally empowering of students through education.

One student said, "I am so passionate about my future profession and each one of the interactions with these kids has helped me on my way to becoming a teacher." Another student wrote, "I chose the theme passion, because I truly have a passion for people especially the youth. The youth is our future and having them around shows me that there is so much in the world to be done for these young children."

Another student noted, "The theme of my photovoice is the difference in education between the United States and South America….That made me think of how lucky and privileged we are here in the U.S. that sometimes I feel education is taken for granted. This reassured me of how badly I wanted to become a teacher and teach abroad to students that don't have the luxury we have here in the U.S."

This student, from South America, became very emotional when presenting her project as she discussed inequities in education for students in South America. She chose to use color and black and white photos to highlight the differences in educational opportunities between countries. She further explained that when she came to the United States she felt overwhelmed, but excited about all the resources and books available to students. However, she was dismayed that the students in her new school seemed to take everything for granted and were not appreciative. (See Appendix A for project presentation)

In reference to a trip to Cuba, a student shared, "We take our lifestyles for granted and complain when material things get damaged or lost. There are people and children with far less who are 10X more excited about the

community and the education they receive. They get excited to take you on a tour of their little town, and their school with holes in the ceiling, concrete that is cracking, and walls that are crumbling down. These girls were ecstatic to find out I was going to become a teacher."

One preservice teacher expressed her passion for teaching, "I have always wanted to work with children, and I may have been lost on the way, but I found where I needed to be. Helping children is our job as adults. They are our future. We all see importance in children but we need a reminder that they are why we do this."

Similarly, another preservice teacher wrote about her trip to classrooms in Honduras, "Although these schools have little money for nice things, they are rich in knowledge and love for their school. These classrooms all had very little supplies, decorations, books, little to no electricity, yet they were all filled with students who were eager to learn and excited to be there."

Lastly, one participant artistically wrote, "The message I was hoping for my reader to learn from it is that our students are like butterflies. We feed them so much knowledge, and then they get wrapped in all this knowledge, and then one day you hope to see them spread their wings and become something amazing."

Overcoming Tragedy and Personal Endurance
Participants from both groups shared personal stories of how they overcame adversity and tragedies in their life. However, more participants in the spring who were older shared experiences with challenging circumstances versus the group in the fall. They also expressed the importance of endurance and perseverance needed in hard times. This is evidenced in the previous studies discussed regarding health issues in rural areas of Uganda.

One participant wrote, "My message that I hope readers would take away from this is that everything may not come easy but if you continue to strive for what you want you will get what you want. I want to show people that everyone goes through something, good or bad but there is a way to overcome it."

This participant shared several personal challenges she had overcome and how these events helped her learn she was stronger than she thought and had the ability to push through and persevere. She wanted to bring awareness that we all have the power to overcome personal challenges. For each of the photos she selected for her project she shared a struggle or challenge, why the photo was representative of her feelings or situation, and how she overcame the problem.(See Appendix B for project presentation on overcoming obstacles)

Another shared, "I have learned from this project that I have overcome a lot in life. Through these pictures different things were happening in my life. I've lost dear ones and gained loved ones through my 23 years on earth."

This preservice teacher discussed her brother's autism and muscular dystrophy, "A sister and brother bond from the beginning is strong no matter the circumstances. I hope that the readers/viewers see the first picture and see the love between my brother and I and the process of his surgery. Also, the smile he has in the last photo shows that just because he has had all these things happen to him he can still have a smile on his face."

In addition, one participant wrote about her brother's painful football game accident, in which he tore his ACL and meniscus. She wrote, "He could have let this injury take away the joy he finds in sports, he could have let it stop his dreams, but he didn't. Through this injury he found pieces of himself he would have never found otherwise, he grew to be a stronger person, a truly resilient individual."

Another preservice teacher talked about her emotional miscarriage, "The picture is an empty basket. For newborn pictures, most of the time they always put the newborn baby in a basket to take newborn pictures. However, this basket is empty, representing the loss of a baby. Not only does it represent loss, the empty basket represents the emptiness that mothers feel after miscarriage. However, in the picture, you see a rainbow in the back. The rainbow represents hope, a rainbow after a storm."

One shared a personal story about her mother, "My mother had to get emergency surgery all because of the fibroid she had in her uterus. In which she was in pain in the hospital and she kept smiling through all of it. My mom was brave and kept her perseverance. The message I want people to take away from my photos is to never give up."

Love and Family
Preservice teachers in both classes focused on their loved ones and the impact of family on their lives; however, more participants in the spring group who had children shared photographs of families than the fall group. The fall group who focused on this theme generally selected one individual as the focus of their project.

One participant expressed, "The theme for my photo project is love. Each section is a period of my life and it has pictures of some of the most important people in life during that time, some are there throughout the whole poster and some are only there for a short time….the love I receive or have received from these people got me to where I am today."

Another wrote, "The message I hope readers would take away as they view my project is love, peace, happiness, and family. I want the viewers to see that everyone included in my photo voice project helped in some way get me to where I am now."

A participant also shared, "The theme for my project is World Impact, more specifically (family) from all around the world, who they are to me, and what impact they have had on my life."

Another shared her adoption story, "The theme of my picture is family or the start/beginning of my life…..This photo is a message of happiness and togetherness. It shows how families can start in different ways. The goal/purpose was to show something that is meaningful to me and represents a huge part of my life."

Further, a participant wrote about the love she has for her mother, "The theme of this Photovoice is that of time and a mother's love. My mom is my best friend and has been since the beginning of my memories….The message I hope that readers take away as they view this is that of holding tight to those who matter most."

A young male in the class selected three very vivid photos of a caterpillar transforming into a butterfly. He shared that he and his wife had been taking care of two foster children and were in the process of adopting them. "I chose these photos for several reasons, I feel this is our life right now as a family, we are changing into a beautiful butterfly together. I also chose this because it represents how our boys have changed from scared and somewhat challenging children to secure and happy children. Change can be a wonderful thing; we just need to seek beauty in the process."

Diversity and Embracing Differences
Another theme from both classes touched upon the idea of diversity and tolerating people from all walks of life. More students in the fall literacy block selected diversity and tolerance as a theme versus the spring group. In addition, the projects created for this theme were in collage formats with multiple photos included to show a wide range of topics to demonstrate diversity. Similar to the photovoice study of Núñez and Lightfoot (2016) regarding immigration and DACA to showcase the concerns of youth, participants in this study selected social injustices to highlight as their final projects and to bring voice to embracing diversity and understanding the challenges of others.

A student wrote, "I hope when people look at my collage, they see that acceptance comes in many shapes and forms. As well as the fact that just because someone may be different no matter how extreme that difference is, they are no less of a person and no less deserving of someone's acceptance than someone that may be more typical."

This participant was very open throughout the semester about her struggles with mental health and depression and wanted to bring awareness to the problem. She made several connections to facial expressions, emotions, and body language of individuals in images shared in photovoice discussions. When sharing her collage she explained why she selected each photo to include in her project and connected to how she felt at times. (See Appendix C for project presentation)

Another student shared about the importance of diversity, "I want them to see the genuine and great depth of a friendship between people of two totally different cultures. The entire purpose is to show the viewer that despite differences in language, religion, ways of life, dress, interests, and way of thinking, we are all capable of connecting with one another and if we embrace differences, we may just find ourselves with the richest of relationships."

Similarly, another student discussed how each of us is unique, "The theme of this photo is the many differences and characteristics of people in the world. I chose this theme, because I feel that it is important to understand that all people are unique in their own way and have their own daily troubles."

In regard to diversity in the classroom, this student wrote, "Instead of separating our students, we should use the diversity in our classroom as an opportunity to teach them about the many, many, many places in the world, which is clearly what the students in my picture are doing…learning about each other's backgrounds."

Additionally, this student proposed, "However, the idea is to emphasize the harmony amongst various aspects highlighted in the image, despite their contrasting character which distinguish and stand out separately speaking of their individuality, they are yet united together to run the ecology of the universe. This phenomena is indeed the key to run the social life of human beings as well. People of various kinds must stand up together and bring about change for the better to run the world in a better way."

Educational Application to Future Teaching
When the participants completed the photovoice presentations, they were asked to respond to two writing prompts. One of the questions asked the preservice teachers if they would do a similar photovoice project with their future students, why or why not? The second question asked how they might implement a photovoice project in their classroom and what they hope students will learn.

Collectively, all participants in this study agreed they would implement a photovoice project, or something similar, in their future classrooms and found it to be an important way to incorporate visual literacy into the classroom and support meaningful discussions of important personal and social issues. Many replied that they would follow a process similar to their experiences throughout the semester of sharing photos and encouraging deeper discussions and exploration of social issues, then gradually progressing to students selecting meaningful photos to share. The participants expressed visual literacy needed to be taught and nurtured to help students develop their visual literacy skills. The majority of preservice teachers noted that they had never heard of visual literacy and in today's world it is a very important approach that should be included in literacy programs.

Consistent with research in schools previously discussed, the participants shared the importance and possibilities of a photovoice project in allowing students to express their feelings, views, and passions through images. Some shared that they want students to know that images speak for themselves and convey messages, emotions, memories, and bring awareness to school, community, or societal issues. As future teachers, many participants noted visual literacy as a good tool to support many literacy strategies, as well as broadening students' views of the world.

Through the responses of all 48 preservice teachers it was revealed that 100% felt visual literacy experiences and practices should be an integral part of teaching and learning for all students at every grade level. They each shared the importance in teaching strategies to read and make meaning of images as increasingly important for students, as they are in a world which is more visual than ever before and images are readily available at the touch of a finger.

Preservice teachers revealed awareness of the increasing importance for students to learn what it means to be visually literate, which is consistent with previous researchers (Kress, 2003; Lacković, 2020; Rothman, Daley, & Alder, 2020). Participants' responses connect well to the beliefs of Hobbs (2016) and Kress (2003) that for individuals to be able to read or analyze an image, they must understand the purpose and recognize the methods applied to convey a message. Through classroom discussions and responses to open-ended questions, participants agreed that all students must view the world through a critical lens and question messages conveyed and the intended purpose to become informed citizens and consumers of information.

Observations of Student Changes through Classroom Experiences
In phase one, preservice teachers were asked to select a personal photo on their phone and trade phones with the person next to them without any further instructions. Interestingly, the preservice teachers immediately began asking questions about each other's photo and sharing details of their own photo selections. They became immersed in conversations about their photos, sharing background information and details about the images. The majority of photos selected were about families, friends, and pets. When asked why they began discussing their photos without directions to do so, they explained how they felt the need to tell their partner who was in the photo and why it was important to them. They shared their thinking that the other individual would not know the background or who was in the photo without explanation. In addition, every student agreed that the photos they selected were personal to them and had no meaning for another person, thus the need to share details to establish meaning.

After viewing the photos of segregation, a discussion was held regarding the meaning of the photos and the emotions they evoked. When asked if they were able to determine what was taking place in the photos without discussing them or having prior knowledge of what happened before or during the photo being taken, the preservice teachers all agreed that there was purpose and intent in the photos and the messages were clearly conveyed. They discussed the actions, facial expressions, clothing, and locations in the photos. They were immersed in viewing

the details in the photos and then various angles the photographer applied. Some began to comment on the photos they shared at the beginning of class and how they lacked depth or deeper meaning. One preservice teacher made the comment that her photo selection was very superficial and only meaningful to her. This prompted a deeper discussion of why and how images can be powerful tools for analysis.

In phase two, the preservice teachers began to focus in-depth on the photos of child labor, poor schools, immigration, and homelessness. They became more passionate in sharing their thoughts and feelings. One student stated, "These images are heartbreaking! How can children be expected to carry heavy containers and not be allowed to go to school." Another student shared, "I have family in Mexico and people do not understand what it is like to live there. There are no opportunities to work or have a better life. Politicians just think about money and think immigrants are trouble."

In phase three, they became very engaged in the simple, yet powerful images in the photos of hands, eyes, and personal features. A student made the comment, "Hands can be so powerful in a good way and a bad way. They can help someone or hurt someone; it depends on the individual's intent." Then another student extended on this thought, "The same is true of the mouth. Words can lift someone up or tear them down." The depth in discussion continued to deepen. The preservice teachers also spent much longer periods of time in group discussions than the discussions at the beginning of the semester. They opened up more when sharing their feelings.

In phase four the participants brought in their own photo selections. The images included photos of pollution, graffiti, orphanages, abuse, homelessness, very poor areas in other countries, human trafficking, and schools with little to no resources. Each of the images shared were powerful and showed a social justice issue in our world. They spent the entire class period viewing, discussing, and making notes of the images. The preservice teachers began to group some of the photos in themes and labeled them in broader contexts of power, voice, resiliency, commitment to learning, and exploitation of people and resources. One participant commented, "Wow! Look at the messages in each of these. I have never thought about the power of pictures and how deep they can touch you." Another shared, "I selected this photo of an orphanage because my wife and I just adopted two boys who have been in the foster care system for three years." In addition, a preservice teacher shared that she selected an image from a mission trip she took the previous summer and wanted everyone to see how few resources the schools had and the joy of the kids when they brought them finger paints and paper.

In phase five, the preservice teachers shared their photovoice projects. The themes were powerful and some caused many to shed tears. One student shared personal struggles with mental health, whereas another presented photos of her daughter who was born premature and was connected to many machines for months. Another student shared photos of her mother and her grave site after her long battle with breast cancer.

Personal Changes and Growth
The preservice teachers discussed how much they had learned about visual literacy and conveying powerful messages through images. One participant commented, "I have actually looked through many of my photos and deleted a lot that didn't really mean anything. I can't believe I actually had pictures of meals I have eaten. Some people have very little to eat and I had pictures of huge plates of food that meant nothing." All preservice teachers agreed that visual literacy was a powerful tool that should be included in the classroom and felt it was one of the best strategies for students to understand the injustices in today's society, as well as from historical perspectives.

Discussion
In the world of education, there is an abundance of pedagogical approaches to teaching and learning. Photovoice, as participatory action research, is one way to gain insight into how participants see the world and reflect upon their own realities. As preservice teachers navigate through the world of education, it is important for them to gain critical thinking skills and empower their students to do the same. As noted in the responses to the final two questions, all preservice teachers felt there was great value in implementing photovoice with their future students. They also expressed that visual literacy should be part of the instructional program at all levels.

Photovoice can encourage teachers to use their voice to speak out about the strengths and problems in their lives and community. Teachers are the best advocates for their students and implementing photovoice can empower students to discuss issues about themselves and their own communities. In this study preservice teachers were able to participate in the process of photovoice and visual literacy experiences, which provided them opportunities to develop perspectives from a student lens. As active participants they determined the importance of teaching visual literacy strategies to their future students. Additionally, allowing preservice teachers to experiment with this new methodology of participatory action research has the potential to instill and prepare their students to share meaningful insights into their personal lives, which can build stronger teacher-student relationships.

Photovoice, as participatory action research, empowers students and can often act as the catalyst for meaningful change in both their lives and the community. Freire (1973) discusses the idea of critical consciousness, where one understands and realizes the connection between their own individual condition to the various factors affecting their social and political world. An awareness of social consciousness became evident as the preservice teachers progressed in deeper discussion throughout the semester and immersed themselves in analyzing and making meaning of the many photos shared. Photovoice creates the space for students to reflect, analyze, and critically speak out in their own unique way using photographs, which is why it is important for teachers to understand and grasp the concept themselves. When teachers implement photovoice with their students, it can greatly affect the teacher-student relationship in a positive way. The participants in this study expressed the significance of allowing students to select their own photos to share their values and beliefs to support understanding of each other and build a classroom community.

Pollack's (2019) research with photovoice showed how students wanted to build a strong rapport with their teachers and peers in order to have an enjoyable time at school. As preservice teachers begin their journey through pedagogy and curriculum, it is necessary for them to gain additional strategies to relate and connect with their students using photovoice. One of the best ways to build a strong relationship is by putting yourself in the other person's shoes. Therefore, when preservice teachers practice using photovoice for themselves, it can greatly benefit their future students because they understand and value the concept of using photovoice before implementing it with their class.

The benefits of using participatory action research include a positive teacher-student relationship, empowering the participants, critical thinking, and promoting social and political action within the community. Cook, Brown, & Ballard (2016) conducted photovoice research in Costa Rica to build cross-cultural communication and sustainability practices between study abroad undergraduate students and local coffee farmers. The dialogue created a balance of power to share ideas and determine the best farming methods. This example illustrates the impact of photovoice on participants voicing their perspectives and sharing ideas together as a community.

As the semester progressed and the phases of photovoice implementation deepened, preservice teachers listened more intently to the ideas of others and more readily expressed their personal thoughts of the images and social injustices. The process opened lines of communication and supported a community environment. Introducing photovoice in the classroom allowed preservice teachers to be the guide of their own learning, constructing knowledge through personal experiences, as well as determining how to implement the process in their future teaching. The preservice teachers became aware that photovoice involves sharing the balance of power with their students and will not only build positive relationships, but also empower students to reach their full potential and better understand the world around them. Participants expressed they felt the empowerment of photovoice lies in allowing individuals to select and share topics of personal interest which are meaningful and focuses on issues in which they truly are passionate.

Conclusion

Photovoice, as a participatory action research method, has the potential to transform lives and empower those in vulnerable communities. This study aimed to introduce preservice teachers to both photovoice and visual literacy experiences in order to understand their perspectives on using this research method. Throughout the study, the preservice teachers explored a variety of photos and participated in meaningful discussions regarding visual literacy and the impact of the photograph on the eye generation. During each semester, the preservice teachers presented and analyzed their own photographs with a sense of appreciation for applying photovoice projects in their future classroom.

The participants created photovoice projects which showcased their personal lives of overcoming tragedy, their passion for teaching/education, their love for family, and promoting diversity. The preservice teachers' writing reflections and in-class presentations also highlighted the importance of implementing photovoice with their future students. The participants valued the idea of developing one's passion through engaging photographic and visual literacy experiences. Photovoice research is an empowering tool for both the individual, community, and society. It has the ability to instill educational values, visual literacy skills, and advocate for policy change. In conclusion, photovoice projects help create a ripple effect to encourage all students to speak up and believe that they can make a difference both personally, socially, and politically.

References

Boeije, H. (2002). A purposeful approach to the constant comparative method in analysis of qualitative interviews. *Quality & Quantity, 36*, 391-409.

Braun, V., & Clarke, V. (2006). Using thematic analysis in psychology. *Qualitative research in psychology*, *3*(2), 77-101.

Cook, K., Brown, A., & Ballard, G. (2016). Using photovoice to explore environmental sustainability across languages and cultures. *Discourse and Communication for Sustainable Education*, *7*(1), 49-67.

Deeb-Sossa, N., & Flores, Y. G. (2017). Using photovoice with farmworker children and youth: A methodology for understanding sociopolitical mental health issues. *Aztlan: A Journal of Chicano Studies, 42*(2), 49-80.

Esau, D., Ho, P. T., Blair, G. K., Duffy, D., O'Hara, N. N., Kapoor, V., & Ajiko, M. (2017). Engaging youth in rural Uganda in articulating health priorities through photovoice. *Global Health Promotion, 24*(3), 59-67.

Freire, P. (1970). *Pedagogy of the oppressed*. New York, NY: Seabury.

Freire, P. (1973). *Education for critical consciousness*. New York, NY: Bloomsbury.

Ilich, K. L., & Hardey, M. (2020). 'It's all about the packaging': Investigation of the motivations, intentions, and marketing implications of sharing photographs of secondary packaging on Instagram. *Information, Communication & Society*, *23*(1), 1-19

Mayfield-Johnson, S., & Butler, J., III. (2017). Moving from pictures to social action: An introduction to photovoice as a participatory action tool. *New Directions for Adult and Continuing Education, 154*, 49–59.

McLaren, P., & Giarelli, J. M. (Eds.). (1995). *Critical theory and educational research*. SUNY Press.

Metros, S. E. (2008). The educator's role in preparing visually literate learners. *Theory into Practice, 47*(2), p. 102-109.

Miles, M. B., Huberman, A. M., & Saldaña, J. (2014). *Qualitative data analysis: An expanded sourcebook* (3rd ed.). Thousand Oaks, CA: Sage.

Phatudi, N. C. (2017). "You should give a child love and take them warm-heartedly from their parent": Preschool teachers' practice and understanding of care. *Perspectives in Education*, *35*(1), 15-27.

Pollock, S. (2019). Literacy difficulties: What are learners' experiences? *Educational & Child Psychology, 36*(1), 101-114.

Rabadán, Á. V. (2015). Media literacy through photography and participation. A conceptual approach. *Journal of New Approaches in Educational Research, 4*(1), 32–39.

Rawlinson, K., Wood, S. N., Osterman, M., & Sullivan, C. C. (2007). Thinking critically about social issues through visual material. *Journal of Museum Education, 32*(2), 155–174.

Roxas, K. C., Gabriel, M. L., & Becker, K. (2017). "Mexicans are like thieves and bad people, and we're not really like that": Immigrant youth use photovoice to counter racism and discrimination. *Journal of School Counseling*, *15*(19), n19.

Sahay, K. M., Thatcher, K., Núñez, C., & Lightfoot, A. (2016). "It's like we are legally, illegal": Latino/a youth emphasize barriers to higher education using photovoice. *The High School Journal, 100*(1), 45-65.

Sarti, A., Schalkers, I., Bunders, J. F., & Dedding, C. (2018). Around the table with policymakers: Giving voice to children in contexts of poverty and deprivation. *Action research*, *16*(4), 396-413.

Shah, P. (2014). Spaces to speak: Photovoice and the reimagination of girls' education in India. *Comparative Education Review, 59*(1), 50-74.

Treadwell, S. M., & Taylor, N. (2017). PE in pictures: Using photovoice to promote middle school students' reflections on physical activity during free time. *Journal of Physical Education, Recreation & Dance*, *88*(4), 26-33.

Villacañas de Castro, L. S. (2017). 'We are more than EFL teachers–we are educators': Emancipating EFL student-teachers through photovoice. *Educational Action Research*, *25*(4), 610-629.

Vygotsky, L. S. (1980). *Mind in society: The development of higher psychological processes*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Wang, C., & Burris, M. A. (1997). Photovoice: Concept, methodology, and use for participatory needs assessment. *Health Education & Behavior, 24*(3), 369-387.

Wang, C. C., Morrel-Samuels, S., Hutchison, P. M., Bell, L., & Pestronk, R. M. (2004). Flint photovoice: Community building among youths, adults, and policymakers. *American Journal of Public Health, 94*(6), 911-913.

Yoon, B., Yol, Ö., Haag, C., & Simpson, A. (2018). Critical global literacies: A new instructional framework in the global era. *Journal of Adolescent & Adult Literacy, 62*(2), 205–214.

DIGITAL STORYTELLING IN THE CONTEXT OF DIGITAL TECHNOLOGIES

Gökhan Koşer
Akdeniz Karpaz University, Faculty of Education
gokhankoser20202020@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-0822-0035

ABSTRACTS
In recent years, with the development of technology, the use of technological media and multimedia tools such as tablets, e-books, e-magazines, interactive smart boards and smart classrooms has increased in the field of education. However, it is not enough to include these and similar tools in the training program. The education system aims to provide students with skills such as exhibiting new and creative ideas, critical thinking and problem solving, taking part in collaborative studies, being responsible, information literacy, media literacy, information and communication technologies literacy. Digital story as a multimedia tool is seen as an educational technology and literacy learning tool that uses almost all the skills that students are expected to have in the 21st century. This research aims to examine digital storytelling in the context of digital technologies in education. In the context of the keywords determined in the research, the literature was examined and the findings were conveyed. As a result, it was determined that students' critical thinking dispositions, collaborative editing skills and story-making skills were positively affected by the digital storytelling process.
Keywords: Digital storytelling, digital technologies, education

Introduction

Rapid changes in information technologies have brought innovation and change in many fields. Undoubtedly, one of the areas where change has been experienced has been education. Looking at the process from the past to the present, it is seen that many innovations in technology have also found their way in education and various ways have been tried to integrate these technologies into learning environments due to their potential benefits.

It is known that the way of communication, interaction, processing and learning of today's students (Prensky, 2001), who grew up in an environment equipped with technology and are called digital natives, are also affected by the said change in education (Karaoglu et al., 2016). It is stated that young people not only have more opportunities to access technology, but also learn in different ways compared to previous generations (Malita & Martin, 2010).

With the technological explosion of communication and globalization, there is a shift from traditional understandings of literacy towards exploring different forms of meaning-making. Currently, students encounter and interact with new digital literacies, including blogs, wikis, digital texts and digital stories, in an effort to blend technology with education (Abdel-Hack & Helwa, 2014). These students, who grew up with digital technologies, prefer multimedia content that is rich in visual and audio terms to content consisting mainly of text, and they see technology as a tool for a purpose rather than an obstacle to learning (Dreon et. al., 2011).

When the tools, course materials, methods, strategies and techniques used in the education process are examined, it is observed that there is a change in all these, and it is seen that technological developments have made a significant contribution to this change. The fact that personal computers, mobile phones, digital cameras, scanners and easy-to-use software are more accessible to teachers who use the digital world has also increased the use of new technologies in education systems worldwide in recent years (Smeda et al., 2014). One of the areas where technology (Yang & Wu, 2012), which is today's transformative power, has shown its effect in education has been storytelling. When students in a classroom create a story with the tools of technology, they learn not only how to use these tools, but also how to be creative, how to organize, format and tailor a message to the target audience (France & Wakefield, 2011).

With the digital story method, which is a student-centered and constructivist approach, it is accepted as a very powerful teaching and learning tool since the information about how the subject to be conveyed is structured in the mind is concrete. The nature of creating digital stories, which requires students to be active and engaged in every step of the application, transforms student roles from passive information receivers to active information developers (Hill, & Grinnell, 2014; Balaman-Ucar, 2016).

The aim of this research is to define and examine the digital storytelling method in the context of digital technologies that are developing day by day and are integrated into education and to investigate how to adapt it to education.

Digital Storytelling

Although there are many definitions of digital storytelling, these definitions generally revolve around digital storytelling combining still images including sound and music. (Xu et. al., 2011). It can be said that digital storytelling is a short film creation process, but unlike a short film, digital storytelling can also be defined as a movie narrated by the creator's own voice and supported by various multimedia components such as music, images, and videos.

The digital story is a powerful learning and teaching tool that combines traditional storytelling with digital components such as text, images, sound recordings, music and video (Robin, 2008; Yuksel Arslan et al., 2016). Digital storytelling, which combines the power of technology and storytelling, is also called a modern expression of the old art of storytelling (Lambert, 2010). Like traditional storytelling, digital stories revolve around a chosen theme and often have a specific point of view. Multimedia components and subject content are blended through a software. Digital stories are relatively short and often between 2 and 10 minutes. It is in a format that can be viewed on computers and other video-playing digital devices, and can be shared on the internet and accessed from web browsers (Robin, 2016; Bull & Kajder 2004). As a multimedia tool, the digital story is seen as an educational technology and literacy learning tool that uses almost all the skills that students are expected to have in the 21st century (Dogan & Robin, 2009; Lantz et al., 2020).

Robin (2008) states that there are seven elements that digital storytelling should have. These items are;
- General purpose of the story
- Narrator's point of view
- Dramatic question or questions
- Quality of images, video and other multimedia elements
- Selection of music suitable for the content
- Selection of content
- Speed control.

Types of Digital Storytelling

Digital stories have given traditional storytelling a new impetus. It is a versatile education and research tool that contextualizes information in different disciplines related to 21st century skills with a post-modern approach (Robin, 2008; Sadık, 2008). It is emphasized that it can be useful in all disciplines and in different genres, as it includes storytelling, which is one of the oldest teaching styles (Hill & Grinnell, 2014). Although there are many different types in the literature (Emert, 2013; Garrety, 2008; Gregori-Signes, 2008), it is possible to divide the most common types into three categories in terms of their content: personal, historical and instructive stories.

Personal stories: These stories can revolve around important events in the lives of individuals, have emotional content and can be personally meaningful for both the author and the audience. Stories that tell about certain people or places and touch on adventures, successes and difficulties in life are also included in this group. In these stories, the personal point of view comes to the fore while the events, feelings and thoughts are told.

Historical stories: Digital stories about important events in history are included in this category. Students can use historical pictures, newspaper reports, historical speeches and other materials they can find to add depth to past events. The historical issues in question are narrated by being fictionalized within the story scenario.

Educational stories: These types of stories usually contain approaches and information about a subject. The subject content of the courses is presented in an appropriate fiction. It can be used to present information in many different disciplines, from mathematics and science to arts, technology and medical education.

Digital Storytelling in the Context of Digital Technologies

Digital storytelling allows teachers and students to be active participants in meaningful projects by using 21st century technological opportunities. The main purpose of digital storytelling projects is to encourage students to take responsibility for their own learning in the learning process (Bromberg, et. al., 2013). Thus, for digital storytelling as an active learning strategy, it can cause more information to be remembered than traditional teaching, even on subjects that allow limited or no experience.

It is inevitable that digital storytelling will not only act as a bridge for the integration of technology into the classroom, but also provide very positive gains for the students, since it is an approach that allows students to

express themselves. With digital storytelling, students have the chance to reveal their creativity while discovering themselves, share their creative aspects, contribute to their self-confidence, and create a demanding learning environment for students with its versatility (Hull, 2003).

Conclusion and Recommendations

Numerous research reports show that in recent years, the new skills necessary to prepare students for life in the digital age have become the focus of both education and business. Educational environments need to be significantly reorganized to develop 21st century skills to meet the demands of society and the global economy. In this context, the integration of educational technologies has become an area of great interest, especially in the last decade. In this context, digital storytelling can be described as an effective educational technology that can be used in today's classrooms that have almost all of the 21st century skills.

The advantage of students' individual differences in the teaching process is possible by creating movement areas where these differences can be put to work in the best way. At this point, digital storytelling as an environment includes multimedia interactions that allow individual differences to turn into an advantage in the teaching process. In addition, the digital storytelling process, which is created by fully matching individual differences with the technology to be used, also creates awareness for self-knowledge on behalf of the student. In other words, enabling different students to create an effective learning environment within the framework of their different competencies is among the most important advantages of digital storytelling in the process of developing techno-pedagogical content knowledge.

References

Abdel-Hack, E. M., & Helwa, H. S. A. A. (2014). Using digital storytelling and weblogs instruction to enhance EFL narrative writing and critical thinking skills among EFL majors at faculty of education. *Educational Research*, 5(1), 8-41. https://doi.org/10.14303/er.2014.011

Balaman-Uçar, S. (2016). *Dijital öykülemenin İngilizceyi yabancı dil olarak öğrenen öğrencilerin yazma becerilerine olan etkisi*. (Phd thesis), Hacettepe University, Ankara. National Thesis Center of the Council of Higher Education.

Bromberg, N. R., Techatassanasoontorn, A. A., & Andrade, A. D. (2013). Engaging students: Digital storytelling in information systems learning. *Pacific Asia Journal of the Association for Information Systems*, 5(1), 2. https://doi.org/10.17705/1pais.05101

Bull, G. & Kajder, S. (2004). Digital storytelling in the language arts classroom. *Learning & Leading with Technolog*y, 32(4), 46-49.

Dogan, B., & Robin, B. (2009, March). Educational uses of digital storytelling: Creating digital storytelling contests for K-12 students and teachers. In Society for Information Technology & Teacher Education International Conference (pp. 633-638).

Dreon, O., Kerper, R. M., & Landis, J. (2011). Digital storytelling: A tool for teaching and learning in the YouTube generation. *Middle School Journal*, 42(5), 4-10. https://doi.org/10.1080/00940771.2011.11461777

Emert, T. (2013). 'The transpoemations project': Digital storytelling, contemporary poetry, and refugee boys. *Intercultural Education*, 24(4), 355-365.

France, D., & Wakefield, K. (2011). How to produce a digital story. *Journal of Geography in Higher Education*, 35(4), 617-623. https://doi.org/10.1080/03098265.2011.560658

Garrety, C. M. (2008). Digital storytelling: An emerging tool for student and teacher learning. Iowa State University-Ames.

Gregori-Signes, C. (2008). Integrating the old and the new: Digital storytelling in the EFL language classroom. *Revista Para Profesores de Inglés*, 16(1), 43-49.

Hill, S., & Grinnell, C. (2014, October). Using digital storytelling with infographics in STEM professional writing pedagogy. In 2014 IEEE International Professional Communication Conference (IPCC) (pp. 1-7). IEEE

Hull, G. A. (2003). Youth culture and digital media: New literacies for new times. *Research in the Teaching of English*, 38 (2), ss. 229-233.

Karaoglu, S., Tao, R., Gevers, T., & Smeulders, A. W. (2016). Words matter: Scene text for image classification and retrieval. *IEEE transactions on multimedia*, 19(5), 1063-1076.

Lambert, J., (2010). Digital storytelling cookbook (3rd ed.) [DX Reader version]. https://www.storycenter.org/

Lantz, J. L., Myers, J., & Wilson, R. (2020). Digital storytelling and young children: Transforming learning through creative use of technology. In handbook of research on *integrating digital technology with literacy pedagogies* (pp. 212-231). IGI Global. doi:10.4018/978-1-7998-0246-4.ch010

Malita, L., & Martin, C. (2010). Digital storytelling as web passport to success in the 21st century. *Procedia-Social and Behavioral Sciences*, 2(2), 3060-3064. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.sbspro.2010.03.465

Robin, B. R. (2008). Digital storytelling: A powerful technology tool for the 21st century classroom. *Theory Into Practice*, 47(3), 220-228. https://doi.org/10.1080/00405840802153916

Robin, B. R. (2016). The power of digital storytelling to support teaching and learning. *Digital Education Review*, (30), 17-29.

Prensky, M. (2001). Digital natives, digital immigrants part 1. *On the Horizon*, 9(5), 1-6. https://doi.org/10.1108/10748120110424816

Sadik, A. (2008). Digital storytelling: A meaningful technology-integrated approach for engaged student learning. *Educational Technology Research and Development*, 56(4), 487-506. https://doi.org/10.1007/s11423-008-9091-8

Smeda, N., Dakich, E., & Sharda, N. (2014). The effectiveness of digital storytelling in the classrooms: a comprehensive study. *Smart Learning Environments*, 1(1), 1-21. https://doi.org/10.1186/s40561-014-0006-3

Xu, Y., Park, H., & Baek, Y. (2011). A new approach toward digital storytelling: An activity focused on writing self-efficacy in a virtual learning environment. *Journal of educational technology & society,* 14(4), 181-191.

Yang, Y. T. C., & Wu, W. C. I. (2012). Digital storytelling for enhancing student academic achievement, critical thinking, and learning motivation: A year-long experimental study. *Computers & Education*, 59(2), 339-352. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.compedu.2011.12.012

Yuksel-Arslan, P., Yildirim, S., & Robin, B. R. (2016). A phenomenological study: teachers' experiences of using digital storytelling in early childhood education. *Educational Studies*, 42(5), 427-445. https://doi.org/10.1080/03055698.2016.1195717

MOTHER TONGUE-BASED MULTILINGUAL EDUCATION: THE ATTITUDES AND CHALLENGES FACED BY HIGH SCHOOL AND SENIOR HIGH SCHOOL TEACHERS IN ZAMBOANGA DEL SUR

Friendly Mark H. Andrino
Mindanao State University – Marawi Campus
andrino.fh15@s.msumain.edu.ph
Orcid Number: 0000-0002-1555-8942

Nuje Mor S. Arsenal
Mindanao State University-Marawi Campus
arsenal.ns60@s.msumain.edu.ph
Orcid Number: 0000-0002-1819-9922

Bio-Profiles:

Friendly Mark H. Andrino is a 3rd year student pursuing Bachelor of Secondary Education Major in English at Mindanao State University—Marawi Campus. He is interested in pursuing studies on applied and theoretical linguistics as well as language education policy in the future.

Nuje Mor S. Arsenal is a 2nd year student pursuing Bachelor of Secondary Education Major in English at Mindanao State University—Marawi Campus. She is interested in pursuing studies on applied linguistics in the future.

ABSTRACT

The study illustrates the attitudes of public high school and senior high school teachers in Zamboanga del Sur, Philippines towards Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTBMLE) policy; the challenges they experienced that are attributed to it; and their suggestions in improving such language education policy. The study adapted the modified version of Ejieh's (2004) questionnaire, such modifications were done by Tonio and Ella (2019) in their study for it to fit in the Philippine educational context. Using Chronbach's Alpha, Tonio and Ella's (2019) modified questionnaire garnered a 0.80 rating for reliability. The questionnaire was administered online, and the data were obtained from 70 secondary teachers of sixteen (16) public high schools in the Zamboanga del Sur province. The data were analyzed using the frequency and mean computation as well as thematic analysis. The results indicate that generally, the teachers disagree that the MTB-MLE policy is in good principle as they believe that it will not make the lessons interesting to students, and that it will not enable them to understand their lessons easily. In addition, some of the most recurring challenges associated with the policy include reading and instruction comprehension difficulties, degradation of English language literacy and proficiency, language and/or communication barrier between the teacher and the students, poor vocabulary and other grammar issues, teaching difficulty in Math, and difficulty in learning a second language (L2). Some recommendations obtained from the participants include the call for additional funding and support to MTB-MLE teachers, abolishing the policy and switching to the old curriculum, and revising some aspects of the policy to better suit the linguistic diversity of the country.

Keywords: MTBLME, teachers, attitudes, challenges, recommendations

Introduction

Education in the Philippines undergoes quite a number of changes over time. One of the most monumental and yet radical change in the country's system of education is the implementation of the Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTB-MLE) Policy which was an inclusion in the K to 12 program as mandated by Republic Act 10533 (Philippines Department of Education, 2012). The MTB-MLE Policy orders the use of more than two languages to increase literacy and instruction in subjects like mathematics, science, health and social studies (Nolasco, 2018). In addition, this program seeks to deter if not to lessen the "high functional illiteracy of Filipinos" (Nolasco, 2018, p. 2 as cited in Medilo, 2018) wherein language is considered as an important contributing factor. It is believed that using mother tongue offers a myriad of positive impacts on education as it develops and encourages children's expressiveness, activeness, and participation in learning, (Berowa & Agbayani, 2019), it helps improve students' academic skills (Cummins, 2000; Thomas & Collier, 1997; Walter & Dekker, 2011 as cited in Burton, 2013), improves literacy and skills in the English language (Cummins, 2000 as cited in Burton, 2013), it helps students gain higher academic achievement (Walter & Dekker, 2011 as cited in

Burton, 2013), it develops critical thinking (Brock-Utne, 2006 as cited in Burton, 2013), and it enables stronger classroom participation (Benson, 2000; Dutcher, 1995 as cited in Burton, 2013), among others.

On the same note, Walter (2011 as cited in Medilo, 2018) argued that using mother tongue in education is of great importance because of its capability of producing proficient readers in a span of 2-3 years (Walter, 2011, p. 24) as well as its benefits to learners with average ability and potential. Although the positive impacts of MTB-MLE in education is extensive, Nolasco (2018) argues that the change in LOI in the educational curriculum will not be enough to ensure that the policy will function in a highly diverse and multilingual country like the Philippines. He posits that community support and empowerment as one of the defining factors of a successful implementation must be present. This claim also supports Naom and Sarah's (2014 as cited in Berowa & Agbayani, 2019) proposition that the goals of the program will only be realized when puts to the core the attitudes of teachers with the policy and not just the program implementation.

Baker (1988 as cited in Tonio & Ella, 2019), argues that when teachers think on the language they use in class, their views frequently emerge. Their attitudes, whether consciously or unconsciously, have a significant impact on the growth or deterioration, repair or destruction, of language. Meanwhile, Garrett (2010) defines attitude as a "disposition to react favorably or unfavorably to a class of objects" (p.20). Studies centered around teachers' attitudes regarding MTB-MLE and how their attitude affect the implementation process were conducted years after the policy's inception.

In 2013, Burton discovered that teachers' and parents' perceptions of MTB-MLE were mostly focused on the policy's short-term benefits and long-term disadvantages. In addition, the participants in the study expressed concerns as to how learning Bikol instead of English would implicate into their children's futures aside from expressing the overwhelming benefits that the policy might bring in terms of student learning.

Valerio's (2015) research indicated that teachers agree with the statements concerning MTB-MLE to a degree. Teachers are also unsure whether the instructional materials they currently have can ensure that students learn what they need to learn due to the lack of localized translation and concerns that mother tongue-based instruction will not improve students' academic performance in the long run, according to the study. Furthermore, according to Alieto's (2018) research, teachers have a slightly favorable view toward the mother tongue.

In 2019, Berowa and Agbayani revealed that teachers showed favorable attitudes towards the MTB-MLE policy despite the challenges they have at hand. Furthermore, Tonio and Ella's (2019) study found that pre-service teachers have a favorable attitude about adopting the mother tongue as the medium of instruction, that they support the policy's implementation, and that they are willing to attend training to teach in the mother tongue.

Alieto (2018) emphasized the importance of establishing positive attitudes among implementers in order to ensure a successful implementation of the policy. Additionally, Sutton and Levinson (2001) believe that teachers' attitude toward MTB-MLE should be given attention as they play key roles in the implementation and that their actions shape the policy. As a result, it is critical to include the perspectives of all stakeholders in various linguistic communities, as this aids in assessing language status and enacting language policies (Callan & Gallois,1987).

Taking the aforementioned evidence and reasons into consideration, this study investigates the attitudes of high school and senior high school public teachers who are at the receiving end of the MTB-MLE policy implementation. It also captures the challenges they face that are one way or another linked and related to the MTB-MLE implementation in the primary levels. Lastly, this research solicits suggestions and recommendations from teachers working in the frontlines teaching students who are products of the MTB-MLE policy from the bottom-up. Through this study, we aim not only to shed light on the attitudes of teachers but also to give a clearer picture on their experiences in the grassroots. We aim to discover the effects of the policy in the secondary education sector and to prove the veracity of claims pertaining to the benefits of using mother tongue in instruction as mentioned in previous studies backing up the goals and objectives of the policy. At the point of finality, utilizing the study's findings along with respondent recommendations, the study aims to offer input to policymakers for consideration to improve the policy implementation and as guidance as they issue directives that would alter and radically change the course of the country's educational quality.

1.2 Review of Related Literature and Study

1.2.1 Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTBMLE)

Language policy in the Philippines is a complex issue because of the linguistic and cultural diversity of its inhabitants (Tonio & Ella, 2019). Taking into consideration the more or less 7000 islands and 181 distinct languages, crafting and implementing language policies in the educational sector that could serve and cater to the

needs of the whole country becomes a challenge (Lewis, Simons, & Fennig, 2013). As a matter of practice, the country's educational curriculum undergoes a couple of revisions and modifications every ten years. As a result, language policies in the Philippines have changed dramatically and fluctuated over the previous century, with practically every generation having a distinct policy (Burton, 2013). In the recent years, the 1974 and 1987 Bilingual Education Policies institutionalized English and Filipino as the official languages of instruction albeit a great majority of the population do not use and speak both languages as their L1 (Burton, 2013).

The swift phases of changes in the Filipino society in terms of education and global demands pushed lawmakers to update the curriculum that could serve to the ever-changing demands of the 21st century (Valerio, 2015). With the challenges brought by the Bilingual Education Policy, the Department of Education (DepEd) in 2009, issued an order which insttutionalized the Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTB-MLE).

This order mandates the use of the learners' first language (L1) as the language of instruction (LOI) in all subject areas from pre-kindergarten to grade three, with Filipino and English taught as separate subjects, as it is thought to speed up the acquisition of literacy skills as indicated below:

> 1) Learners learn to read more quickly when in their first language (L1);
>
> 2) Pupils who have learned to read and write in their first language learn to speak, read, and write in a second language (L2) and third language (L3) more quickly than those who are taught in a second or third language first; and
>
> 3) In terms of cognitive development and its effects on other academic areas, pupils taught to read and write in their first language acquire such competencies more quickly (Philippines Department of Education, 2009, p. 1).

In 2012, a new order was issued stating the specific guidelines for MTB-MLE, such reform was embedded in the newly adopted K to 12 Basic Education Program (Philippines Department of Education, 2012). Twelve major languages were identified as languages of instruction (LOI) thereby prompting the shift to mother tongue instruction. The order also gave emphasis to the four areas of development that the new policy has a direct influence: (1) language development which serves as the foundation of a strong education that will lead to success both in school and in lifelong learning; (2) cognitive development which centers on students' Higher Order Thinking Skills (HOTS); (3) academic development which equips learners to take a full-on grasp and mastery of the competencies in different learning areas; and (4) socio-cultural awareness which evokes and enhances a sense of nationalism as well as pride of the student's heritage, language, and culture (Philippines Department of Education, 2012).

The potential benefits of mother tongue instruction especially for language minority students were revealed in several research studies conducted in the Philippines and elsewhere which prompted policy makers to revise the country's educational curriculum.

Ramires, Yuen, and Yamey (1991), Thomas and Collier's (1997) study in the United States, and a study conducted in the Philippines by Walter and Dekker (2011) showed similar results that students learn better and experience higher academic achievement when their first language (L1) is used in school as compared to learners who learn using their second or third language (L2 or L3). Such findings support the idea that strong first language skills help children's cognitive development and make it easier for them to navigate subject matter (Cummins, 2000; Mallozzi & Malloy, 2007).

In addition, other studies show learning a second language will become easy and efficient when it is founded on a learner's ability and understanding of their L1 (Cummins, 2000). Other studies conducted outside of the Western context, although with less methodological rigor, yielded similar results (Burton, 2013). One of the most prominent initiatives in the study of MTB-MLE is the Ife Project in Nigeria which ran from 1970-1978.

The study found that students who learned using their L1 for six years outperformed students who only learned in their L1 for three years in terms of overall academic achievement gains. Despite having had fewer years with English as the LOI, the first group showed no significant difference in English proficiency from the second group (Fafunwa, Macauley, & Sokoya, 1989 as cited in Burton, 2013 p. 28-29).

In the Philippines, the Lubuagan project, a longitudinal study conducted with grade one to three students in Lubuagan, Cordillera Mountains, aimed at finding out the relationship of academic proficiency and the use of mother tongue found out that students in the experimental schools (where mother tongue was used as the LOI) scored significantly higher in Math, Reading, Filipino, and English compared to their counterparts in the control group (Walter & Dekker, 2011).

Aside from enhanced academic abilities (Cummins, 2000; Thomas & Collier, 1997; Walter & Dekker, 2011 as cited in Burton, 2013), other benefits of education using the mother tongue include more participation inside the class (Benson, 2000; Dutcher, 1995 as cited in Burton, 2013); increased accessibility of education (Benson, 2004c; Smits, Huisman, & Kruijif, 2008 as cited in Burton, 2013); and development of critical thinking skills (Brock-Utne, 2006 as cited in Burton, 2013). Several researches also pointed out that education using the mother tongue impacts pride in terms of culture (Cummins, 2000; Wright and Taylor, 1995 as cited in Burton, 2013); increases participation of parents in the education of their students (Cummins, 2000; Dutcher, 1995; D'Emilio, 1995 as cited in Burton, 2013); and an increase in the achievement of girls (Benson, 2005; Hovens, 2002 as cited in Burton, 2013). In addition, one of the most notable benefits of mother tongue instruction is the foundation it provides in the acquisition of additional languages (Cummins, 2000; Thomas & Collier, 1997 as cited in Burton, 2013).

Language research in terms of attitude is an area of sociolinguistics that investigates and aims at providing critical information such as predicting language scene in multicultural areas where contact and competition exist (Wang & Ladegaard, 2008 as cited in Alieto, 2018), it also helps in understanding issues related to language like language maintenance or language shift (Letsholo, 2009). Moreover, studies on the determination of language attitudes help in determining language status and the institutionalization of language policies, adding to its essentiality (Callan & Gallois, 1987). It is very much important to look into the attitudes of teachers with regards the MTB-MLE considering their critical role in the success or failure of its implementation.

1.2.2 Teachers' Attitude towards Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education

Haugen (1956 as cited in Grosjean, 1982) argues that "whenever languages are in contact, one is likely to find certain prevalent attitudes of favor or disfavor towards the languages involved. These can have profound effect on the psychology of the individuals and on their use of the languages" (p.118). Language contact and competitions in multicultural areas are some of the important phenomena that language attitude research takes into account as this sociolinguistic inquiry (Wang & Ladegaard, 2018) helps us understand the nature of language and the issues related to it, which include but not limited to maintenance or shift (Letsholo, 2009). The Philippines, like many other countries worldwide, is a country where linguistic power struggle is inevitable since more than 180 languages are found in different sociolinguistic settings. People in regions and provinces far from Manila, for example, have some level of resistance to Filipino, the national language (Wa-Mbaleka, 2014), partly because Tagalog is probably the source of more than 90% of Filipino words and only one-third of Filipinos are proficient in Tagalog (Smolicz & Nical, 1997). Language attitude plays a vital role in accounting for which languages are learned, used, and preferred by bilinguals (Grosjean, 1982); and in the determination of the status of a language and in institutionalizing language policies (Callan & Gallois, 1987). In addition, awareness of language attitudes in communities with multicultural contexts are proven to have a significant role in the appropriation of language policies. Lastly, Jones (2012) asserts that attitudes toward a language as well as its use as the LOI affects the implementation of any policy.

As the Philippine educational system underwent a radical shift in its language policy through the adoption of the Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education wherein the language of instruction (LOI) was changed to mother tongue instead of Filipino/Tagalog and English alone (Philippines Department of Education, 2012), it is expected that this new language policy could afford Filipinos with a sustainable future (Gallego & Zubiri, 2013) through advanced cognitive development (Cummins, 2000; Mallozzi & Malloy, 2007 as cited in Burton, 2013), enhanced academic skills and achievement (Cummins, 2000; Thomas & Collier, 1997; Walter & Dekker, 2011 as cited in Burton, 2013), and improved literacy in gaining additional languages (Cummins, 2000; Thomas & Collier, 1997 as cited in Burton, 2013), among others, as mentioned in the previous part of the discussion.

However, Akinnaso (1993), in reviewing related literature and studies on programs based on the mother tongue, posits that positive results could not be guaranteed if the only consideration is the use of mother tongue alone. This supports Nolasco's (2008) claim that in the Philippine context, the change in LOI alone will not be enough for the MTB-MLE policy to work and yield favorable results. The way in which policies are implemented should be taken consideration in a local and national standpoint as scholars from anthropological traditions argue that in retrospect, top-down language policies give heavy footing and lean towards expert knowledge compared to local knowledge (Canagarajah, 2005; Rajagopalan, 2005). Although majority of the studies mentioned earlier validate the use of MTB-MLE, it however, does not give consideration or account towards the understanding of language learning in a local scale (Burton, 2013). It is imperative to understand that context plays a crucial role in shaping the policies to be implemented, and those who work on the ground level have their own knowledge, based on hands-on and context-specific experience about the strategies, may it be effective or not, even though they are mostly unrecognized in scholarly literature (Canagarajah, 1993; Pennycook, 1989 as cited in Burton, 2013, p. 29-30).

In the Philippine context of the MTB-MLE implementation, Nolasco (2008) cited community support as well as empowerment as one of the crucial conditions that needs to be met to ensure the success of the program, this was

further supported by Fullan (2003) and Shohamy (2006) arguing that less attention has been given to the grassroots level where implementation of the program will actually occur. Naom and Sarah (2014) argues that the MTB-MLE policy implementation are faced with major drawbacks which include but not limited to teacher preparedness, resources, and attitudes along with challenges of having a multilingual classroom. Nolasco (2008) also added that the attitude of teachers, may it be positive or negative, toward the use of mother tongue as the LOI are one of the most recurring issues in the implementation process, taking into consideration that teachers and parents are one of the key stakeholder groups playing integral roles for carrying out and enacting the educational policy are often forgotten in the process.

Teachers play an enormously vital role as they stand as frontliners in the implementation of any educational policy (Berowa & Agbayani, 2019). Any institution or system of education cannot successfully operate if not because of them, and that without their support and participation, any policy will be rendered as a good as a failure (Stone, 2012). This goes without saying that teachers' attitudes toward MTBMLE should be given attention since they shape and directly impact their students inside the classroom, in essence, their actions can be constituted as the policy in itself (Sutton & Levinson, 2001).

Seeing the importance of identifying teachers' attitudes toward the mother tongue education policy, several studies were conducted since the inception of the MTBMLE in 2012 to provide empirical data that would guide policymakers and individuals working in the education sector.

Burton's study in 2013 focused on the understanding, ideologies, and practices of both the teachers and parents as to how it correlates to the language policy of a national relevance being apportioned at the grassroots. In addition, it also analyzed the many challenges that teachers face as to the implementation of the policy. The study took place in one of the school districts in Bikol, Philippines. Given that they were the only group who have implemented the MTB-MLE, the study focused on teachers in the Grade 1 level. The study discovered that teachers' and parents' perceptions of MTB-MLE were mostly focused on the policy's short-term benefits and long-term disadvantages. Aside from expressing the overwhelming benefits of the policy in terms of student learning, the participants also expressed concerns as to how learning Bikol instead of English would implicate into their children's futures. Additionally, she pointed out the choice that policy makers have, whether they would release top-down directives that oftentimes do not consider local contexts where teachers, parents, and other key stakeholders play critical roles, and where policy implementation takes place, or they can be involved in making decisions regarding which policy will be implemented and vetoed.

In 2015, Valerio conducted a study under the same light—to determine the perceptions of Grades 1-3 teachers regarding the mother tongue-based instruction in the country. The study gathered data from 64 elementary teachers from the province of Quirino, Philippines where a major number of respondents were Ilokano. The study found out that the teachers slightly agree with the statements regarding the MTBE. In addition, one of the key revelations stated in the study is the respondents' lack of confidence as to the instructional materials they presently have and use whether it can ascertain or not their appreciation of the policy since localized translations are mostly unavailable. They were also unsure if the use of mother tongue in instruction can improve and elevate academic performance.

Alieto in 2018 explored the language attitudes and willingness of pre-service teachers regarding the use of mother tongue as the LOI. His study found out that the respondents' 'slightly positive' attitude towards the policy can be understood as a development towards progress in the development of attitudes certain indigenous languages. He also pointed out the willingness of pre-service teachers in using mother tongue as the LOI in the primary level of education. He further stressed the necessity of ensuring positive attitudes of key implementers to yield success in implementing the MTB-MLE.

In 2019, Berowa and Agbayani, as well as Tonio and Ella conducted similar studies on the attitudes of teachers and pre-service teachers. Berowa and Agbayani (2019) found out that teachers in the primary grades showed favorable attitude towards the MTB-MLE despite the myriad challenges they face in terms of instructional and learning materials. Their finding is quite synonymous to that of Tonio and Ella's (2019), as the former pointed out that pre-service teachers enrolled in Elementary Education veered positive attitude regarding the policy and that they are willing to undergo training in teaching using the mother tongue while implying support for the newly instituted language policy in education.

There is no doubt that indeed, it is important to determine the attitudes of teachers as to the LOI in both the teaching and learning process as it influences policy implementation (Jones, 2012), and that a common MOI is necessary in facilitating communication among the teacher and the students (Ejieh, 2004) which contributes to success in terms of implementing the MTB-MLE policy. Therefore, there is a need to know what is happening at the bottom of the process in order to make sound decisions as to where the MTB-MLE program is headed since the key implementors are situated in the community level. However, previous studies like the ones mentioned in this

chapter only focused on the attitudes and perceptions of teachers and pre-service teachers in the primary/elementary levels, thereby creating a gap in the general understanding of the attitudes of teachers in the country in general.

As the first few batches of learners taught in the mother tongue reach high school, it is important to seek the attitudes of teachers in the secondary level as it may give policy makers a glimpse of how the MTB-MLE policy is doing and how it impacted the current state of the educational system. It will also determine what the teachers in the secondary level feel and the challenges they face as the receiving end since the MTB-MLE policy is primarily implemented in the primary level. Although the policy has garnered quite a few recognitions and accolades since the country was able to follow the trail of the worldwide trend, it is also undeniably true that the opposing side of the implementation presents valid arguments. The current research will also try to delve deeper into that and see if there are teachers in the secondary level who oppose the policy implementation. Furthermore, it will solicit ideas and recommendations from the educators who have firsthand teaching experience of students under MTB-MLE in order to better implement the policy. This study will also address the paucity of literature regarding the MTB-MLE policy in the Philippine context and will guide the current language policy as to the areas that are in dire need of attention.

Research Questions

The current study attempted to provide answers to the succeeding questions:

1. What is the attitude of high school teachers with regards to the implementation of MTBMLE in the primary grades?

2. What are the problems/challenges that students and teachers are facing in the secondary level that are one way or another linked to the MTB-MLE implementation?

1.3 Theoretical Framework

This section discusses the theoretical perspectives that will be used in analyzing the attitudes of high school teachers in Zamboanga del Sur regarding the Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTB-MLE). This study is guided by two different frameworks: the Socio-Educational Model of Gardner (1985) and the Language Policy Theory of Spolsky (2011).

The Socio-Educational Model

Robert Gardner in 1985 constructed this model under the idea that learning a particular language is built upon the identify of learners themselves, which enables them in adapting and operating in new environments. In the model, four different but interrelated variables were presented, these include social milieu (which pertains to the culture as well as the environment of an individual), individual difference (like level of intelligence, aptitude, motivations, and unique environments), L2 acquisition context (may it be formal or informal), and outcomes (both linguistic and non-linguistic skills).

In social psychology, a learner's individual characteristics are considered of high value and significance in language learning, as the model suggests. Gardner (1985) posited in viewing motivation, a tripartite complex or perspective must be used, and that certain characteristics of learners must be present to facilitate language learning including the learners desire towards learning, the effort they exert to learn, and a display of positive attitude towards learning.

The model also postulates that attitudes deemed to be educationally and socially relevant can influence motivation. These attitudinal constructs can be best understood by looking at how learners display their attitude toward the learning situation and/or environment, particularly the classroom set-up or the school environment, textbooks and other course materials, assessment strategies employed by the teacher, and the assessment and evaluation of both the language teacher and the course. Additionally, this construct acknowledges the difference between a skilled teacher and a less skilled teacher in terms of the target language where the former has a good grasp and the latter with less proficiency (Tonio & Ella, 2019). The willingness, interest, and openness towards learning the target language in the community for socialization and cultural learning are reflected in the attitudinal construct of integrativeness (Berowa, 2012; Berowa, 2016b; Berowa, Devanadera, & David, 2018; and Lovato, 2011 as cited in Tonio & Ella, 2019). This give clear emphasis on the learner's ability to understand the language as well as the culture of a community that the learner is unfamiliar with (Lovato, 2011 as cited in Tonio & Ella, 2019).

Furthermore, motivation and attitude and their interdependent relationship were also stipulated in the model. These two variables go hand in hand and has a direct or indirect influence toward successful language learning in both formal and informal settings (Gardner, 1985).

Language Policy Theory

Bernard Spolsky (2011) proposed a theory of language arguing that a language policy theory's goal must be built upon accounting the choices made by individual speakers basing on patterns which are rule-governed and at the same time recognized by their respective speech communities. Circumscribed in the theory are three assumptions, one of which views language policy as a social phenomenon created in different domains like homes, schools, and the community. The second assumption assumes the presence of beliefs, practices, and management as three separate but interrelated components. The third assumption takes into account both internal and external factors affecting language choice. As per Spolsky's (2011) suggestion, these assumptions may come from different directions, either from within or outside the domain and may be language-related or not.

Building on this theory, Burton (2019) suggests that the three components of language policy must be given closer attention (Burton, 2019). Beliefs, sometimes interchangeably referred to as ideology, explain the values held by speech community members toward language and language use. Spolsky (2004) described it as — "what people think should be done" (p. 14). Although a certain speech community possesses many beliefs, a dominant and common ideology favoring an approach to language is still present.

The language selections or actions that people make are referred to as practices. Practices are often described in terms of phonology (sound and sound patterns), morphology (word), syntax (or the grammatical choices enacted inside the community), as well as the sociolinguistic aspect which include societal rules about when and where language varieties should be used. The interaction between language and social environment which is also known as the 'ecology of language' shape the practices of a certain speech community (Haugen, 1972; Spolsky, 2004).

Efforts made either deliberately or not to influence language practices is referred to as management. It is also oftentimes called language planning, which gives emphasis on the interventions carried out to shape the way policies are enacted. This component of language policy is most associated with individuals or documents possessing legal authority. A written legislation supporting or obstructing a language policy is one of the many examples (Burton, 2019)

In conclusion, the socio-educational model clearly established the interdependent relationship between motivation and attitude and that both variables affect one another. Through this lens, the current study hopes to capture the attitudes of high school and senior high school teachers towards MTB-MLE by looking into the motivations that drive them to feel the way they do towards the policy, specifically, the study would illustrate and reveal the challenges that they face that are attributed to the implementation of the policy. On a different note, using Spolsky's language policy theory, the study will try to elucidate how the three component of language policy namely beliefs, practices, and management come into play and how each component shapes every policy that is enacted or put into law. These theories will help in explaining the cause-and-effect phenomena that is happening in the education sector by delving into the experiences of educators who are handling students taught using the mother tongue during their primary years in education. Additionally, the recommendations that will be gathered through this study correlates to the management component of Spolsky's language policy theory. If such recommendations will be taken into account and put into work, then it would act as an intervention that will shape the way the policy is enacted.

1.4 Significance of the Study

This study is of significance to both the teachers who are handling subjects in MTB-MLE as it will help them get a glimpse of the teaching strategies they have implemented, whether they are beneficial and successful or not. It will also help them gauge and develop effective ways on how to inculcate lessons that will ensure that students learn what they ought to learn so they become competent individuals as they reach higher levels of their academic journey. The results of this study will also be beneficial to curriculum planners and educational policymakers as it will give them a clearer picture of the areas that needs attention, it will also help them assess and reassess the measures they put into place to ensure the efficacy and see if the MTB-MLE policy achieved its goals. Lastly, this study will help future researchers in the field as it will serve them as a reference to the body of knowledge under the umbrella of applied linguistics, especially in the areas concerning education.

Methodology

2.1 Research Design

To fully grasp and gather quantifiable and reliable data, a qualitative design was employed in the present study. Shank (2002 as cited in Ospina, 2004) defines qualitative research as "a form of systematic empirical inquiry into meaning" (p. 5). By systematic he insinuates "planned, ordered and public", adhering regulations agreed upon by delegates of the qualitative research community. Empirical, means that this variety of inquiry is substantiated in the world of experience. Through inquiry, researchers try to understand how others make sense of their experience. Additionally, Denzin and Lincoln (2000 as cited in Ospina, 2004) claim that qualitative research involves an interpretive and naturalistic approach: "This means that qualitative researchers study things in their natural settings, attempting to make sense of, or to interpret, phenomena in terms of the meanings people bring to them" (p. 3). Using this research design, the researchers strategically gathered rich, relevant, and related data that will show the teachers' attitudes toward the MTB-MLE policy as well as the challenges they face that are attributed to it, and the recommendations they have to improve its implementation.

2.2 Research Setting

The present study took place in various public high schools in the Zamboanga del Sur province namely Bag-ong Valencia Agricultural National High School (2), Bibibilik National High School (2), Bululawan National High School (1), Dulop National High School Bag-ong Valencia Extension (2), Dumalinao National High School (1), Dumingag National High School (5), Francisco P. Consolacion Natioal High School (5), Lison Valley National High School (1), Mecolong National High School (1), Napolan National High School (4), Nilo National High School (2), Pagadian City Science High School (5), Rebokon Agricultural and Vocational High School (8), San Pedro National High School (12), Sta. Lucia National High School (1), and Zamboanga del Sur National High School (18). The Department of Education Zamboanga del Sur Division, in compliance with the mandate of DepEd National Office, implemented the MTB-MLE policy pursuant to DO 16, s. 2012 – Guidelines on the Implementation of the Mother Tongue-Based- Multilingual Education (MTB-MLE).

The research locale was chosen because of the wide diversity of ethnic groups found in the area as well as the languages that each group has and use. In fact, according to the Philippine Statistics Authority (previously known as the National Statistics Office) 2000 census, it has been found out that Cebuano was the predominant ethnic group of the province. Of the overall household populace, 40.20 percent categorized themselves as Cebuanos, which was succeeded closely by Bisaya/Binisaya forming 32.27 percent, then Subanen which is at 9.00 percent. Hiligaynon/Ilonggo, Maguindanaon, Tausug, and other distinctive ethnic groups form the remaining 18.53% (Philippine Statistics Authority, 2002). Additionally, with the directive issued by the Department of Education pertaining to the implementation of the MTB-MLE policy, DepEd Region 9 Director Walter Albos urged all elementary school administrators to use Cebuano, the major vernacular spoken in Western Mindanao as the language of instruction in teaching kindergarten and Grades 1 to 3 in the schools within the region (Dumlao, 2012). Lastly, the research locale was chosen for ease of access to research participants since both researchers are bonafide residents of the area and also because one researcher has a significantly wide network of contacts and connections to educators teaching in the province.

2.3 Respondents of the Study

The respondents were selected using criterion sampling. Criterion sampling enables researching on conditions or with resolute participants in line with the specified criteria to stipulate rich related data (Patton, 1990). In this respect, the criteria included (1) being a secondary school teacher, (2) teaches at a public high school, (3) teaching within the Zamboanga del Sur province. The study involved 70 public high school teachers in Zamboanga del Sur. Since this study aims at bridging the gap and providing a clearer picture as to how teachers in the country perceive the MTB-MLE policy in general, it is imperative to find out the attitudes of high school teachers who is at the receiving end of the program mainly because previous studies like the ones conducted by Valerio (2015), Alieto (2018), Medilo (2018), Berowa and Agbayani (2019), and Tonio and Ella (2019) conducted under the same light only focused on finding out the attitudes of pre-service and elementary/primary teachers. In addition, the participants will also provide in-depth and real-time update as to the challenges they are facing related to the MTB-MLE policy implementation.

2.4 Instrument of the Study

The survey questionnaire was adapted and modified from Tonio and Ella (2019) to fit the context of the present study, which they also adapted and modified from Ejieh (2004) to fit the Philippine context. Using Cronbach's Alpha, Tonio and Ella's (2019) modified version garnered a reliability rating of 0.80 and settled for a 4-point Likert Scale that contrasted from strongly agree to strongly disagree as a replacement for of yes/no response. The

survey questionnaire has four divisions. The first part, asked respondents to provide apropos personal data such as their name, gender, age, and years of service. Meanwhile, the 13 statements were enlisted on the second part of the questionnaire and are made up of two levels; Level 1 includes items one to 12 which sought the opinions of the teachers on some concerns and problems associated to teaching and learning in mother tongue such as the benefits it offers to students, teachers and parents, as well as the restrictions and limitations of instruction. On the other hand, Level 2 is made up of item 13 which delve into the teachers' readiness to go through training in mother tongue instruction. Additionally, the researchers decided to opt out the 14th statement of Tonio and Ella's (2019) questionnaire as it does not apply to the participants of the current study. Part 3 is composed of two open-ended questions wherein for the first one the teachers were asked to list at least three challenges/possible challenges they encountered in handling/teaching students using the policy, while the second question tasked them to list three possible recommendations in order to better implement the MTB-MLE policy in the country.

2.5 Procedure

In adherence with research ethics procedures, the researchers first pursued the approval of the paper adviser/professor for ELE125 – Language Programs and Policies in Multilingual Societies through letter of communication before the survey was administered.

Since this study employed criterion sampling, the researchers made use of their various networks by contacting their high school teachers and by asking help from them in sharing the survey to their work colleagues. In addition, one of the researchers has contacts from various public high schools in the province after conducting several roadshows and information drive about an exchange scholarship program he's a part of, making the search for qualified participants easier and more convenient.

During the conduct of the study, the survey questionnaire was encoded in a Google Form Sheet along with a letter asking permission from the participants to answer the survey. In addition, the Google Form also contained information about the research i.e, its background and what it aims to accomplish. The researchers then sent the Google Form link to the participants via email and through Facebook Messenger. The participants are given an ample amount of time to complete the survey, the researchers automatically received the answers through a Spreadsheet provided by Google Forms.

After the data gathering procedure, the researchers then proceeded to analyzing the data, which will be discussed in the following section.

2.6 Methods of Analysis

The data obtained were tabulated, computed, and analyzed using descriptive statistics, particularly through the use of the mean used in the study of Tonio and Ella (2019) to identify the attitudes of the participants if they strongly agree, agree, disagree, and strongly disagree on the implementation of the MTB-MLE policy. The mean results will be interpreted using this range of interpretation: a mean score of 0.01-0.99 equates to a descriptive equivalent of "strongly agree", a mean score of 1.0-1.99 equates to a descriptive equivalent of "agree", while a mean score of 2.0-2.99 equates to a descriptive equivalent of "disagree", and a mean score of 2.99-3.99 equates to a descriptive equivalent of "strongly disagree". In addition, in order to analyze the challenges, the teachers faced by the teachers that are related to the MTB-MLE policy, the researchers used frequency count and thematic analysis to figure out and see recurring and dominant themes which will then be categorized and arranged and presented together with its sub-themes.

Results and Discussion

The attitudes of teachers, being one of the key stakeholders in any educational policy, is very important as it determines their behavior and classroom practices implemented within the walls of the academe. Thus, looking at their attitudes would help shape any policy in terms of implementation efficacy and evaluation. In order to determine the attitudes of the respondents toward MTB-MLE in the current study, the weighted mean scores were determined as presented in following table.

Table 1 *Attitude of high school and senior high school teachers towards Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTB-MLE)*

Statement	SA	A	D	SD	Mean	DE
1. A policy on the use of mother tongue in the Philippine primary schools (Grade 1-3) is good in principle.	16	36	16	2	2.06	D
2. It is possible to teach all primary school subjects from Grade 1-3 in the mother tongue or language of the local community.	14	31	20	5	2.23	D
3. It is possible to teach my own subjects completely in mother tongue.	9	22	29	10	2.57	D
4. Teaching in mother tongue will enable teachers to express themselves clearly in class.	12	43	9	6	2.13	D
5. Teaching in mother tongue will enable pupils/students to understand easily.	13	40	14	3	2.10	D
6. It will make lessons interesting to pupils/students.	11	39	14	6	2.21	D
7. It will enable students to perform well in English language in the future.	9	23	28	10	2.56	D
8. It will enable parents to participate in the education of their children.	12	44	12	2	2.06	D
9. All technical terms and expressions in my subject area(s) can be easily translated into mother tongue.	7	18	30	15	2.76	D
10. Textbooks for teaching my own subjects can easily be produced in mother tongue.	6	21	31	12	2.70	D
11. My education and training, which have been in English, will not interfere with my teaching students in mother tongue.	9	36	16	9	2.36	D
12. Use of mother tongue in teaching will degrade the teaching profession in the Philippines.	7	18	34	11	2.70	D
13. I am willing to undergo any special training that will enable me to teach in mother tongue.	19	36	8	7	2.04	D

Legend: *SA – strongly agree; A – agree; D – Disagree; SD – Strongly Disagree*
DE – descriptive equivalent

As presented, all the statements indicate that teachers in the secondary and senior high school levels have unfavorable attitude towards the implementation and use of the Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education (MTB-MLE) policy as each statement garnered a weighted mean ranging from 2.04 being the lowest value up to 2.76 as the highest value, respectively, which equates to a descriptive equivalent of "DISAGREE".

Based on the findings, it is safe to claim that high school and senior high school teachers disagree on the notion that the use of mother tongue as the language of instruction in Grades 1-3 is in good principle as they believe that it will not make the lessons interesting to students, and that it will not enable them to understand their lessons easily. This contradicts Gallego and Zubiri's (2013) idea that academic competence can be accomplished by means of utilizing the native tongue, and that of Naom and Sarah (2014) who opines that the exclusive use of language that is common and familiar to the learners, develops linguistic skills helping them to easily navigate academic activities and facilitate learning. In addition, the above-mentioned finding is very much antonymous to Sario, Guiab, and Palting's (2014 as cited in Medilo, 2018) study which found that using mother tongue in the classroom improved students' participation, interaction, and made them more active, it also gave them a sense of belongingness and enhanced their receptiveness.

The more competitive, advanced, and rigorous academic environment of the secondary level, the wide use of English as one of the main languages of the academe, and the increasing local and global demand for fluent speakers of the language which signify upward mobility could be the possible reason behind this finding. Additionally, the finding posits that majority of the teachers do not use the mother tongue to explain complex ideas in the classroom, instead they use the common L2 which can either be Filipino or English, depending on the necessity of the language.

The teachers' response on items 3 and 9 which contained the statements *'It is possible to teach my own subjects completely in mother tongue'* and *'All technical terms and expressions in my subject area(s) can be easily*

translated into mother tongue' garnered a mean score of 2.57 and 2.76 which has a descriptive equivalent of DISAGREE is a clear manifestation of their negative attitude on the use of mother tongue especially in subjects that require teachers to use, and on the part of the students, to learn a second language (L2) like in Science, Mathematics, and English where the English language is used primarily as the LOI, and Filipino where Filipino is used, respectively. This correlates to the findings of Dio and Jamora (2014 as cited in Medilo, 2018) that teachers encountered problems of transmuting technical terms in mathematics, which stems from their incapability of translating technical terms to the dialect, which in due course leads to misunderstandings and weak outcomes in English-mediated standardized tests. Happens when using technical jargons especially in mathematics and science subjects since there are occasions where no corresponding word equivalents in the mother tongue that exist for a specific term in the subject. These instances may generate, which may ultimately create an impediment for the students during standardized examinations that use English as the medium. Such beliefs can be traced back by the lack of teacher training for those who handle MTB-MLE subjects. Although it's true that some words in English do not have an equivalent or a counterpart in the mother tongue, teachers should be equipped with strategies that they can employ if in case they encounter problems like this. In addition, throughout the policy implementation, it has been found out that there has been a lack of learning materials that are designed specifically for the subjects under MTB-MLE, hence, the issue on translation and difficulty experienced by students in standardized teste where English is used as the medium came to the fore.

The respondents also see the difficulty experienced by teachers who teach using mother tongue as the LOI as they believe that it is not possible to teach all primary school subjects in Grades 1-3 in the mother tongue or the language of the local community and that there is a distinct lack of learning materials that accommodate the needs of the execution of the policy. This is in unison with the idea stressed by Hall (2010 as cited in Lartec et al., 2014) that teaching will, in no account, be effectual without pertinent and precise usage of learning materials. In the same study, Lartec, et al. (2014 as cited in Tonio & Ella, 2019) it was found out that teachers teaching mother tongue combated complications due to the absence of books written in mother tongue, scarcity of vocabulary, and lack of teacher-training. Likewise, the above results support Valerio's (2015) findings which disclosed teachers' uncertainty with the instructional materials they have due to lack of localized translation. Also, of the difficulty undergone by in-service teachers in teaching the learners who are culturally unaccustomed with the same mother tongue that can be trailed to the level of proficiency of the teachers of the distinctive dialects (Valerio, 2015). Such findings were also common in the studies conducted by Berowa and Agbayani (2019) and Tonio and Ella (2019) which found out that teachers face a myriad of challenges brought about by the lack of teaching and instructional materials.

On the same note, the respondents believe that using mother tongue in the primary years will not enable students to excel and perform better in using the English language in the future. This is not a very surprising finding, in fact, Mahboob and Cruz (2013 as cited in Medilo, 2018) in their study presented the language scene in the Philippines wherein people deem English as the premium language with Filipino and other local languages relegated to the background. This supports Khejeri's (2014 as cited in Alieto, 2018) claim that there has been a greater importance accorded to English over the mother tongue. As Paulson Stone (2012 as cited in Berowa and Agbayani, 2019) claim, Filipino teachers believe that they are linguistically equipped in using Filipino and English as the LOI, however, they feel uncomfortable in using them inside the classroom as it confines the involvement of the learners when foreign languages are used. Such findings can also be observed in Jha's (2013 as cited in Medilo, 2018) study wherein participants expressed concerns that using mother tongue will impair the quality of English that they use and have.

Additionally, it is worth mentioning that the teachers do not believe that using mother tongue will degrade the quality of education in the country. Although majority of the responses acquired in the questionnaire veered toward a negative attitude regarding mother tongue education, this finding is quite surprising because it implies that there is a great chance that something can still be done to improve teachers' attitude and reception of the policy. This finding can be used as a starting point in finding ways in developing strategies that will lead to better policy implementation.

Interestingly, the respondents believe that using mother tongue will not enable teachers in expressing themselves clearly when they teach their lessons which goes against Ejieh's (2004) claim that using mother tongue as the medium led to better communication as well as understanding.

The discoveries of the present study corroborate with the findings of international studies. Ejieh (2004 as cited in Alieto, 2018) surveyed student teachers in Nigeria, wherein the respondents exhibited a negative attitude towards teaching mother tongue in basic education. In addition, 80 out of the 95 respondents, are unwilling to teach using mother tongue after they graduate from college. Khejeri (2014 as cited in Alieto, 2018) noted the negative attitude of the teachers concerning mother tongue as they view English to be of greater importance. This negativity has been translated to the employment of the mother tongue policy in Hamis, district of Kenya. The teachers' negative

language attitude is well-thought-out as the reason for the halfhearted reception towards the mother tongue policy (Khejeri, 2014).

Table 2 *Challenges faced by high school and senior high school teachers that are related to the MTB-MLE implementation*

Problem	ƒ	%	Rank
Reading and comprehension difficulties among students	21	24.42	1
Degradation of English language literacy and proficiency	17	19.77	2
Translation issues/difficulties	12	13.95	3
Language/communication barrier between the teacher and the students	11	12.79	4
Lack of teacher training, support, and instructional materials	8	9.30	5
Poor vocabulary and other grammar issues	8	9.30	5
Teaching difficulty in Math	4	4.65	7
Difficulty in learning L2	3	3.49	8
Filipino/Tagalog language literacy and proficiency	2	2.33	9
TOTAL	**86**	**100**	

Legend: ƒ – frequency

The data obtained in this study also illustrated the challenges that high school and senior high school teachers faced and are facing in teaching students that are products of the Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education policy in the primary levels. As can be seen on the findings above, the primary challenge that educators in the secondary level face is the reading comprehension difficulties among students along with issues in the degradation of students' English literacy and proficiency, and translation issues and/or difficulties, among others.

Rasinski (2017) defines reading comprehension as "understanding [of] what one reads, can reasonably be seen as the goal of reading" (p. 519). In a nutshell, reading comprehension plays an important role in facilitating and ensuring that students learn what they ought to learn inside the classroom. The following excerpts provide bases for the claim as to how the present study came up with why reading comprehension difficulties is at the top of the list of challenges that educators in the secondary level have identified:
1. *Students in high school have more difficulty in reading comprehension.*
2. *Students' comprehension of learning materials written in English might be affected.*
3. *[The] use of different dialects with different meanings will cause confusion on the part of the students.*
4. *Difficulty in understanding terms.*
5. *They will have a hard time to comprehend English and Filipino.*

On a different note, many countries around the world implemented strong English language policies since it is believed to help alleviate social, economic, and political problems, inter alia (Hillman, 2015; Kirkpatrick, 2014 as cited in Namanya, 2017), and the Philippines is not an exemption. In fact, the Bilingual Education Policies mandated the use of Filipino and English as the LOI to be used in schools, this educational policy became the backbone of every educational institution in the country from 1974 to 1987 (Burton, 2013). However, the policy was replaced by the newly implemented MTB-MLE policy, along with the implementation of the K12 Program. With more and more countries shifting to the use of mother tongue as the language of instruction in the primary years, there have been fears of degradation in terms of literacy and proficiency of the English language among students. In fact, the adverse effects of MTB-MLE on people's English literacy have been observed in a couple of studies wherein the ground for such claim was laid out. Li and Majhanovich (2010 as cited in Namanya, 2017) postulates that MTB-MLE decreases individuals' amount of exposure to the English language, thus adversely affecting their proficiency in English. On the same note, in countries like the Philippines and Indonesia where there exists quite a number of local languages, the number of materials utilizing the mother tongue is significantly low, which may pose a threat in the development of students' macroskills (Alberto, Gabinete, & Ranola, 2010; Wa-Mbaleka 2014b, 2015 as cited in Namanya, 2017).

Furthermore, teachers have to resort to English since many concepts lack equivalents in the diverse mother tongues in the Philippines (Medilo, 2016). Teachers also are deprived from trainings in providing instruction in the mother tongue which may alter the eminence of instruction provided to students (Medilo, 2016; Wa-Mbaleka, 2014a, 2014b, 2015 as cited in Namanya, 2017). In these cases, MTB-MLE may hinder individuals' attainment of skills and information. In an experimental study conducted by Namanya in 2017, it has been found out that MTB-MLE may indeed adversely affect children's English literacy which may affect their chances of fighting in the world of works. The findings of the aforementioned studies are synonymous to the present study. The following excerpts provide bases for this claim:

1. *Less English proficiency.*
2. *Low English literacy.*
3. *Some students will not be fluent in English in written and in oral form.*
4. *Difficulty in explaining/defining/constructing ideas using English as the medium.*
5. *[Difficulty] with transition to English instruction.*

Lastly, Kelly (2005 as cited in Tonio & Ella, 2019) defined translation as "the skill of understanding the source text and rendering it in the target language by using the register, the background knowledge, and other language resources according to the intended purpose" (p.26-27), it recommends that translation process necessitates the translator's high level of proficiency both in subject language (English) and target language (mother tongue). In the case of the present study, one of the major challenges faced by the respondents are translation issues, this claim is backed up by the excerpts obtained from the respondents:

1. *Difficulty in translation of terms.*
2. *Some terms [that are] used in English are difficult to translate in mother tongue.*
3. *Difficulty in translating mother tongue to English in both speaking and writing.*
4. *Lisud sabton ang ubang terminologies sa mga bata / Some terminologies are hard for the students to understand.*
5. *Some terms do not have corresponding equivalent translation.*

The aforementioned findings of the current study support the drawbacks mentioned and well-outlined by previous studies on MTB-MLE (Tonio & Ella, 2019; Berowa & Agbayani, 2019, and Cruz, 2015) showing the following challenges: 1) difficulty in translation, 2) degradation of the English language, 3) lack of learning materials/resources, and 4) majority of the instructional objectives in the mother tongue subject are not being satisfactorily met, especially in the areas of grammar awareness, vocabulary development, and reading comprehension. With these challenges at hand, the current study sought the respondents' suggestion and/or recommendations to better implement the policy from the ground-up.

Table 3 *Suggestions to better implement the MTB-MLE policy*

Suggestions	f	%	Rank
More support for MTB-MLE teachers through seminars and increase in funds for instructional materials	12	22.64	1
Abolish the MTB-MLE policy	8	15.09	2
Use mother tongue as the language of instruction in specific subjects only	3	5.66	4.5
Choose a common MT for specific regions and create a mother tongue team to supervise the MTB-MLE implementation in the primary levels	3	5.66	4.5
No code switching on subjects using English as medium of instruction i.e., English, Mathematics, and Science.	3	5.66	4.5
Continue the MTB-MLE implementation	3	5.66	4.5
Filipino should be taught using Filipino and/or Tagalog	2	3.77	10
Use standardized materials in teaching using the mother tongue	2	3.77	10
Conduct additional studies to find out the effectivity of MTB-MLE policy	2	3.77	10
Abolish the MTB-MLE policy and switch to the old curriculum	2	3.77	10
Review the policy and assess its relevance and usefulness in the current setting.	2	3.77	10
Continue the implementation. However, there should be a strong reinforcement in the teaching of English and Filipino from the 4th Grade onwards.	2	3.77	10
Mix English with mother tongue in teaching	2	3.77	10
Revise some areas of the curriculum	1	1.89	17
There should be an increase in parental support and involvement	1	1.89	17
Switch to teaching English in the primary levels	1	1.89	17
Conduct diagnostic tests before using MTB-MLE in a specific subject	1	1.89	17
Filipino and English should be the medium of instruction, mother tongue should only be used to clarify and explain important points	1	1.89	17
Abolish MTB-MLE but integrate the use of mother tongue in subjects/areas whenever it is needed	1	1.89	17
Revise the current MTB-MLE policy and implement it to the 1st grade only	1	1.89	17
	53	100	

Legend: *f – frequency*

Since teachers stand as frontliners in any educational policy (Berowa & Agbayani, 2019) and that they work in the grassroots which means that any policy implemented would either fail or succeed if not for their cooperation, it is very much important to hear what they have to say with regards to the implementation of the MTB-MLE policy and solicit possible recommendations as they themselves have personal accounts and experiences on the areas that are overlooked, and also because of the fact that it is them who are at the receiving end of the program. Out of all the recommendations shown above, three major themes were classified which include more support for MTB-MLE teachers, abolish the MTB-MLE policy, and revise and/or modify the policy to suit the varying needs of different educational locations in the country.

More support for MTB-MLE teachers

The triumph or failure of the MTB-MLE program profoundly depends on the support and prioritization of the national government and the political will of the Department of Education in providing the needs of the key stakeholders which include but are not limited to teachers and students (Medilo, 2018). Therefore, there is a need to look into the current resources that MTB-MLE teachers have in order for them to work and perform their duties effectively and successfully. The government, through the mandate of the Department of Education should align, allocate, and increase funds that will be used to purchase books and other learning materials that correlates to the objectives of the MTB-MLE policy guidelines. To show support to teachers, the respondents wrote that the government should *"increase funds", "craft MTB-MLE appropriate books and learning materials",* and *"strengthen and equip teachers through trainings and workshops on how to effectively implement the objectives of the policy"*. Wa-Mbaleka (2014a as cited in Berowa & Agbayani, 2019) proposed that sufficient budget must be allocated to tackle the challenges about MTB-MLE since the policy met challenges that hampered it in attaining its desired objectives.

Abolish the MTB-MLE policy

Among all the studies mentioned in this research, this finding remains as one of the most surprising one. Although in the study conducted by Valerio (2015), Alieto (2018), Tonio and Ella (2019), and Berowa and Agbayani (2019) among others, participants have expressed subtle issues with the implementation of the MTB-MLE policy along with some of their recommendations on how to implement the policy better, however, there have been no mention from the respondents of the aforementioned studies on the abolishment and stoppage of the implementation of the policy. In order to verify the veracity of this claim, the following are the responses written by the respondents:

> **Respondent 12:** MTB MLE is a program to bridge the students to speak   [the] English language. If the students know it already, then we will not   torment   them anymore on learning again on MTB-MLE.

> **Respondent 16:** I cannot give any recommendation for better implementation of the MTB-MLE. For me, it is not really a good help to the   teachers and learners using this learning. Using mother tongue might [be] helpful in explaining things to the learners not in using it as a language in   the   textbook. The terms used are not commonly used in when the learners finished the level that are using mother tongue, it is another battle to them in understanding the simple concept into English language.

> **Respondent 21:** I don't have anything to recommend but to abolish the MTB-   MLE Policy.

> **Respondent 60:** Stop the integration of this policy. I will never recommend   this is not helping in the competence of the pupils in education globalization.

> **Respondent 62:** None. I just couldn't find it helpful or strategic. Yes, it may   make lessons interesting to students for they have better understanding in   using mother tongue in education, but it gives us a lot of challenges   especially when you are teaching Science, for we must translate our lessons in order for them to understand and comprehend. In High school,   all Science textbooks are written in English language and not in Mother   tongue. I hope you get my point.

> Based on the excerpt presented above, it can be deduced that although there are many who favors the MTB-MLE policy, there are quite a number of educators who want to abolish and remove the policy in the educational curriculum of the country. This finding relates to Ejieh's (2004 as cited in Alieto, 2018) study wherein 80 out of 95 students were not willing to teach in mother tongue after graduation, hence their negative attitude towards the program transpired in the study.

Revise or modify the policy

Aside from increased support from the government, another recommendation that came out from the data gathered from the respondents is the call for revision and modification in some of the areas of the policy implementation. Such claim is evident in the sub-themes found on the table wherein some recommendations to modify or revise the policy include choosing a common mother tongue for specific regions as well as creating a team that will supervise the MTB-MLE implementation in the primary levels – this will help in ensuring that issues related to the policy are addressed on a timely manner with appropriate and context-based solutions. Additionally, in order to improve the implementation, the respondents suggest using standardized materials in teaching mother tongue. This will ensure that the quality of knowledge that students will get are sufficient and are at par with the standards that will help them become equipped learners.

Other recommendations that center on the modification of the program include the use of mother tongue as the LOI in specific subjects only, this is quite synonymous to the other one which states there should be no code switching on subjects using English as the LOI, this will mean that in some subjects specifically those in L2, teachers may or may not use mother tongue and that its usage will only be subject to the teachers' discretion as they deem necessary e.g., for clarifying and explaining complicated ideas, terminologies, etc. In addition, another recommendation calls for the continued implementation of the policy, but the Department of Education should ensure that there is a strong reinforcement in the teaching of English and Filipino from the 4th grade onwards. This means an additional work to the teachers and will require more strategic plans and a clear course of action for DepEd to ensure that the goals and objectives of the MTB-MLE policy are met while ensuring that the students' linguistic abilities in English and Filipino are not jeopardized.

Another sub-theme pertaining to the recommendation of revising and/or modifying the policy include the use of Filipino and English as the medium of instruction and that mother tongue should only be used to clarify and explain important points. This recommendation, however, is quite similar to the 1974 and 1987 Bilingual Education Policies wherein English and Filipino were used as the LOI in schools (Burton, 2013).

On a different note, a recommendation calls for an in-depth review of the policy to assess its relevance and usefulness in the current educational setting emerged as one of the themes found in the study. This could possibly mean that educators see areas that have weak spots and that such areas are overlooked by policymakers, or possibly this is a call that questions as to where the MTB-MLE policy stands, how it's doing, and what can it do in the long run.

Generally, the findings indicate that teachers have an unfavorable or negative attitude towards MTB-MLE. Reasonably, they won't have such attitudes without a driving force that made them feel that way about the policy. The negative attitude of teachers in the secondary level only means one thing, something is lacking or there must have been issues that are left unaddressed at the bottom of the implementation. The challenges they face are mere manifestations of the issues that came to the fore prior and during the implementation of the policy. Issues on reading comprehension difficulties, degradation of students' English proficiency and literacy, and language communication barrier are some of the most alarming challenges that educators in the secondary level are dealing with and are trying to find viable and doable solutions. The assumption that these challenges are results of the MTB-MLE policy may be vague, but it must be remembered that in the area of education, almost everything is interconnected – this means that whatever educational policy is enacted in the primary level of education can have a domino or a ripple effect in the secondary level, whatever educational quality students receive in their lower years will significantly affect their performance as they reach higher levels.

The result of the current study offers essential information and acts as a situationer report as it gives a clearer picture of what is happening on the ground and what the MTB-MLE policy has accomplished and contributed so far based on the perspective of teachers working in the secondary level. In order for the policy to succeed, policymakers should listen to those working at the grassroots level as they have firsthand experiences of what the real situation is. In the area of language policy, the present study offers a wide array of recommendations such as more support to teachers and modifications on the policy implementation, and if these recommendations are taken constructively and into consideration, it will help the policy improve and cater to the varying needs of an archipelago with complex and varied linguistic contexts.

Conclusion

MTB-MLE has always been a widely debated topic, it garnered accolades from supporters whilst receiving criticisms from its opposers, both the pros and cons side of the coin presents reasonable, arguable, and solid points. The current study captures the attitudes of the high school and senior high school teachers in various public high schools in Zamboanga del Sur, along with the challenges they face that are linked to the implementation of the said policy and their recommendations to improve it. It should be understood that the educational system is like a

machinery where teachers play as the mechanical parts, without them, the entire system would collapse and shut down. Thus, without teacher support, any educational policy is doomed to fail. The present study clearly shows that the teachers have an unfavorable attitude towards the MTB-MLE policy, and to add to the myriad of things to think about, they are faced with several challenges that impede the way they deliver their services.

Pedagogical Implication

From a pedagogical standpoint, this study revealed that the use of mother tongue as the language of instruction in the elementary levels, specifically from kindergarten to Grade 3, have a negative implication in the secondary level. It is not only manifested by the teachers' unfavorable attitude towards the policy, but more evidently, empirical data shows the negative impacts of the policy based on the academic challenges that both the students and the teachers face years since the policy's inception. Additionally, the overwhelming number of educators in the secondary level calling for the abolishment of the policy speaks volume, this message alone resonates a lot and serves as a call for consideration. Although the policy offers a myriad of benefits as proven by previous studies, by and large, something is amiss especially at the bottom of the implementation which explains why those at the receiving end are clamoring for change and/or support within the system.

On a similar note, the issues and challenges raised by the teachers such as the students' comprehension difficulties, low and/or degraded English literacy and skills, as well as communication barrier or difficulty of expression among students when they reach high school, are of urgent concern and should be addressed methodically and strategically. Such challenges impede the realization of the policy's goals and objectives if they are left unaddressed. The Department of Education should take into consideration the recommendations raised by the teachers in this study such as the continued and improved support for teachers through increased funding and relevant training as well as the creation of standardized and quality-made learning resources, possibly a revision and or modification of the MTB-MLE curriculum after careful study and deliberations, or to abolish the program if they deem necessary and appropriate. In the same vein, teachers in both the elementary and secondary levels should work hand-in-hand to ensure that students are receiving the necessary knowledge and skills that they need to be academically equipped and prepared. Moreover, DepEd should take full consideration as to how they issue top-down directives that most of the time overlook the situation of the teachers working in the grassroots. If they fail to listen or neglect the outcry of the teachers in the frontlines of the implementation, then it's only a matter of time when MTB-MLE, the once hoped to be an educational boon will become a bane.

References

Akinnaso, F. N. (1993). Policy and experiment in mother tongue literacy in Nigeria.   *International Review of Education*, 39(4), 255-285.

Alieto, E. (2018). Language Shift from English to Mother Tongue: Exploring Language   Attitude   and Willingness to Teach among Pre-Service Teachers. *TESOL   International Journal*, 13(3), 134-146.

Berowa, A. M. & Agbayani, R. (2019). The MTBMLE Policy: Attitudes Among Teachers   on   the Ground. *Asian EFL Journal*. 21. 123.

Burton, L. A. (2013). *Mother tongue-based multilingual education in the Philippines: studying a top-down policy from the bottom up*. Retrieved from the University of   Minnesota   Digital   Conservancy, https://hdl.handle.net/11299/152603.

Callan, V.J., and Gallois, C. (1987). Anglo-Australians' and immigrants' attitudes toward language and accent: A review of experimental and survey research. *The   International Migration Review*, 21 (1), 48-69. doi: 10.1177/019791838702100103.

Canagarajah, S. (2005). *Reconstructing local knowledge, reconfiguring language studies*.   In   S. Canagarajah (Ed.), Reclaiming the local in language policy and practice (pp.   3-24).   Mahwah,   NJ: Routledge.

Cruz, N.T. (2015). *The implementation of the mother tongue-based multilingual education   in Grade I in the public elementary schools in Pangasinan I*. Paper presented at   DLSU Research Congress 2015, DLSU-Manila, Philippines.

Cummins, J. (2000). *Language, power, and pedagogy. Bilingual children in the crossfire.*   Clevedon, England: Multilingual Matters.

Dumlao, A. (2012, May 16). K+12 to use 12 mother tongues. *Philstar Global.* Retrieved from https://www.philstar.com/headlines/2012/05/16/807083/k12-use-12-mother-   tongues.

Ejieh, M.U.C. (2004). Attitudes of student teachers towards teaching in mother tongue in   Nigerian primary schools: Implications for planning. Language, Culture, and   Curriculum. 73-81. Retrieved from https://www.tandfonline.com/doi/abs/10.1080/07908310408666683

Fullan, M. (2003). *The new meaning of educational change*. New York: Teachers College   Press.

Gallego, M. K. S., & Zubiri, L. A. M. (2013). *MTBMLE in the Philippines: Perceptions,   attitudes,   and outlook*. Retrieved from   https;//mlephil.files.wordpress.com/2013/08/mtbmle   -in-thephilippines-perceptionsattitudes-and-outlook.pdf.

Gardner, R. C. (1985). *Social psychology and second language learning: The roles of   attitudes   and motivation.* Baltimore, MD: Edward Arnold Publishers.

Gardner, R. & Lambert, W. (1972). *Attitudes and motivation in second language learning.*   Rowley, MA: Newbury House.

Garrett, P., 2010. *Attitudes to language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Grosjean, F. (1982). *Life with two languages: An introduction to bilingualism*. USA: Harvard   University Press.

Haugen, E. (1972). *The ecology of language.* Stanford, CA: Stanford University Press.

Jones, J. M. (2012). The effect of language attitudes on Kenyan stakeholder involvement in   mother   tongue policy implementation. *Journal of Multilingual and Multicultural   Development*, 33 (3) , 237-250. doi: 10.1080/01434632.2012.661736.

Jr, Constantino. (2018). *The Experiences of Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education Teachers in Southern Leyte, Philippines*.

Lartec, J. K., Belisario, A.M., Bendanillo, J. P., Binas-o, H.K., Bucang, N. O., and   Cammagay, J. L. W. (2014). Strategies and Problems Encountered by Teachers   in Implementing Mother Tongue-Based Instruction in a Multilingual Classroom.   *The IAFOR Journal of Language Learning,* 1 (1), 1-16.

Letsholo, R. (2009). Language maintenance or shift? Attitudes of Bakalanga youth   towards   their   mother tongue. *International Journal of Bilingual Education and   Bilingualism,*   12   (5),   581-595. doi:10.1080/13670050802153459.

Lewis, P., Simons, G. & Fennig, C. (2013). *Ethnologue: Languages of the World*. (17th   ed.) Dallas, Texas: SIL International. Retrieved from https://www.ethnologue.com/

Mallozzi, C., & Malloy, J. (2007). Second language issues and multiculturalism. *Reading   Research Quarterly*, 42(3), 430-436.

Medilo, C. Jr. (2018). The Experiences of Mother Tongue-Based Multilingual Education Teachers in Southern Leyte, Philippines.

Namanya, Sheri. (2017). *The effects of mother tongue-based multilingual education on   the   english literacy of children in   silang, philippines*.

Naom, N., & Sarah, A (2014). Mother tongue in instruction: The role of attitude in the   implementation. *International Journal of Research In Social Sciences*, 4 (1), 77- 87.

Nolasco, R. D. (2008). *The Prospects of Multilingual Educaton and Literacy in the   Philippines*.   Paper presented at the The 2nd International Conference on   Language Development, Language Revitalization, and Multilingual Education in   Ethnolinguistic Communities, Bangkok, Thailand.

Ospina, S. (2004). *Qualitative research* [in:] Goethals, G.R., Sorenson, G.J., MacGregor Burns,   J.,   eds., *Encyclopedia of leadership*. London: Sage.

Patton, Michael (1990) *Qualitative evaluation and research methods*. USA: Sage   Publications.

Philippines Department of Education. (2009). *Institutionalizing mother tongue-based   multilingual education (Order no. 74)*. Pasig City: Author.

Philippines Department of Education. (2012). *Guidelines on the implementation of the   mother   tongue-based multilingual education (MTB-MLE)* (Order no. 16)*. Pasig   City: Author.

Philippine Statistics Authority. (2002). *Young Population Dominated in Zamboanga del Sur (Results from the 2000 Census of Population and Housing, NSO)*. Retrieved   from: https://psa.gov.ph/content/young-population-dominated-zamboanga-del-   sur-results-2000-census-population-and-housing-nso#:~:text=Cebuano%20was%20the%20predominant%20ethnic%20group%20in%20Zamboanga%20del%20Sur,then%20Subanen%20(9.00%20percent).

Rajagopalan, K. (2005). *The language issue in Brazil: When local knowledge clashes with   expert knowledge*. In S. Canagarajah (Ed.), Negotiating the global and the local in   language policy and practice (pp. 99-132), Mahwah, NJ: Routledge.

Ramirez, J. D., Yuen, S. D., & Ramey, D. R. (1991). *Longitudinal study of structured   English   immersion strategy, early-exit and late-exit transitional bilingual education   programs for language-minority children*. Final report to the U.S. Department of   Education. San Mateo, CA: Aguirre International.

Rasinski, T.V. (2017). Readers who struggle: Why many struggle and a modest proposal for   improving   their reading. *The Reading Teacher* 70(5), 518-524. doi: 10.1002/trtr.1533

Sarnoff, I. (1970). *Social attitudes and the resolution of motivational conflict*. In M. Jahoda,   & N. Warren (Eds.), Attitudes (pp. 279-284). Harmondsworth: Penguin.

Shohamy, E. G. (2006). *Language policy: Hidden agendas and new approaches*. New   York: Routledge

Smits, J., Huisman, J., & Kruijff, K. (2008). Home language and education in the   developing   world. Background paper for EFA Global Monitoring 2009. Paris: UNESCO.

Spolsky, B. (2004). *Language policy*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Spolsky, B. (2011). *Language management*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press.

Smolicz, J. J., & Nical, I. (1997). Exporting the European idea of a national language: Some   educational implications of the use of English and indigenous languages in   the Philippines. *International Review of Education,* Vol 43(5-6), 507-526.

Sutton, M., & Levinson, B. (2001). *Policy as practice toward a comparative sociocultural   analysis   of educational policy*. Stamford, CT: Ablex Publishing.

Stone, P. R. (2012). *A professional development program for the mother tongue- based   teacher: Addressing teacher knowledge and attitudes about MTBMLE*   (Order   No. 3518270). Available from ProQuest Dissertations & Theses Global.   (1033224534).   Retrieved   on   July   17,   2017   from http://search.proquest.com/docview/1033224534?accountid=141440.

Thomas, W. P., & Collier, V. P. (1997). *A national study of school effectiveness for   language   minority students' long-term academic achievement.* George Mason   University, CREDE (Center for Research on Education, Diversity & Excellence).   Retrieved   November   22,   2010,   from http://www.usc.edu/dept/education/CMMR/CollierThomasComplete.pdf

Tonio, J & Ella, J. (2019). Pre-service Teacherd s' Attitudes towards the Use of Mother   Tongue as Medium of Instruction. *Asian EFL Journal*. 21. 231.

Valerio, B. (2015). Current Perspectives on Mother Tongue-Based Instruction in the   Newly Implemented K to 12 Curriculum of the Philippines. *European Centre for   Research Training and Development*. Vol 3, 51-66. UK.

Wa-Mbaleka, S. (2014). Teaching English to speakers of other languages: The case of   the   Philippines. *International Journal of Academic Research in Progressive   Education and Development*, Vol 3(2), 64-78.   Retrieved   from   http://hrmars.com/hrmars_papers/Teaching_English_to_Speakers_of_Other_Lan   gua ges_The_Case_of_the_Philippines.pdf

Wang, L. & Ladegaard, H. (2008). Language attitudes and gender in China: perceptions   and   reported   use   of Putonghua and Cantonese in the Southern Province.   *Language   Awareness*,   17(1),   57-77.   doi: 10.2167/la425.0.

Walter, S., & Dekker, D. (2011). Mother tongue instruction in Lubuagan: A case study   from   the   Philippines. *International Review of Education*, 57(5-6), 667-683.

PRACTICING APPRECIATIVE INQUIRY IN UNDERGRADUATE ECONOMICS EDUCATION

Dr. Iqtidar Ali Shah
ishah@yorkvilleu.ca
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3761-0043
Professor, Department of Business Administration,
Yorkville University, New Westminster, British Columbia,
Canada

Shubhayu Mookerjee
tmookerjee@yorkvilleu.ca
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2504-0212
Senior Associate Faculty, City University, British Columbia, Canada

ABSTRACT
Appreciative Inquiry (Ai)* is a strengths-based approach to organizational development that has used in place of the traditional deficit-based approach and has been very successfully applied to improve organizational outcomes. In this research study, Ai is applied to a diverse group of students in undergraduate non-specialist Economics classrooms to verify its effectiveness in the teaching-learning process. The objective of this paper to examine the pedagogical use of Ai in teaching and validate its utility in economics courses. Moreover, the specific objective is to find out challenges and opportunities when using Ai in classrooms. The approach is applied to five sections of Economics classes at Yorkville University, British Columbia Campus, Canada. Students, in each section were divided into small groups-the four phases of the Ai Cycle (Discovery, Dream, Design and Destiny) were then applied to each student group. Each group discovered their strengths, shared their dreams for an ideal class, designed a collective vision/plan as to how to achieve their objectives and started implementing the plan. It was found that Ai increased students' engagement, confidence, attendance, commitment, and improved the overall academic environment in the class and enhanced student success. We conclude therefore that universities and academic institutions can utilize this rapidly evolving and popular tool of organizational development to positively impact educational outcomes in the classroom.
Keywords: Appreciative Inquiry, Discovery, Dream, Design, Destiny and Higher Education

*In scientific literature and in this article, "Appreciative Inquiry" is shortened to "Ai", so that a clear distinction between Ai and AI Artificial Intelligence)

1. Introduction

It has been a long-standing tradition to align academic curricula with specific learning outcomes in different fields of study. A plethora of pedagogical tools is generally employed by instructors to address so-called 'student learning deficits' and problem areas in their disciplines. At the end of a course, the students evaluate the course, teacher and resources using a structured questionnaire provided by the institution. Many survey instruments of this type employ a Likert Scale-based approach. Based on students' evaluations, the institution usually identifies specific problems or deficiencies in the course, teaching pedagogy and resources. Accordingly, the course is revised/modified, resources are altered, and teaching methods are changed / improved for future semesters. The focal point of conventional learning has always been to harness the expertise of a teacher to address knowledge gaps in their students. It is not that everything about this conventional approach is flawed, and it does seem to work in specific instances. However, we cannot construe this approach as the sole catalyst of organizational change in academia. For one thing, the deficit-based approach is hardly a dynamic tool that can tackle the highly volatile environment that today's educational institutions must grapple with. Students of today operate in a high-pressure globalized world where technology and the pressures of multitasking often render traditional learning techniques ineffective. There is strong evidence that the classical deficit-based approach to problem-solving has often failed to deliver productive results (Smith, 2020). Therefore, the traditional approach based on problem identification, has been replaced by Appreciative Inquiry (Bickerton, 2018). "The primary goal of this approach is to actively engage the members of an organization by identifying, affirming, and appreciating their skills, resources, and positive experiences" (Davis, 2020).

The Appreciative Inquiry approach, drawn from positive psychology (Smith, 2020), focuses on what organizations do well, then explores and identifies how those strengths and values can be further improved (Bickerton, 2018). Appreciative inquiry is an approach that emphasizes innate organizational strengths to find new directions for growth rather than focusing on weaknesses or issues to be resolved (Beattie, 2018). In

essence, this approach focuses on what is working rather than what is not working. (Knox, Carter, Sommers, and Michaels, 2015). The 4 D cycle to which we have referred earlier is the '*sine qua non*' of operationalizing an Ai process. It is a well-defined methodology that allows an organization to identify its positive core strengths/competencies relative to a pre-determined affirmative topic that is the focal point of an Ai intervention. In the case of education, current approaches to teaching-learning improvement and students' engagement are largely problem-based. Academic problems and deficiencies are typically identified at the end of a course as a result of a standard rating-scale based evaluation by the students as explained above. Therefore, we propose to offer an alternative Ai intervention to improve teaching-learning outcomes and maximize students' engagement. The Ai cycle comprising the four Ds (Discovery, Dream, Design and Destiny), can be used by universities and colleges to maximize students' engagement by considering the core strengths of both students and their institutions. The approach is entirely strengths-based which provides an opportunity to the students to discover their strengths, think about an ideal class and learning techniques, design a plan for study and start implementation from the day first of class. It also provides an opportunity to the teachers to discover students' strengths and plan their teaching accordingly and move along with the plan without waiting for students' evaluation and problem identification at the end of semester. In particular, this systems-based approach will work more efficiently and effectively in case of universities that have large pools of international students. This is because teachers usually have very little '*a priori*' knowledge of the skills and academic propensities of such students.

At this point, a brief discussion about the theoretical underpinnings of Ai is in order. The 'Positive Core' of an organization is the first step toward comprehending Appreciative Inquiry. The positive core of an organization represents its best practices, the very best it has to offer. A serious attempt at undertaking change management cannot be separated from understanding the positive core. It must be emphasized that the 'positive core' of an organization is so deeply intertwined with the 4D cycle that it is virtually impossible to separate them. Most Ai practitioners view the 4D cycle as an operational tool, one that allows us to visualize the positive core distinctly and initiate a transformative mechanism. The future of any organization rests on the superstructure of its positive core and this is what renders Ai a holistic intervention, one that is neither top-down or bottom-up but utilizes a systems approach. The concept of the Affirmative Topic is crucial to developing an effective Ai initiative. This refers to the subject or issue that is the focal point of Ai intervention. In essence, it can be described as an organization's 'life-giving story'. Once the positive core is identified, an Ai intervention starts with the choice of the 'Affirmative Topic'-this is the focus of the organizational intervention. Academic literature in the field is unanimous in delineating the selection of the affirmative topic as a narrative exercise that describes an organization's so-called 'life-giving story'.   The structural framework of Appreciative Inquiry rests on the following phases of the 4D cycle:

- **Discovery (What has been):** In this phase, the participants discover the strengths and capacity of the group, organization or community and factors that energize it. The participants determine the "best of what is" or what their current strengths are. Specifically, participants may be asked to describe what actually interests them and a storytelling approach is often followed. These stories identify and explain the strengths of the organization as well as the root causes of success. (Assudani and Kilbourne, 2015 and Knox, Carter, Sommers, and Michaels, 2015, Conklin, 2009). In this phase the focus is on identifying the most positive aspects of the experience (Roberts, 2013).

- **Dream (What could be):** This is the next step after an organization has discovered its positive core. In this phase the participants are encouraged to dream or create a vision of what could be. Participants are encouraged to dwell actively on what "could" be or what would work well in the future. The most unique feature about this phase of the Ai process is that 'dreams' about the future are based on concrete realities of an organization's past achievements. Such an empirically grounded approach makes this process very different from other organizational planning methodologies.

- **Design (What should be):** This phase is about transforming the dream into a plan. The participants are encouraged to focus on designing a vision on the basis of the 'Dream' phase. It is in this phase that the 'positive core' identified earlier begins to assume a distinct form. A very important component of this phase is 'co construction'. The participants consolidate plans and ways in which their ideal can be attained (Roberts, 2013)

- **Destiny (What will be):** In this phase, participants are empowered to bring about a transformation in the organization and sustain it. Concrete plans are put into practice (Roberts, 2013). In this phase, one sees the beginning of an 'Appreciative Inquiry' culture, one that is based on the knowledge acquired in the previous

phases. A continuous process of learning and adjustment in the organization is the hallmark of the 'destiny' phase.

The general objective of this paper to explore how does Ai works to engage students and improve the teaching-learning process. More specific objectives are to examine the use of Ai in teaching and find its utility in economics courses, to investigate how the Ai approach create an academic environment for students to focus on their attitudes toward studies, make them more responsible and committed, increase their interaction with teacher and fellow students and to find out challenges and opportunities when using Ai in classrooms. Similarly, to find out what are the students' strengths, what kind of an ideal class they wish, how they designed their plan and started implementing it.

2. Literature Review

The traditional approach to organizational improvement is subsumed in a deficit- based approach that emphasis identification and addressing the causes of weak links in the system (Cooperrider, 2012). This approach has generally produced poor results (David, 1999). Ai is an alternative approach that focuses on identifying organizational strengths and leveraging them to create system-wide change (Knox, Carter, Sommers, and Michaels, 2015). Ai focuses on what is working, rather than what is not working, and leads people to construct their future (Smith, 2020). Ai encourages organizations to look for opportunities instead of problems when designing personal, organizational, and societal change initiatives (Bushe, 1995). Ai "works very well in changing human systems or in solving human systems problems (organizations or small and large groups including classrooms, relationships, departments, etc.)" (Macpherson, 2015). Ai was initially conceptualized by David Cooperrider and Suresh Srivastava as an alternate approach to traditional problem-based approach (Cooperrider and Srivastva,1987) when David was working as a doctoral student under Professor Suresh Srivastava at Case Western Reserve University, US (Macpherson, 2015).

Ai can be deployed in a classroom setting to achieve better learning environments. (Aviva Education, 2019). There are a few studies where Ai has been applied in actual classrooms and its efficacy has been empirically confirmed. Specifically, Ai interventions have led to enhancement of students' engagement, commitment, motivation, self-confidence, and learning. (Grandy and Holton, 2010; MacLeod, 2013; Rose Helens-Hart, 2018, Davis, 2020). An Ai exercise in a Business Education program has been found to successful in engendering an autonomy supportive classroom. Post-survey results from 10 distinct Ai-based classroom experiences showed that it is possible to achieve considerable success in creating autonomy -supportive classrooms and enable to students to experience peak learning experiences (Conklin and Hartman, 2013, 294-302)

The current study has been designed to gauge its efficacy in non-specialist undergraduate economics courses.

3. Application of Appreciation Inquiry in Economics Courses
3.1. Background of the Participants
The Ai approach was applied to enhance student learning in five sections (120 students) of two economics courses at Yorkville University, British Columbia Campus, Canada. The exercise was initiated in the winter term of 2019. In general, most students are from Asian countries and only a few have studied economics at their secondary schools. The students are generally not familiar with the social, cultural and education system of Canada. Adjustment issues are common as their cultural backgrounds are significantly different. We have limited knowledge about the students' language skills and their prior knowledge and ability in the course. Therefore, applying Ai is very useful for the course teacher to plan lectures and other leaning activities as per students' strengths.

3.2. Methodology
Ai was applied in the economics courses in the Winter term of 2019 and used as a treatment group. The previous term of Fall 2018 was used as the control group as Ai was not applied at that time. Although there was no formal data collection and statistical analysis, we generally compared learning outcomes such as students' participation, engagement, grades, confidence, and satisfaction with those of the control group.

3.3. Applying Appreciation Inquiry in Classroom
On first day of the class, participants were asked to form a group of 3-4 students. They were given 15 minutes to share and discuss "how the classroom can be better" considering their past learning experiences, and strengths in economics or general studies. After their discussion and sharing, the 4D phase was applied to each group as follows:

- **Discovery:** In this phase, each group was asked to identify their strengths. A few questions were asked to collect/understand their positive work which will help them in current class. For example, what is your favorite course? Explain why you like the course and how was your performance/score. Who was your favorite teacher/ why you like him/her? What are his/her characteristics? Explain any best learning experience you have enjoyed and achieved your goals. Indicate your prior knowledge in economics? Explain how you study and allocate your time optimally Do you prefer verbal instruction / explanations or visual learning?

  This phase was very creative and productive because each student shared past stories and focused on positive things that they achieved and enjoyed in life. In this phase, each group created a list of students' strengths. This list of discovery provided a set of guidelines for students and teachers, charting a way forward by considering students' strengths. This was an important phase for the teacher to understand students' strength in the course, the level of students' prior knowledge in economics, kind of teaching methodology and the specific attributes of a teacher that students generally liked. For example, most students expressed the opinion that their favorite teacher was very friendly and supportive. Similarly, each group stated that the teaching methodology should combine both visual learning techniques and explanations with examples from real world.

- **Dream:** After discovering the students' strengths, the groups were asked to dream of an ideal class. This phase was really an exciting one for students to think about how an ideal classroom would look like. How an ideal class will be where students will be not boring, and they enjoy learning and fully understand the topics/concepts. Students shared some of the dreams for an ideal class include grades, assignments, learning activities, assessment criteria, class discussion, group learning, extra classes, active learning, mutual respect, teacher attitude and class environment / resources etc. One of the challenges in this phase was that most of the students wished for high grades and less numbers of assignments. It was clarified that grades are granted based on students' performance and quality of works produced. The number of assignments and other class activities would be followed as per the syllabus approved by the university. However, due dates for assignments will be relaxed during the semester and rubrics will be provided for each assignment.

- **Design:** Using data from the discovery and dream phase, each group designed a collective vision/ plan for an ideal class to achieve their goals. Later, the plans of each group were merged, and a collective vision was developed for an ideal class. The plan was based on students' strengths and what they dreamt in respect of an ideal class. The plan developed by all groups collectively is analogous to a check list for students' success. Moreover, it represented a commitment toward their studies.

- **Destiny**: The final stage of appreciative inquiry is students' commitment to the aspirations that they agreed on. Each participant started implementation of their collective visionary plan in this phase. Throughout the term, they followed the plan because it was like an agreement with themselves and the course instructor. Any attempt at deviating from the plan was negated by reminders about the agreement that had been struck by the two parties.

4. Discussion

Appreciative Inquiry is drawn from positive psychology and has been used globally by public and private organizations of all sizes. The approach is applied in the area such as sales growth, customer service, sustainable value creation, leadership development, redesigning organization structure and to improve cost, quality, and cycle time in organizations. Few cases available where Ai is applied to teaching and produced goods results. It strengthens the bond between the students, engage students in self-determine change, create a sense of shared vision and direction. The Ai work very well and is effective when we applied to the diverse group of students whose basic skills and level of knowledge in the relevant area are unknown. This provides an opportunity to the instructor to know about the students' background and strength and use an appropriate teaching method which work for such students. Teaching to a diverse group of students without knowing their strengths is not effective. One of the challenges in the discovery phase was that students hesitate and shy to explain their strengths and weakness in front of the whole class. Therefore, we divide class into small groups and asked each group to discuss and answer the questions which were displayed on multimedia. The dream phase was the most challenges because each group mostly looking for a short cut to have limited and effortless assignments and dream for high grades. The students were clarified that the course syllabus is designed based on market need and each assignment is connected with learning out comes. Our results are like other studies conducted in teaching.

5.   Results and Conclusion

Overall, the Ai approach worked very well from the perspectives of both students and teachers. Teachers generally understand the basic academic touchpoints that allow students to perform better. Therefore, an opportunity was given to students to fulfil their dreams for an ideal class. For example, many students wished to work in small groups, and this was implemented throughout the semester with demonstrated results. All students showed renewed commitment and enthusiasm in class activities. The Ai approach increased students' participation, teamwork, interest, attendance, curiosity, a more proactive approach, and timely submission of assignments. The approach developed a symbiotic academic relationship between students and teachers that immensely enhanced communication, understanding and trust. The approach clearly illustrated the mechanism of the transformative shift of a teacher's mindset from the common deficit-based approach to students' strength-based approach. It must be mentioned that fundamental challenges in the dream and destiny phases were faced by the teachers. In the dream phase, some students wished to reduce the numbers of class assignments. However, it was explained that the course syllabus, marking criteria and number of assignments etc. is centralized as per university policy which cannot be changed. However, flexibility in submissions of assignments can be granted in case of any genuine problem.

The study was limited to five groups of economics classes. It would be useful to apply Ai in other disciplines as well and thereby broaden the compass of our investigation. Both efficiency and effectiveness of courses taught in a traditional manner can then be meaningfully compared with those utilizing the Ai approach.

References

Aviva Education (2019). How to Teach Appreciative Inquiry to Your Students? Accessed from https://www.schoolrubric.com/how-to-teach-appreciative-inquiry-to-your-students/

Assudani, R and Kilbourne, L. (2015). Enabling Entrepreneurial Minds: Using Appreciative Inquiry as a Pedagogical Tool for Uncovering Self- Awareness and for Generating Constructivist Learning, Journal of Entrepreneurship Education Volume 18, Number 1, 2015. Pp 65-75

Bickerton, E. (2018). Adopting the appreciative inquiry approach to fully engage staff during change, Accessed from https://ibrs.com.au/sourcing-staffing/adopting-the-appreciative-inquiry-approach-to-fully-engage-staff-during-change

Beattie, A. (2018). Using Appreciative Inquiry to Solve Management Problems, accessed from https://www.investopedia.com/articles/investing/111214/using-appreciative-inquiry-solve-management-problems.asp

Bushe, G. R. (1995). Advances in appreciative inquiry as an organizational development intervention. *Organization Development Journal*, 13(3), 14-22.

Conklin, T.A. (2009). Creating classrooms of preference: An exercise in Appreciative Inquiry. Journal of Management Education, 33, 772-779.

Conklin, T.A. & Hartman, Nathan S. (2014). Journal of Experiential Education, Vol.37(3) Appreciative Inquiry and Autonomy-Supportive Classes in Business Education: A Semilongitudinal Study of Ai in the Classroom.

Cooperrider, D. (2012). What is Appreciative Inquiry? Accessed from https://www.davidcooperrider.com/ai-process/

Cooperrider, D., & Srivastava, S. (1987). Appreciative inquiry in organizational life. In Woodman & Pasmore (Eds.). Research on Organizational Change and Development, vol. 1 (pp. 129-169). Greenwich, CT: JAi Press.

David, L. (1999). Applying Appreciative Inquiry Instead of Problem-Solving Techniques to Facilitate Change, Management Development Forum, Volume 2, Number 1 1999

Davis, L. (2020). Using Appreciative Inquiry in the College Classroom. Accessed from https://www.facultyfocus.com/articles/effective-classroom-management/appreciative-inquiry-interview/

Grandy, G and Holton, J, (2010). Mobilizing change in a business school using appreciative inquiry, The Learning Organization Vol. 17 No. 2, 2010 pp. 178-194

Knox L, Carter C, Sommers B, Michaels L. (2015). Primary Care Practice Facilitation Curriculum (Module 9). AHRQ Publication No. 15-0060-EF, Rockville, MD: Agency for Healthcare Research and Quality; September 2015.

Kung Susie, Giles, David, Hagan Bill (2013). Applying an Appreciative Inquiry Process to a Course Evaluation in Higher Education, International Journal of Teaching and Learning in Higher Education (Volume 25, Number 1, 29-37)

Matriano, M. T. (2015). Entrepreneurship Growth in Oman: Position, Prospects and Growth of Entrepreneurial Education. International E-Journal of Advances in Education, 1(2), 127-131.

MacLeod, P. (2013). Giving students a voice to achieve positive change: Using appreciative inquiry to maximize student engagement, Global Innovators Conference 2013 College of the North Atlantic-Qatar, 4-7th April 2013

Rose   Helens-Hart (2018). Appreciative   Coaching   for   Students'   Academic   and   Professional Development, Communication Teacher, 32:4, 220-224

Roberts, C. (2013). Appreciative Inquiry - A New Dimension in Problem-Based Learning, The International HETL Review, Special Issue, 2013.

Smith, T.J. (2020). How to Apply Appreciative Inquiry: A Visual Guide. Accessed from https://positivepsychology.com/appreciative-inquiry-process/

STUDY OF THE OPINIONS OF SCOUT LEADERS AND SCOUTS ON THE CONTRIBUTION OF EDUCATIONAL USE OF DRAMA TO THE IMPROVEMENT OF SCOUTS' CREATIVITY AND ENVIRONMENTAL AWARENESS

Esen BAHADIR
North Cyprus National Education Supervision Inspector
es_civisilli@hotmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8873-2534

Emine EMEL
Ministry of National Education and Culture, Teacher
emineemel73@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4345-8591

Esin PEKİN
Ministry of National Education and Culture,Teacher
esin.pekin@hotmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1172-6029

ABSTRACT
The purpose of this research is to examine the views of scout leaders and scouts regarding the contribution of the use of drama in educational activities to the development of the creativity of the scouts and raising environmental awareness. The study group of this research consisted of 282 scouts and 36 scout leaders working in 12 different primary schools in the Turkish Republic of Northern Cyprus in 2016-2017 under the Ministry of National Education and Culture Primary Education Department. In the research, a questionnaire was used to measure the contribution of drama, and model of pre-test and post-test was used to determine how much their creativity developed.
In the workshops entitled Environment and Wetlands, both environmental awareness was developed and information about wetlands was provided. In addition, the scouts created slogans, composed songs and shouts about this subject. It has been revealed that the scout leader and the majority of the scouts think that Drama has positive effects on improving the creativity of the scouts and increasing their knowledge and manners..
Keywords: Drama, drama in education, scouting, creativity, environmental awareness

INTRODUCTION

The cornerstone of our national education program and national education policy is the eradication of ignorance. Until ignorance is destroyed, we stand still in the same place. Something that stays in place in fact is going backwards. On the one hand, it is necessary to try to eliminate the general ignorance, on the other hand, it is necessary to raise effective, beneficial and productive individuals in social life. This is possible with the implementation of practice in primary and secondary education. Only in this way will societies have business people and artists"(Atatürk).

Educational processes show constant change and development in parallel with the changes and developments of our age. Based on this view, our Ministry has tried to convey the student-centered teaching approach and its practices to school administrators and teachers in all our primary schools through in-service courses in recent years. Our Ministry emphasized that "Student-Centered Education" aims to meet student needs and characteristics. Accordingly, it presented to its educators an approach in which the approach to learning shifts away from memorizing facts to research and invention, focusing on group learning instead of individual learning, in short, allowing students to learn how to learn. Accordingly, in student-centered education, it is desired that the individual can question things, is active, working in harmony with the teacher, self-confident, self-expressive, developing by recognizing their abilities, acting independently and freely.

Drama offers us opportunities that can provide for all of the above-mentioned things to individuals. Considering its goals, the fact that drama is the most effective way to bring us to the same point should not be ignored. The goals of the drama are:
- To provide creativity and aesthetic development in children,
- To give children the ability to think critically,
- Gaining social development and working together habits in children,
- To give children self-confidence and decision-making skills,
- To give children language and communication skills,

It aims to develop imagination, emotions and thoughts in children. In the changing world, values education, which is the basis of modernization as well as academic success, has come to the fore. Various official organizations and voluntary organizations make efforts and work for the development of the individual as a whole and to have human characteristics. (Keskin et al., 2012).

Scouting, which is a youth activity in voluntary uniform, is defined as an educational tool that aims at the physical, mental and social development of the individual as a whole, enables the necessary work to improve their creative abilities, will benefit the society, and gather all moral national and international youth under one roof. It is also defined as an activity that supports practical knowledge and skills (Şahin, 2007).

The aim of scouting education is to make children and young people think as "We," not "me," and to raise them as responsible individuals who attach importance to national and human values. (Açıkbaş, 2010) It has an important function in terms of filling the gaps in family and school education. Acting with the motto "Do a good act every day" the scouts continue their activities by doing, living, trying and observing and they attach importance to values education. With this aspect, scouting is an activity that is similar to drama, intertwined with drama in many ways, and overlapping in terms of self-expression of the individual.

PROBLEM STATUS:
• Misperceptions about scouting and scouts, which arise from the fact that scouts are not included in the training processes with methods suitable for them, and that they are not given enough opportunity to reveal their creativity,
• The inadequacy of our education and training activities in raising individuals foreseen by the era, the necessity of using alternative and contemporary methods,
• The state of insensitivity and unconsciousness arising from not teaching the awareness of the protection of the environment and natural habitats with appropriate methods.

LITERATURE SCANNING
What is Drama?
"Drama supports education and training by providing communication and interaction skills, empathy, using body language, role playing, dreaming, relaxation, animation while teaching a subject" (Karakaya Necmettin).

Drama is a new formation in education and training. A rote-based education prevents the child's mental development, or research, or relationships with other people, or and finally effective learning. Drama, on the other hand, is both an educational field and an effective teaching method that develops and trains the children's creativity and prepares them for life (MEB, 1999:7).

Drama is a new formation that takes place in contemporary education systems and has been used in recent years.
• Expressing a thought with body language, movement and action,
• Multi-faceted development of persons by putting themselves in the shoes of others,
• Taking an active role in individual education-teaching processes,
• It is one of the most effective education methods in terms of an individual's discovery of creativity, perceiving life as multidimensional, and learning by doing. (Meral Kocabay)

"Creation of play processes and dramatic moments by experts within in-group interaction processes is described as creative drama studies"(San,524)
Drama is a new formation that takes place in contemporary education systems and has been used in recent years.

Importance of Drama:
In our age, where science and technology are developing very rapidly, human beings are faced with the questions of having the qualifications suitable for this age. In order to adapt to the current era, countries have to plan and program their educational institutions according to these situations. They have to organize their education systems in order to raise individuals who are modern, self-confident, democratic, secular, able to perceive and question life, express themselves, be effective, productive, self-confident, and influence the masses. Drama is a science and art that give these features to students. Drama is a branch of science. In order for a field to be a branch of science, it must have management. Sciences reveal the correct information by examining the events and phenomena with their own methods. The leading unique methods of drama are communication, pantomime (non-verbal communication), improvisation, using body language, demonstrating, imitating, empathizing, role playing, daydreaming, enacting and evaluation. In addition, drama also benefits from all kinds of teaching methods and techniques used in education and training. Thus, a work of art emerges. (Aris, 1995:3, 4).

Art is one of the cornerstones of education and training. In case of its deficiency, it may cause gaps in personality and social development, as well as negative effects. Drama has a relationship with art. In education and training with art, students learn to think, develop physically and spiritually, and help them open up the ways of creativity. (İspiroğlu, 1994:49)

Drama educates children's emotions in educational activities through art. People whose emotions are not trained are insensitive to what is going on around them. These people look but do not see, hear but do not listen. Art is a branch of philosophy that enables people to develop their understanding of beauty. This branch studies what is beautiful, ugly and harmful for people (İspiroğlu, 1994: 9).

Drama affects the development of sense organs. People whose senses are trained learn more easily and quickly. For this reason, drama is important in terms of presenting learning through experiencing, filtering it from external factors, individualizing child's knowledge, making learning and knowledge functional, activating learning and activating the developmental characteristics of students in learning. (Adıgüzel, 2002:82)

In addition to permanent learning and socialization in drama processes, there are qualities that give the individual confidence and respect, enable the individual to reveal the social power and consciousness of being a member of a group, and contribute to the development of problem solving and communication skills. Participation instead of passiveness, independence instead of dependence and decision-making, competence, democratization are other qualities that creative drama can offer.

Education and Drama:
Today, with the developing technology and new understandings, human beings are also in a constant search, looking for different and more effective ways to adapt themselves to the new age and new developments. When considered in all these processes, Education also gets its share from these changes. When the issue of education is handled in this context, there are opposing views. The first of these are traditionalists, who think that the purpose of education is to transfer knowledge. Considering that this era is the era of information and finding information is at our fingertips at any time, it is a debatable how much mere information transfer is important in today's education. "The most appropriate metaphor for traditionalists' view on education is the image of an empty vessel."(Engin Karadağ, Dr. Nihat Çalışkan). Here, anything that is outside the child, evaluated by the teacher, is passively emptied into the open-mouthed container. It shows an understanding that puts the teacher in the center, ignoring the student's feelings, personality traits, perceptions and needs.

"The other view on education stems from the romantic idea that emphasizes the importance and uniqueness of the individual. The teacher should protect the children from the cruel world and interventions and support their natural development."

The student-centered teaching approach, which has become widespread in many countries today, is very compatible with this understanding, and it is aimed to structure the knowledge without ignoring the individual differences of the individual. At this point, according to San, most of the learning in school has taken the form of learning that is added and piled on one another. Information that is new to the individual is constantly taught and stored by individuals. However, today, knowledge must be perceived as holistic constellations within their interdisciplinary context. Learning in drama is a kind of structuring. It is the students' evaluation of what they have learned and the knowledge from their point of view. It is necessary to examine the acquired concepts and to attribute new meanings to these concepts. Experiences and lives are reviewed and all these natural processes bring learning. Teaching with drama is not just memorizing and storing information. In drama, information is structured in subjective and objective relations with the world. Educational institutions generally cannot provide such learning. For this, it is necessary to use drama in education.

"John Dewey (1921) defines the revolution from knowledge-centered education to child-centered education as follows; In the old education system, the weight was outside the child: it was in the teacher, in the textbook, wherever the child did not have instinctive and internal reactive activities… the center of gravity of the changes we are trying to make now changes and the child turns into a sun around which educational practices revolve."(Engin Karadağ, Dr. . Nihat Caliskan).

Unfortunately, when we look at our education system and in-class activities, it is seen that the teaching is mainly in everything except the child, as stated above. The children, who develop in this system and understanding, cannot go beyond memorization, grow up as individuals who do not question, are passive, cannot develop in accordance with his interests and abilities, cannot express themselves, and do not trust themselves. On the other hand, the children who grow up in education and training processes with a student-centered understanding are raised as

individuals who are questioning, active, work in harmony with the teacher, express themselves, develop by being aware of their abilities, act independently and freely.

Whatever understanding is adopted, educational activities should be carried out within the framework of a program. "The education program performs its function with its four structural dimensions. These dimensions are; goals expressing the expected behavioral change in the individual; Content consisting of information and categories necessary for the realization of the objectives; methods and techniques that express the way followed in transferring the determined content to students; "Evaluation dimension to measure whether behavior change has taken place or not"

"The method to be applied in education and training is to turn knowledge into a practical and possible tool that ensures success in material life, rather than an ornament, a tool of domination or a civilized pleasure." Atatürk
In this statement, Atatürk also emphasized the importance of the method and emphasized the necessity of using knowledge for life.

Creative drama:
It is a way of self-expression. It is a method that reveals the creativity, imagination and courage of acting. In this way, the person gains self-confidence, self-realization, has values such as inner discipline, imagination, freedom and respect. Creative Drama is therefore also used as a teaching method.

Creative thinking and creativity are one of the aspects that distinguish humans from other living things. (Eker & Sak, 2016). It has been accepted that it is a feature that can exist and be developed in everyone (Arıoğlu, 1999).

Scouting and Drama:
Scouting is activities done by living, experimenting and observing. It is very similar to drama in this aspect. Drama offers participants the opportunity to examine various social roles and problems. In the nature of scouting, there is work to solve the problems of oneself, those around them, and nature by undertaking various roles and tasks. .

Drama in Primary Education:
"Drama in Primary Education" is the animation of the lesson subjects that a classroom teacher will or will have taught in his class in accordance with the curriculum, under the leadership of the teacher. The success of the subject to be animated depends on the teacher and her experience in drama education (Karakaya 2007).

Drama in primary education is also a game. The aim is to ensure the subjects will be learned permanently by transforming the course topics into games. Drama in primary education is a group effort. It works to make learning by doing-experience permanent, to facilitate course subjects, to concretize abstract concepts, to provide effective and meaningful learning (Hatipoğlu, 2006: 2).

Drama in primary education is to revive a word, a concept, a behavior, a sentence, a thought, an experience, an event or a phenomenon or a subject of any lesson by using theater techniques and developing plays and games.

Happy individuals learn more quickly because all their perceptions are activated. Students learn to test and try, dream, gain courage, solve their problems, develop their creative power and try to relax, with the course topics given in the form of games. (Slade). Seachove states that this situation allows the child to gain personality in terms of social, ethical and psychological aspects. Kase and Posilini, on the other hand, make learning a natural and easy way by customizing their personality through imitation and role, transforming them into new situations and problems they will encounter in life. To summarize briefly, the student who use drama has the opportunity to simulate real life experiences beforehand. This is the most effective and exciting phenomenon that prepares a student for life, and it engages participation and creation at the same time. Parallel to the purpose of drama in primary education, the main purpose of primary education is to prepare students for life and higher education. All courses in primary education programs are effective in the realization of skills such as mental skills, effective reasoning, critical thinking and problem solving for the realization of this purpose. Primary education is a period in which children develop rapidly both physically and mentally. Therefore, it is necessary to know both the mental competencies of the students and the lessons to be taught should be arranged according to these competencies. Students learn through their sense organs. It is one of the basic conditions of learning to include learning and teaching tools that will appeal to the sense organs of the students. The fact that the course topics can be seen, handled and divided into parts facilitates learning and also reduces forgetting. In drama based activities, students use teaching materials related to the lesson topics; they will act, discuss solution strategies with their friends in the group, use body language, develop and combine their own concepts by playing the role of the object they will

portray in the group, so that students can channel their energies into learning by developing "student-centered activities".

Drama has a very important place and role in the development of primary school children. By emphasizing the principles and elements of students' cognitive, psycho-motor, physical, emotional, sexual and social development, the long-term sustainability of education and training can be achieved when education and training are provided in the drama environment. We can list the effects of drama on the development of students as follows:

1. The Effect of Drama on Cognitive Development
Primary school students have a unique worldview. Children of this age try to understand the world they live in. In children there are differences depending on age group, maturation speed and private life. They begin to think logically and thoughts increase mobility. Evaluations of features such as objects number, color, shape, mass, weight, volume and alike occur in this period. The ability to think abstractly has not been put in place in a concrete way. They adopt abstract concepts and metaphors such as freedom, honor, nation, country, death with their concrete meanings. (Acun; Gülay, 1992:44-45)

In the process of teaching the lesson subjects with the drama method in primary education, a significant increase is observed in the cognitive development of children. Children gain depth in their cognitive stages through the roles they will play about the lesson topics that will be the basis of the drama. They can reach correct and positive evaluations of objects, events and facts related to the subject through their group friends. This is also a result of the cognitive developmental stage. Drama contributes to the correct evaluation of this stage and to the correct perception of many abstract and concrete concepts.

2. Effect on Emotional Development
Whether or not the feelings that affect our inner world from our environment or that come from within are pleasing us, they are dimensions related to emotional development.

People are more or less in pain or pleasure while interacting with the environment. Failure to meet the basic needs of children may pave the way for the formation of various emotions in them. E.g; Children whose needs are met may be very happy, but otherwise unhappy. Emotional reactions in primary school children may differ with learning and maturation. The environment and conditions in which the child lives as well as endocrine glands play an important role in emotional development. Children can be provided with an environment of interest, love and trust. Children's emotional development can follow a positive development. Drama plays an important role in ensuring the positive and emotional development of children. In teaching with drama, children will be subject to a learning process by doing-living, and they will be free from many negative attitudes and behaviors in their relationships with friend groups thanks to the role play. Because; In drama, there is a constant interaction and activity. Children are present in this process with the roles they play. Since every interaction and every activity will carry children to the next level, they prepare the best environment for the emotional development of primary school children and for the initiation of positive relationships in terms of their mental health. Drama activities in the emotional life of the child lead to emotional relaxation by enabling the child to act independently in his own world. (Hatipoğlu, 2006:29)

The best activities in primary education can be obtained by teaching the lessons with the drama method.
With drama, children gain new experiences, prepare themselves for the future with the roles they play, they learn to be loved, to rejoice, sharing,discussing, rules, daydreaming, truth, goodness, perfection, responsibility, and staying in the foreground or in the background from time to time. Thus, the will to fight develops. For this reason, drama activates the passiveness and encourages the less courageous. (Hazar, 1997:16) Children gain a sense of self-confidence by trying to relax without being exposed to any obstacles in their emotional development by reflecting their innermost to the outside through the roles they play. (Hatipoğlu, 2006:28)

3. Effect on Social Development
Social development encompasses the processes related to the development of a person in a way that the society they live in will approve or disapprove. (Acun; Gülay, 1992:66) It follows a path parallel to the physical and emotional development of primary school children's social development. Children's gaining social characteristics is reflected in the culture of that environment through the environment and the environment.

it comes in. E.g; friendship; arises from the exchange of love and thought. Friendship distracts children from selfish behavior. Every child feels the need to make friends and join a group. This is a basic social need. Children learn the rules and value judgments that are valid in the society and be in harmony with them, depends on the positive start of this basic need. Social experiences have an important place in the socialization of children and in being a

man of society. Children can shape themselves by testing life in drama with the roles they will play with drama activities. Through drama, children also learn to socialize. Positive and negative qualities gained in real life are tested in drama and it is tried to gain positive qualities.

If the lessons are given with the drama method in primary education, children will be able to gain the traits below by gaining social characteristics through that environment, it will be easier to enter, adopt, integrate and finally integrate into the culture of that environment. (Poyraz, 1999:41)

• Meeting their basic needs,
• To regulate their behavior according to the value judgments of the society,
• Minimizing negative behaviors,
• In making socially approved behaviors a habit,
• Behaving in accordance with traditions and customs,
• Having good relations with others,
• Being self-respecting,
• To display a respectable and exemplary personality in the society,
• To form the cornerstones of social development in future ages,
• Ensuring communication and interaction with other people and institutions in the society,

4. Effect on Psychomotor Development
Psychomotor development is the voluntary mobilization of the organism as a result of brain and spinal cord development along with physical growth and development. (Montenegro; Caliskan, 2005:25)

When the child is born, he/she has psychomotor abilities such as readiness for reaction, restless movement, coordination, dynamics, attention and flexibility. Until the primary school age, these abilities are reflected in the personality at an increasing rate through trial and mistakes. These abilities of the children continue to develop in a healthy way during the course subjects taught with the drama method. In a role that they will play for the first time in a drama, children may show shyness, may not know how to act their roles, or even be afraid to play drama. This is due to the inability of a normal child to use his/her will properly. It should not be thought that there may be a disorder in psychomotor development.

Children who are confronted with a drama activity that they have never seen or tried before and which is completely unfamiliar to them can do it more easily with their friends in the drama group. (Poyraz, 1999:41). Thanks to drama, psychomotor skills, strength, reaction, attention increase, small muscles are controlled, coordination and balance of organs, flexibility and agility in movements are provided. (Infrequent; Sun, 1991:51-53)

5. Effect on Physical Development
Physical development is the maturation and differentiation of biological functions as a result of changes in the structure and biochemical composition of a growing organism's tissues.

Physical development encompasses regular, harmonious and continuous progress. In drama activities, the child's constant repetition of certain movements according to the roles he/she plays will naturally accelerate and strengthen his muscle development. The activity in the drama primarily affects the respiratory, circulatory and digestive systems positively and will accelerate the physical development of the child by contributing to the secretion of the endocrine glands more. First of all, it will help him/her eat healthy because he uses the calories he takes from nutrition with movements. When the child, who has a good appetite in the natural development process, combines the food he/she takes with the movements and the role he/she plays in the drama;
• Strengthening of muscles and tendons,
• Strength, endurance and quickness,
• Strengthening and development of bone structure and joints,
• Development of the immune system in the organism,
• Exercising the body,
• Acceleration in blood circulation,
• Enabling tissues to receive more nutrients,
• Acceleration in respiration will occur and positively affect their health and endurance.

6. Effect on Sexual Development
The development that includes a person's sexual growth, taking a healthy attitude towards this growth, being able to overcome his sexual problems and being sufficient is called sexual development.

The majority of the problems that people face in their sexual development coincide with school age. If students want to be in harmony with their environment, have good mental health, and get rid of emotional tensions, they should be closely interested in their sexual development and necessary guidance should be given. (Binbaşıoğlu, 1978:232)

Many parents in our country see sexuality as a taboo due to the cultural structure of our society. However, people begin to recognize their gender from birth, acquire gender-specific movements and personality, and in adolescence, they begin to be interested in sexuality with the physiological growth and activation of the glands. In this growth cycle, it is very important for the child to find the right answers to the questions that appear in his/her mind as he/she is shaped. Giving logical, scientific and correct answers to the child's questions about sexuality in this period depends on the guidance of the family and educational institutions. Otherwise, children will be prepared for a period of sexual complexity. In this case, children may fall into adolescence-specific depressions and mistakes (Basaran, 1976:43).

The primary school age is the age when children leave the family environment and open up to the outside world and mingle with the social environment. In this period, as the child's personality development continues, his/her tolerance for waiting and resisting obstacles increases. The child, whose world expands, creates imaginary heroes. Child gangs are formed during this period. Impulses to oppress the weak and to be a leader appear.

The child is lively and active. Child is energetic, physically stronger. When these children are given education and training with the drama method, negative attitudes and behaviors related to sexual development can turn into positive ones, especially when they act in accordance with the roles they undertake in social lessons. Life Studies, Social Studies and Turkish lessons and family, friends, society, work subjects in these lessons can help children to find their sexual identity. Thus, in teaching with drama method;

• They understand family life
• They develop their abstract thinking
• They develop the ability to choose between good and right, bad and wrong.
• They enrich their vocabulary.
• They bring the feelings of being liked to the fore.
• They use their energies in a positive way.
• They join friend groups.
• They reach the skill of being a healthy man and woman in later ages.
• They can solve their problems by researching.
• They become healthy individuals by successfully passing the healthy sexual development phase.
• They get rid of excessive emotionality.

PROBLEM STATUS:

• Using methods that are far from raising the individual foreseen by the age,
• Misperceptions about scouting and scouts, arising from the fact that scouts are not included in the education process with methods suitable for them, and that they are not given the opportunity to reveal their creativity sufficiently,
• The inadequacy of our education and training activities in raising the individuals foreseen by the age, the necessity of using alternative and contemporary methods.
• According to San, "...When we approach education in all its aspects, we see that in many respects we cannot innovate to the extent we wish. ...The rote teaching system is a phenomenon that everyone complains about, and creativity is a popular concept. Therefore, the question of how to raise a creative person in education concerns many of us. In this context, when we ask what more contemporary methods can be substituted for the old teaching methods, what we come up with are effective methods such as alternative learning methods, role playing, dramatization and finally creative drama..."(Adıgüzel, 2012, 253)
• According to Levent, "Rote learning does not allow an individual to even understand what they have learned. However, the drama method enables the individual to use all the information he/she has learned with his/her developing role, and even as his/her role develops, he/she becomes demanding and reaches it by himself/herself" (Adıgüzel, 2012, 282)
• "Drama supports education and training by providing empathy, using body language, role playing, dreaming, relaxation, communication and interaction skills while teaching the subject." (Karakaya Necmettin).

PURPOSE OF THE STUDY

In this study, it is aimed to determine the extent to which drama activities affect the creativity of the scouts and increase their sensitivity to the environment by taking the views of the scout leader and scouts.

• Using drama as an effective educational method,
• Raising awareness among primary school scouts regarding the promotion and protection of the environment and wetlands and endangered bird species,
• Demonstrating the effective use of the drama method in raising awareness to the scout leaders about the promotion and protection of the environment and wetlands and endangered bird species with the drama method,
• Arrangement of Shouts and Songs and applause to be created by the Scouts during the drama workshops to be created,
• Collecting the arranged songs on a CD by performing them by the scouts,
• Distribution of CDs created by the scouts in drama workshops, to all schools where scouting takes place.

In this study, answers were sought to the following questions:
1-The place of the scout and scout leaders in the education-teaching processes of drama as an educational method,
• The effects of the presence of drama in the educational processes on the awareness to be created about the subject to be taught.
• The contribution and results of drama and the use of drama in education in revealing the creativity of the scouts.
• Contribution of drama in developing environmental awareness and sensitivity of scouts.

IMPORTANCE OF STUDY

This study is important in terms of determining how effective and important drama is in terms of revealing the extent to which the Scouts develop their creativity and increase their environmental awareness.

In addition, this research is important because students are important. The main thing is what the students learn, what they feels, how they expresses themselves and where and how they use what they have learned. "Drama and drama take the place and value it deserves in education-teaching processes,

It is important in terms of revealing the creativity of the scouts and that the resulting product will be shared with all other scouts.

METHOD
• STUDY MODEL

Quantitative research model approach was used in this study. In order to create a solution to the research problem, a survey technique based on the quantitative research approach was created and a questionnaire was designed.

UNIVERSE AND SAMPLE

In this study, 176 girl and 116 boy scouts and 36 scout leaders participated as a selected sample, taking into account the 10% error number among 2000 scouts and 80 scout leaders affiliated to the Ministry of National Education and Culture Primary Education Department in 2016-2017.

Drama Workshops held in 12 primary schools in Famagusta Center and surrounding primary schools were limited to 176 Girl Scouts and 116 Boy Scouts and 36 Leaders.

Working Group – Workshops
Data Collection
Analysis and Evaluation of Data (Editing and evaluating songs)
Sharing the new product created

Work Groups:

In the drama workshops on Environment - Wetlands, awareness was created on the subject, slogans were created and the process was completed by producing songs and shouts.
The results obtained were evaluated by testing before the workshop and testing afterwards.
In addition, the attitudes of scout leaders towards drama were revealed through the surveys.
Drama Workshops were held in 10 primary schools and Famagusta Girl Scout Organization.

TARİH OKUL KIZ – ERKEK İZCİ SAYISI LİDER SAYISI
4 Mayıs 2017 Şehit Zeki Salih İlkokulu 18 K+16E = 34 3
11 Mayıs 2017 Şehit Osman Ahmet İLkokulu 10 K+ 6E =16 2
12 Mayıs 2017 Polatpaşa İlkokulu 15K+10 E= 25 2
13 Mayıs 2017 Dörtyol İLkokulu 11K+11E=22 2
18 Mayıs 2017 Karakol İLkokulu 10K+8E=18 2
1 Haziran 2017 Yeniboğaziçi İlkokulu 10K+12E=22 3
4 Haziran 2017 Geçitkale İlkokulu 13K+11E=22 2
4 Haziran 2017 Şht İlker Karter İLkokulu 20K+20 E =40 4
5 Haziran 2017 Gazi İlkokulu 15K+8E=23 2
8 Haziran 2017 Güvercinlik İLkokulu 5K+14 E =19 1
29 Haziran 2017 Gazimağusa Meslek Lisesi 14 K 1
29 Haziran 2017 Gazimağusa Kız İzci Örgütü 20 K 10
Projede asistan olarak eğitimlerde görev alan 15 K 2
TOPLAM   176 Kız +116 Erkek = 292   36 lider

Pretest and posttest measurements were made to all participants, and the success of the workshops and the awareness created in the students were measured. As a result of the analysis of these tests, a success rate that can be considered serious was determined.

DATA COLLECTION TOOL

In order to collect the data, both questionnaires and pre-tests and post-tests were used. In addition, the outputs obtained from the Drama Workshops were presented as products.

In drama workshops, a drama plan consisting of 12 different drama activities was implemented. With 12 different activities in the drama plan, the scouts were able to descend and rise, make their arms wings and fly like a bird. The scouts also pretended to talk to water drops and sought an answer to the question, "Who or what needs water in the world?" and they wanted the water drops to fall where they were needed. They shared the joy of hovering over deserts, trees, seas, and waterless countries as imaginary clouds and raining water with their friends.

In another activity, the scouts, who were asked to be the voice of nature, put themselves in the place of nature and had the opportunity to both empathize and express their thoughts on this subject as if they were the voice of nature. Afterwards, after imitating the various sounds of nature, the scouts prepared slogans for the protection of nature and the environment, and by thinking about the natural rhythms of nature, scouts shouted. Finally, the phrase "The World Is Not Only Us" was combined with rhythms and movements to create a scout's applause.

ANALYSIS OF DATA;
Pretest and posttest measurements were made to all participants, and the success of the workshops and the awareness created in the students were measured. As a result of the analysis of these tests, a success rate that can be considered serious has been determined.

FINDINGS
The following findings were obtained in this study:

Products; It consists of scout songs, slogans and shouts that will be passed down from generation to generation. Scouts shared the happiness of working and producing in accordance with the spirit of the scouts in cooperation.

Scout songs created by the scouts in drama workshops were recorded in the studio by the scouts, CDs were prepared and distributed to primary schools with their lyrics.

Findings Obtained from Pre- and Post-Tests:
Before starting the Drama Workshops titled "Join the Scouts for the Environment, The World Is Not Only Ours", a pre-test consisting of seven questions was asked to each of the scouts, and a post-test was administered at the end of the drama workshops. The findings of the pre-test and post-test, in which the same questions were asked, are as follows. According to this:
The first question in the pre-test was "Do you know the names of the wetlands in the Famagusta region?" While only 13% of the scouts answered the question correctly, 91% of the scouts were able to answer the same question correctly after the drama shoots.

In the second question, the scouts were asked to write the names of two of the wetlands in the Famagusta region. While the correct answer given by the scouts to this question in the pre-test was 9%, the correct answer rate increased to 87% in the post-test after the workshops.

In the third question in the pre-test, scouts were asked if they knew the names of the endangered bird species living in the wetlands in the Famagusta region. While 47% of the scouts stated that they knew the names of endangered bird species, 71% of the scouts stated that they knew bird species for the same question in the final test made after the drama workshops.

In the fourth question in the pre-test, the scouts were asked to write the names of the endangered bird species living in the wetlands of the Famagusta region. In the pretest, 35% of the scouts were able to write the names of only two of the endangered birds, while only 5% of the other three species got their names right. In the final test after the drama workshop, 69% of the scouts were able to spell at least three of the bird species correctly.

In the fifth question in the pre-test, the scouts were asked what can be done to protect the wetlands and they were asked to write down three things that could be done. Scouts were able to correctly know only one of these three options. While it can be understood from the only answer they gave that they knew that environmental cleanliness is very important, in the final test made after the workshops, 76% of the participants were able to give the desired answers.

In the sixth question in the pre-test, the scouts were asked why it is important to protect our environment and natural life. They were asked to write three reasons. However, the desired correct answer to this question could not be given. However, the rate of those who answered this question correctly in the post-test was 60%.

In the last question of the test, scouts were asked what the expression "The World Is Not Only Ours" means, and 82% of the scouts were able to explain in their own way in the pre-test. However, in the post-test, these statements were found to be more satisfactory and close to what was desired.

Slogans, lyrics and shouts made with rhythms created in the Drama Workshops should also be considered as outputs that will contribute to the awareness of the scouts after the workshops about the environment, wetlands, endangered birds in wetlands and what needs to be done to protect these places.

In addition to all these by pretending to be a bird, the scouts learned how the birds look from above, the descending movement of birds to feed in wetlands, how their life is at risk due to a chewing gum sticking to their beaks, learning through imitations, while developing different perspectives, they also learned to develop their empathy skills. Again, while seeing themselves as drops of water, becoming clouds and making it rain, they added critical thinking skills to their empathy skills while thinking about those in need.

During the activities, they also learned to express their feelings, that there is more than one truth, and to respect the ideas and existence of others. In addition, they learned the importance of water and the importance of the environment not only by listening, but also by experiencing case studies, by taking part in the scene themselves, and by internalizing the real-life relationship of what they learned, they achieved full learning.

CONCLUSION AND RECOMMENDATIONS

In this research, when the quality of the outputs is examined, it is seen that drama activities affect the creativity of the scouts significantly. The slogans, songs, applause and shouts that the scouts created during the drama workshops are the most effective evidence to support the findings. Scouts were included in the learning processes and were able to express themselves by including all their emotions in the processes, by doing, experiencing, having fun and expressing themselves freely, with the roles they took in the processes, in imaginary places with drama activities. While expressing themselves, they were not just spectators to the learning processes, they were able to internalize learning much more easily by participating in person. When the pre and post tests were evaluated, it was revealed that the scouts knew the environment better, gained environmental awareness, were more sensitive to the environment and natural riches, and what was learned was more permanent thanks to the drama activities.

Ömer Adı Güzel stated that Drama provides many benefits to the person and listed only some of **the benefits of Drama as follows:**

- ♣ Since it provides physical activity, it also has an effect on physical development.
- ♣ In addition, it provides support for a more effective verbal expression while providing the ability to use body language,

♣ Develops self-expression skills.
♣ Helps to eliminate shyness and stillness
♣ Develops the four basic skills of speaking, reading, writing and reading and strengthens healthy communication
♣ Develops imagination and creativity
♣ Provides the habit of using creativity in a versatile way
♣ Improves emotional intelligence
♣ Enables to realize teamwork and cooperation, the differences of group and individual work.
♣ Improves sensitivity
♣ Provides self-control skills
♣ Develops problem solving skills.

Considering the benefits mentioned above, it was seen that the scouts achieved similar gains in Drama Workshops. However, it was determined that the scout leaders believe in the benefits of using Drama in scouting activities, and they want to receive training to improve themselves in this regard. These findings emerge as another result of the study.

SUGGESTIONS

More drama should be included in scouting activities. Particular attention should be paid to the expansion of drama activities among scouting activities in order to support the physical, mental, cognitive and social development of scouts.

Scout leaders should receive training on DRAMA in order to apply drama activities more effectively in scouting activities.

Drama plans should be prepared and archived as material on environment, our cultural heritage, our values and similar topics.

In-service training on the place of Drama in Education should be given to teachers in order to include drama as a method in educational processes, not only in scouting activities but also in classroom activities.

Drama should be included in school programs as an educational branch activity in our primary schools in order to spread it.

REFERENCES

Acun.s&Gülay.B (1992) Çocuk Gelişimi, İstanbul: Esin Yayıncılık

Adıgüzel. Ö.(2002) Eğitimde Yartıcı Drama. Ankara, Natürel Yayıncılık

Aris, C John (1995) Taking Time to Act a Gide to Cross. Curricular Drama . New Hampshire: Heizemann Porstmouth

Başaran, A. & Bozkurt, E. (2003) Türk Milli Eğitim Teftiş SistemindeYapılanma Sorunu, Ankara: TEMSEN Yayınları.

Başaran, İ. E. (1994) Eğitim Yönetimi, Ankara: Kadıoğlu Matbaası.

Çağdaş.a & Diğerleri (2003) Okul Öncesi Eğitimde4 Dramatik Etkinlikler, Konya:Eğitim Kitapevi Gazi Üniversitesi, Ankara.

Hatipoğlu, Y.Y. (2006) İlköğretim beşinci sınıf ders konularının öğretiminde Drama Yönteminin öğrenci başarısına etkisi, Yüksek Lisand Tezi

İşpiroğlu.n. (1994) Eğitimde Sanat , İstanbul: Demet Yayıncılık

Karadağ &Çalışkan.(2005) İlköğretim Birinci Kademesi Öğrencilerinin Drama Yöntemine Karşı Tutumlarının Değerlendirilmesi

Karakaya. K. (2007) İlköğretimde Drama ve Örnek Bir Uygulama, GÜ, Gazi Eğitim Fakültesi Dergi, cilt 27, sayı (2007) 103-139

Kocabey Meral, Eğitimde Drama

Meb (1999) İlköğeretinde Drama . Ankara :I Milli Eğitim Yayınevi

Okvuran. A. (1995) Çağdaş İnsanı Yaratmada, Yaraqtıcı Drama Eğitiminin Önemi ve Empatik Eğilim Düzeylerine Etkisi, Ankara Üniversitesi, Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi, c,ilt 27 (sayı1) 185-194

Poyraz,H (1999).Okul öncesi dönemde oyun ve oyuncak.Ankara:Anı Yayıncılık

San. İ. (1992) Eğitsel Drama, Ankara: Assity Yayınları

San. İ. (2011) Uluslararsı Eğitimde Yaratıcı Drama Sempozyumunda açılış konuşmasıİstanbul Üniversitesi, Hasan Ali Yücel Eğitim Fakültesi . İstanbul

San.İ (1991) Eğitimde Drama , TED ilkokulu Öğretmenlerine yönelik eğitimde, Açılış Konuşması

Slade. P. (1971) Child Drama. University of London .London

Su, K. (1974) Türk Eğitim Sisteminde Teftişin Yeri ve Önemi,İstanbul: Milli Eğitim

Topdal. (2012) Eğitimde Drama, Atatürk Öğretmen Akademisi . KKTC

THE BENEFITS AND DISADVANTAGES OF DIVERSITY MANAGEMENT IN EDUCATION

Elif ASVAROĞLU
North Cyprus Ministry of National Education and Culture Deputy School Administrator
elifasvaroglu1@gmail.com
https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1165-5072

Fahri ASVAROĞLU
Northern Cyprus Ministry of Economy and Energy
fahrinevzatasvaroglu@gmail.com,
https://orcid.org/0000-0002-8706-6701

ABSTRACT
An organization consists of individuals that differ in many characteristics. Difference, different identities, backgrounds, experience, faith, age, gender, race, ethnicity, nationality, people with a marital status in religion, class, business experience, physical talent quality, education or any group, community or organization. a mix of features such as political and economic relations. The global migration rate has increased with globalization and has affected these direct education systems and made schools need to manage diversity. This research aims to reveal the advantages and disadvantages of diversity management in education. In line with the research purpose, the document analysis method was applied. After determining the research keywords, a literature review was conducted. As a result of the research, it has been revealed that the necessity of diversity management in schools and the need to inform the administrators and teachers about the emerging disadvantages and to organize in-service trainings.
Keywords: diversity, diversity management, education

Introduction

Demographic changes in globalized organizations, competition pressures, laws and lawsuits, the rise of multinational companies, the introduction of disabled people and women into business life, and the management of cultural differences caused by migration.

Globalization and competition, increasing international and regional integration, changing socio-demographic conditions, the desire of people to participate in management mechanisms compared to the past, the need for a more democratic management increase the differences between employees and customers (Kamaşak and Yücelen, 2007). To understand and be aware of the ever-increasing differences, to evaluate and manage these differences according to the objectives of the institution and organization and to present them to the organization as a necessity. This has led organizations to adopt new management methods. One of the approaches that have emerged since the 1990s in response to the re-management quests of organizations in these changing conditions is diversity management.

In fact, it is human nature for people to be discriminated against on the basis of age, sex, race, creed and economic level. For this reason, differences emerge, a phenomenon that needs to be managed. This is more common in organizational contexts. Discrimination, which is one of the most serious problems in educational institutions, is accepted as an issue that needs to be addressed in the organizational context and its impact on student success.

The differences were divided into three groups as controlled, uncontrolled and partially controlled. Uncontrollable differences are innate; (i) race, (ii) gender, (iii) disability. Partially controlled differences are later on; (i) language, (ii) religion, (iii) education, (iv) culture, (v) income. Controllable differences are (i) lifestyle preferences, (ii) addictions, (iii) clothing and (iv) physical appearance (Barutçugil, 2010). For this reason, it is important for managers to have knowledge of what organizational differences might be and to have the ability to manage differences. Creating an environment of peace and trust in social environments where differences are accepted as richness is related to tolerance of individuals to each other (Khitruk & Ulinova, 2012).

Diversity Management

Differences can have different meanings in people's minds. Some definitions of what is and what is not difference are as follows: Montes and Shaw (2003) stated that difference may be related to many factors such as culture, race and religion, and referred to the possibility that these differences may cause various problems. Some definitions have interpreted difference as "internal", that is, as an invisible, intangible concept, because over time it has been understood that difference is not just a matter of race or culture.

The idea of respecting these differences is important, as well as managing differences based on leveraging the performance of all employees at the top of the organization. According to Memduhoğlu (2007), diversity management is a concept that is considered new in management science, stems from the acceptance of individual differences and the evaluation of personal characteristics and differences, except that there is no discrimination between any person or group in an organization.

Management differences should not only be evaluated on an organizational and employee basis, but are also important for our internal contribution. Argüden (2007) believes that increasing our knowledge of diversity management will not only enable us to become better leaders in our own organizations, but also enable us to better understand ourselves and become more mature individuals by harnessing the richness of diversity.

According to Ahonen and Tienari (2009), "management of diversity" has become a problem in global economic organizations. As can be seen, there is a consensus among researchers about the importance of differences. As Sürgevil (2010) stated, research on diversity management has started to gain importance in the countries of the world after the United States, both as an administrative and application area. The reason why it is an academic research discipline and applied worldwide; The changes in the way of doing business with the effect of globalization, the changing demographic structure of societies and organizations, various social changes and developments, have caused the spread and increase of other reasons of commercial marriages. Also; the increasing importance of women in business life, the differentiation of young and old employees' ways of doing business, the integration of physically and mentally disabled people into business life, cultural differences caused by migration waves caused by industrialization and similar differences are increasingly important issues related to differences in working life.

The primary goal of good diversity management is to provide a positive environment for all employees. But in order to create a cohesive work environment, it is important for managers to know how managers define employee differences and how similar definitions provided by staff are. Consistent with DeMeuse and Hostager's (2001) classification, Kreitner ve Kinicki (2001) also points out that managed differences have the following aspects:
  • Personality: Characteristics that form an individual's identity.
  • Internal Dimensions: These are the characteristics of the individual that include behavior, attitude, expectations and perceptions from other people. It consists of topics such as age, gender, physical ability, sexual preference.
  • External Dimensions: These are personality traits that we can change and have a little control over. It includes features such as religion, education, marital status, place of residence, monthly income.
  • Organizational Dimensions: includes dimensions such as workspace, unit, seniority, title, management status and was added to existing dimensions by DeMeuse and Hostager (2001).

Today, the globalization of the world, the competition of countries in production and trade, cultural differences due to migration, population evolution, organizations, the formation of organizations from different nations, the existence of rules with certain sanctions, the management of the emerging differences, the participation of disabled people and women in working life, their demand gains importance (Atasoy, 2012). Diversity management; It is expressed as the vision of a manager who aims to gain an advantage over the rivals of an organization by respecting the differences among the members of the organization, valuing their importance and providing opportunities, increasing employee productivity, respecting the differences among the members of the organization, increasing employee productivity (Inegbedion, Sunday, Asaleye, Lawal & Adebanji, 2020). In addition to respecting the diversity of the employees in the organization, the manager should see diversity as diversity and see it as an added wealth to the organization (Demirel & Özbezek, 2016). There is a culture of respect for diversity at every stage of an organization's management system; It has been determined that perceiving, valuing and accepting the same or different qualities of individuals increases employee performance (Khan, Saengon, Charoenpoom, Soonthornpipit, & Chongcharoen, 2021).

Diversity Management Benefits and Disadvantages
Diversity is one of the steps of creativity. Innovation is fed from environments where different ideas are fed and every innovation requires creativity. As in every organization, good management of diversity in educational organizations and thus turning it into an advantage is especially important for schools, which consist of a small-scale map of the society. In an educational environment where people are excluded and devalued because of their differences, teachers and the students they influence will be far from getting the expected efficiency. According to Bergen, Soper, and Foster (2002), expectations from differences in every organization, regardless of the type, can be generalized as follows:
  • More intense relations between employees,

• Sensitivity to social and demographic changes,
• Less recourse to legal remedies, faster resolution of problems,
• An environment where justice and equality are felt,
• Greater success in difficult tasks,
• More gain with higher performance.

Although diversity is a concept that causes excitement when first heard and includes innovation in its definition, it is possible to talk about the undesirable situations it brings to the business environment when it is not well managed or misinterpreted. Managers who want to seize the competitive advantage, especially in profit-oriented organizations, are left with a paradox in terms of difference. When they welcome diversity, they will allow intra-organizational conflict; when they stay away from difference, they will have to risk losing their competitive advantage (Bassett-Jones, 2005).

Some of the problems related to difference cited by Sürgevil (2010) are as follows:
• Managerial complexity: It is obvious that there will be less conflict in a group of like-minded individuals and it will be easier to manage this group. Because in this way, there is no need to change the management style or try different styles.
• Justice: The sense of justice may be defined differently in every individual and in every culture. Some groups may need to be protected in the workplace, and this may reduce other employees' sense of justice and their trust in management.
• Similarities versus individual differences: Individuals prefer to work with people who are similar to themselves instead of meeting with people who are different from themselves. Teams formed by the same people all the time can cause grouping and problems in the workplace.
• Identity and commitment: Individuals work more comfortably with people whom they do not need to re-introduce or explain. Commitment will increase when there is no concern about being accepted by individuals with different values and beliefs.

Management of Diversity in Education

Schools, one of the educational organizations, will provide many benefits if they successfully manage differences in a principled and effective way. These benefits will be seen by administrators, students, teachers and other staff at all levels of society. Important areas with different experiences and perspectives will be created among these mentioned participants. It is also expected that some benefits such as interpersonal efficiency, flexibility and sociocultural exchange will be realized. Since administrators, teachers and students who see these benefits see it as a wealth; it is gained in the process of creating a culture at school or adopting this culture as a lifestyle. When students graduate, they continue this experience they have gained in the later areas of their lives as a natural part of their lives (Balyer & Gündüz, 2010).

When evaluated in terms of school management, educators are faced with inequalities at increasing rates. First of all, the school, where people with many characteristics come together, is a model place for mutual respect, harmony and tolerance (DEET, 2001). If educators want students to be successful in this growing and globalizing age of multiculturalism and diversity, they must prepare them accordingly. Because this situation can also determine their ability to find a job in the future (Wentling, 2001). While evaluating this issue, Gary (1994) mentioned the important effects of multicultural management in schools on school activities such as staff, curriculum, programs, examination, pedagogy, disciplinary policy, students, parents. Therefore, successfully managing diversity in educational institutions offers significant benefits to teachers, students, administrators and society in general. This primarily creates a living space surrounded by different experiences and perspectives. In addition, effective cultural exchange can provide valuable experiences of flexibility and creativity. Administrators, teachers and students who adopt this culture as a way of life at school may continue to see this as a blessing. For this reason, students who are inspired by this school organizational structure accept the different conditions they are in in their later experiences as a part of natural life.

It can be said that the advantages and disadvantages brought by the differences in professional life will also be valid in schools. In addition to physical and emotional characteristics, the school environment in which teachers from different ethnic origins, beliefs, ideologies, lifestyles, education and economic levels work can cause conflict and create harmony. It is the leadership attitude or administrative policies and practices of school administrators that will provide balance and effectiveness. In this respect, it is important to know whether schools are run effectively and successfully as an institution.

The same is true for the staff, students, parents and other educational actors in the school, which is a social institution. In this context, it is important for school principals to accept that multicultural life is inevitable and to adopt the view that diversity can enrich an organization rather than considering differences as a problem

(Tozkoparan ve Vatansever, 2011). Part of the duty of the administrator is to ensure that teachers, other staff, students and parents are free and respectful to school cultures, values and beliefs (Sürgevil & Budak, 2008; Kaya & Aydın, 2014; Öncer, 2004; Yazıcı, Başol & Toprak, 2009). Dealing with different people in the school with tolerance and respect creates a democratic organizational environment and provides opportunities for employees to showcase their performance (Memduhoğlu, 2007). The school has an open organizational structure that allows teachers to evaluate and implement different ideas, enable teachers to share new experiences, enrich knowledge and contribute to the development of the school (Genç, 2017). For this reason, when differences are managed effectively, the desired success is achieved in achieving organizational goals (Memduhoğlu & Ayyürek, 2014).

Conclusion and Recommendations

Theoretically, differences play a distinctive role, while organizational culture plays a role of unity and harmony. In this context, creating synergy by harmonizing or harmonizing differences in an organization consisting of employees with different cultural backgrounds (language, religion, ethnicity, etc.) requires high coordination and efficiency in management. For this, it is necessary to first analyze the cultural potential of the organization (cultural diagnosis), then develop various strategies. Creating and maintaining an organizational culture compatible with the chosen strategy is another important point. In this context, it is believed that the social and solidarity community organizational culture mentioned in the theory will be more effective in managing differences.

There may be conflicts within the organization due to differences. It is important to create an organizational culture that will create added value for the team and/or individuals by minimizing this conflict environment. In order to create an organizational culture that respects diversity sees diversity as wealth, and values diversity in line with organizational goals, a continuous mental transformation should be ensured and personal managers and teachers should be given periodic training on diversity management.

REFERENCES

Ahonen, P., Tienari J. (2009, September). United in Diversity? Disciplinary Normalization in an EU Project. *Organization*. 16(5), 655-679.

Argüden, Y. (2007, Eylül). Dünya Vatandaşlığı ve Farklılıkların Yönetimi. *Önce Kalite Dergisi*. 22.

Atasoy, Z. (2012). *Üniversite öğrencilerinin ayrımcılık algısının öğrenci başarı düzeyine etkisi üzerine bir araştırma*. (Yayımlanmamış yüksek lisans tezi). Karamanoğlu Mehmetbey Üniversitesi, Karaman.

Balyer, A. ve Gündüz, Y. (2010). Yönetici ve öğretmenlerin okullarında farklılıkların yönetimine ilişkin algılarının incelenmesi. *M.Ü. Atatürk Eğitim Fakültesi Eğitim Bilimleri Dergisi*, 32, 25-43.

Barutçugil, İ. (2004). *Stratejik İnsan Kaynakları Yönetimi*, İstanbul: Kariyer Yayınları

Bassett-Jones, N. (2005). The Paradox of Diversity Management. *Creativity and Innovation*. 14 (2) 276-299.

Bergen,C.W. Von, Soper, B., Foster, T. (2002). Unintended Negative Effects of Diversity Management, *Public Personnel Management*. 31 (2) 36-47.

DeMeuse, K. ve Hostager, T. (2001). Developing an Instrument for Measuring Attitudes Toward and Perceptions of Workplace Diversity: An Initial Report. *Human Resources Management Quarterly*, 12 (1) 33-51.

Demirel, Y., ve Özbezek, B. D. (2016). Örgütlerde zenginliğin kaynağı olarak farklılıkların yönetimi: Kavramsal bir inceleme. *Çankırı Karatekin Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi,* 7(1), 1-28.

Department of Education, Employment and Training (DEET. (2001). Guidelines for managing cultural and linguistic diversity in schools, Melbourne. http://www.eduweb.vic.gov.au/edulibrary/public/teachlearn/student /lem/GuidelinesforSchools.pdf.

Gary, B., (1994). Varieties of multicultural education: An introduction. *ERIC Digests*, 98, 1-3.

Inegbedion, H., Sunday, E., Asaleye, A., Lawal, A., & Adebanji, A. (2020). Managing diversity for organizational efficiency. *SAGE Open*, 10(1), 2158244019900173.

Kamaşak, R ve Yücelen, M. (2007). İşgücündeki farklılıkların yönetimi. Beliz Dereli (Ed.), *Farklılıkların etkin yönetimi: Çalışanların farklılık algısı ve ampirikbir çalışma*.(ss. 31- 57). İstanbul: Beta Basım A.Ş.

Kaya, I. ve Aydın, H. (2014). *Çoğulculuk, çokkültürlü ve çokdilli eğitim*. Ankara: Anı Yayınları.

Khan, M. S., Saengon, P., Charoenpoom, S., Soonthornpipit, H., & Chongcharoen, D. (2021). The impact of organizational learning culture, workforce diversity and knowledge management on innovation and organization performance: A structural equation modeling approach. *Human Systems Management*, (Preprint), 1-13.

Khitruk, V. & Ulianova, O. (2012). Inclusive tolerance as a basis of professional competence of prospective teachers. *Problems of Education 21st. Century*, (43), 21-32.

Kreitner, R.,ve Kinicki, A. (2001). Organizational behavior. Boston: Irwin/McGrawHill

Memduhoğlu, H. B. ve Ayyürek, O. (2014). Öğretmenlerin ve okul yöneticilerinin görüşlerine göre anaokullarında farklılıkların yönetimi. *Eğitim Bilimleri Araştırmaları Dergisi,* 4(1), 175-188.

Memduhoğlu, H.B (2007). *Yönetici Ve Öğretmen Görüşlerine Göre Türkiye'de Kamu Liselerinde Farklılıkların Yönetimi*, Ankara Üniversitesi Eğitim Bilimleri Enstitüsü Doktora Tezi, Ankara.

Montes, T.,Shaw, G. (2003). *The future of workplace diversity in the new millenium. Individual Diversity and Psychology in Organisations*, John Wiley and Sons: West Sussex.

Öncer, A. Z. (2004). *İşletmelerde bireysel, örgütsel, yönetsel farklılık kaynakları ve farklılaşma stratejileri: Unilever Unity Projesi kapsamında bir araştırma*. (Yayımlanmamış doktora tezi). Marmara Üniversitesi, İstanbul.

Sürgevil, O. (2010). *Çalışma Yaşamında Farklılıkların Yönetimi*. Ankara: Nobel.

Sürgevil, O., ve Budak, G. (2008). İşletmelerin farklılıkların yönetimi anlayışına yaklaşım tarzlarının saptanmasına yönelik bir araştırma. *Dokuz Eylül Üniversitesi Sosyal Bilimler Enstitüsü Dergisi*, 10(4), 65-96.

Tozkoparan, G. ve Vatansever, Ç. (2011). Farklılıkların yönetimi: İnsan kaynakları yöneticilerinin farklılık algısı üzerine bir odak grup çalışması. *Akdeniz İ.İ.B.F. Dergisi*, 21, 89-109.

Wentling, R.M., (2001). Diversity at work force, The highlight zone. *Research&Work,* 4, 1-10.

Yazıcı S, Başol G, Toprak G (2009). Öğretmenlerin çok kültürlü eğitim, tutumları: Bir güvenirlik ve geçerlik çalışması. *H. Ü. Eğitim Fakültesi Dergisi*, 37, 229-242.